

**EFFECTS OF THINNING ON FOREST STRUCTURE AND
COMPOSITION IN THE WUNGONG CATCHMENT,
WESTERN AUSTRALIA**

**EFFECTS OF THINNING ON FOREST STRUCTURE AND
COMPOSITION IN THE WUNGONG CATCHMENT, WESTERN
AUSTRALIA**

Sita Ram Panta

B. Sc. (Agriculture) Tribhuvan University, Rampur, Chitwan, Nepal

This thesis is presented for the degree of

Master of Philosophy

Of

Murdoch University, Western Australia

School of Environmental Science

Faculty of Science and Engineering

Murdoch University

2012

Declaration

I declare that this thesis is my own account of my research and contains as its main content work which has not previously been submitted for a degree at any tertiary educational institution.

.....

Sita Ram Panta

Abstract

The focus of jarrah (*Eucalyptus marginata* Donn ex. Smith) forest management in past decades has been changing in response to forest management practices of the day, interests and needs of the forest users and more recently a changing climate. Following uncontrolled logging including clear-felling and wild-fires after European settlement (1830s onwards) and rotational logging and burning under the state forest management plan, much of the old-growth forest of south-west Western Australia has been converted into a dense re-growth forest. Substantial reduction in the rainfall in the south-west of Western Australia in the past three decades has resulted in a significant decrease in water available to the Integrated Water Supply Scheme at a time of increasing water demand of the region. A forest thinning trial to increase both water yield and environmental benefits from the catchment has been implemented since 2006 in the Wungong Catchment within state forest. Wungong forest is now managed by the Water Corporation as a drinking water catchment in association with the Department of Environment and Conservation (DEC) and Forest Product Commission (FPC); and is under the scrutiny of Environmental Protection Authority (EPA) of Western Australia. Although the effects of forest thinning on catchment hydrology are well understood, short-term effects of thinning on forest ecosystems especially on forest structure and composition are less well understood. The research reported in this thesis contributes to understanding the short-term effects of thinning on stand structure and on the composition of overstorey and understorey components of the forest, including the dead woody debris (DWD).

Two thinning strategies, i.e., commercial logging followed by glyphosate herbicide treatment of selected non-commercial trees (log+notch) or killing of selected trees by applying glyphosate herbicide to notches in the trunk (notch-only), were compared as treatments to the adjacent unthinned stands (control) in the Wungong Catchment within jarrah forest of south-

west Western Australia. All three treatments were replicated three times using plots of 90 x 70 m size. Thinning, which was carried out in September, 2009, reduced tree basal area from 50.2 to 17.9 m² ha⁻¹ for log+notch and 43.8 to 22.2 m² ha⁻¹ for notch-only treatment.

Forest structure variables were investigated in relation to thinning *viz*: stand density and basal area for three dominant tree species and their composition in the overstorey; understorey species richness and ground cover; and quantity, structure and composition of DWD.

This study revealed that both log+notch and notch-only thinning treatments significantly reduced the overall stand density and basal area and changed the composition of the treated tree stands compared to the unthinned stands. Frequency distributions of the tree stands in different size classes were altered with highly significant decreases in 20-30 and 30-40 cm diameter at breast height (DBH) classes. By contrast, no significant effect was observed in the understorey species richness and ground cover within 1 year after thinning, partly due to the absence of direct physical disturbance in the sampled quadrats. However, there was a slight reduction in thinned as well as control forest in the species richness recorded during the hot and dry season compared to the winter sampling. Results suggest that selection of sampling units representing different micro-site conditions within the study area are important and the sampling area needs to be increased to 64 m² (16 lots of 2x2 m quadrats) to adequately represent species richness present in the study area.

Thinning increased the quantity of DWD by 100 % in log+notch and 142 % in notch-only treatments. Thinning also changed the structure and composition of DWD components (i.e. log, snag and stump) by altering the percentage contribution of each component to the total DWD pool. Thinning altered the percentage contribution of log, snag and stump components to the total DWD volume from 80, 17 and 3 % before thinning to 48, 50 and 2 %, respectively, for log+notch treatment after 1 year, and from 86, 11 and 2 % to 36, 63 and 1 %, respectively, for notch-only treatment after 1 year.

respectively, for notch-only treatments. Changes in the structure of the dead woody resources after thinning revealed that the amount, structure and composition of DWD in the forested catchment was directly related to stand age and structure of the living trees and more specifically to the method and intensity of forest thinning.

In summary, this study suggests that thinning as a management intervention is an important driver of the structure and composition dynamics of jarrah forest ecosystems. The level of reduction in the stand density and basal area of the tree stand and increase in the amount of DWD as compared to the adjacent control stands were dependent on the methods and intensity of thinning. Although the effects of thinning on overstorey components such as species composition, stand density and diameter size-class distribution of tree stands, and on DWD components were significant, effects on understorey species richness and ground cover were not discernable in the short-term. Hence, longer term study of post-thinning vegetation structure and composition are needed to adequately describe thinning impacts on post-thinning vegetation dynamics and successional processes.

Table of contents

Declaration.....	i
Abstract.....	ii
Table of contents.....	v
List of Figures.....	ix
List of Tables.....	xiii
Abbreviations and Symbols.....	xv
Acknowledgements.....	xvii
Dedication.....	xviii
Chapter 1: Introduction.....	1
1.1 The Jarrah forest.....	1
1.2 Research background.....	3
1.3 Research issues and questions.....	5
1.4 Thesis aims and objectives.....	6
Chapter 2: Review of literature.....	8
2.1 Thinning effects on stand structure and composition.....	13
2.2 Understorey vegetation response to thinning.....	14
2.3 Extent, structure and composition of dead woody debris in relation to thinning.....	18
2.4 Conclusion.....	19
Chapter 3: Thinning effects on stand structure and composition.....	21
3.1 Introduction.....	21

3.2 Materials, methods and study area	26
3.2.1 Research site location and description	26
3.2.2 Previous catchment management environment	29
3.2.3 Research design and thinning intensity	30
3.2.4 Sampling methods	34
3.2.4.1 Tree census in the study plots	34
3.2.5 Data analysis.....	37
3.2.5.1 Tree species composition.....	37
3.2.5.2 Forest structure.....	38
3.2.5.3 Statistical analyses	39
3.3 Results	40
3.3.1 Forest structure and composition.....	40
3.3.1.1 Stand density and basal area composition by tree species.....	40
3.3.1.2 Stand density and basal area composition by diameter size class	45
3.3.1.3 Quadratic mean diameter (QMD)	46
3.3.1.4 Stand structure by height strata.....	47
3.3.2 Understorey species richness and ground cover.....	49
3.3.2.1 Understorey species richness	49
3.3.2.2 Understorey ground cover.....	52
3.4 Discussion	56

3.4.1 Forest structure and composition.....	56
3.4.1.1 Stand density and basal area composition by tree species.....	57
3.4.1.2 Stand density and basal area composition by diameter size class	58
3.4.1.3 Quadratic mean diameter (QMD).....	59
3.4.1.4 Stand structure by height strata.....	60
3.4.2 Understorey species richness and ground cover.....	61
3.4.2.1 Understorey species richness	61
3.4.2.2 Understorey species richness	64
3.5 Conclusion.....	67
Chapter 4: Dead woody debris resources in relation to thinning.....	68
4.1 Introduction.....	68
4.2 Materials and methods	71
4.2.1 Study area and previous catchment management environment.....	71
4.2.2 Sampling design	71
4.2.3 Measuring DWD	72
4.2.4 Decay stage.....	72
4.2.5 Volume and mass calculation.....	75
4.2.6 Statistical analyses.....	76
4.3 Results.....	76
4.3.1 Extent and composition of DWD	77

4.3.2 Composition of DWD volume by wood type.....	78
4.3.3 Structural composition of DWD volume by diameter size class.....	80
4.3.4 DWD volume composition by decay class.....	80
4.4 Discussion	82
4.4.1 Extent and composition of DWD	82
4.4.2 Composition of DWD volume by wood type.....	84
4.4.3 Composition of DWD volume by diameter size class.....	86
4.4.4 Composition of DWD volume by decay class	87
4.5 Conclusion.....	89
Chapter 5: General discussion	91
Bibliography	99

List of Figures

Figure 1 Location of Wungong Catchment near Perth, Western Australia.	27
Figure 2 Site location of the research plot in the Vardi Road sub-catchment, Western Australia.	31
Figure 3 Study plot design with planned snig track for log removal (solid line). UQ = understorey study quadrats (2×2 m), TA = log+notch treatment (orange colour), TB = notch-only treatment (yellow colour) and TC = control treatment (white colour) (90×70 m).	32
Figure 4 Trees were marked before thinning of the research plots. Trees marked with yellow stripe on trunk were proposed for logging (a), trees marked with white stripe as potential crop tree (b), trees marked with letter H as habitat tree (c) and all the trees without any marking were proposed for notching (d).	33
Figure 5 Details of thinning methods- logging by chain-saw (left) and stem injection of glyphosate by making notch in the trunk (right).	35
Figure 6 Pre-and post-thinning mean stand density (stem ha ⁻¹) for trees with DBH ≥ 10 cm for three treatments. Values are means of three replicates. Vertical bars indicate standard errors. See Table 3 for significance of pre-thinning differences and treatment effects.	41
Figure 7 Pre-and post-thinning mean basal area (m ² ha ⁻¹) for trees with DBH ≥ 10 cm for three treatments. Values are means of three replicates. Vertical bars indicate standard errors. See Table 3 for significance of pre-thinning differences and treatment effects.	43
Figure 8 Pre-and post-thinning mean stand density by tree species (stem ha ⁻¹) for trees with DBH ≥ 10 cm for three treatments. Values are means of three replicates. Vertical bars	

indicate standard errors. See Table 3 for significance of pre-thinning differences and treatment effects.....	43
Figure 9 Pre-and post-thinning mean basal area by tree species ($\text{m}^2 \text{ha}^{-1}$) for trees with DBH \geq 10 cm for three treatments. Values are means of three replicates. Vertical bars indicate standard errors. See Table 3 for significance of pre-thinning differences and treatment effects.....	44
Figure 10 Pre-and post-thinning stand composition (as a % of all trees) for trees with DBH \geq 10 cm for three treatments. Values are means of three replicates.....	44
Figure 11 Pre-and post-thinning mean stand density by diameter size class for trees with DBH \geq 10 cm for three treatments. Values are means of three replicates. Vertical bars indicate standard errors. See Table 3 for significance of pre-thinning differences and treatment effects.....	46
Figure 12 Pre- and post-thinning mean basal area for trees with DBH \geq 10 cm for three treatments. Values are means of three replicates. Vertical bars indicate standard errors. See Table 3 for significance of pre-thinning differences and treatment effects.	46
Figure 13 Pre- and post-thinning mean quadratic mean diameter for trees with DBH \geq 10 cm for three treatments. Values are means of three replicates. Vertical bars indicate standard errors. See Table 3 for significance of pre-thinning differences and treatment effects.....	47
Figure 14 Pre-and post-thinning mean stand density by height strata for trees with DBH \geq 10 cm for three treatments. Values are means of three replicates. Vertical bars indicate standard errors. See Table 3 for significance of pre-thinning differences and treatment effects. Understorey = < 10 m, mid-storey = 10-20 m and upperstorey = \geq 20 m in height.....	48

Figure 15 Mean tree height for pre- and post-thin tree stands by height strata. Values are the means of nine plots. Vertical bars indicate standard errors. See Table 3 for significance of pre-thinning differences and treatment effects. Understory = < 10 m, mid-story = 10-20 m and upperstory = \geq 20 m in height.....	48
Figure 16 Relationship between DBH (cm) and tree height (m) for the whole study block at Vardi Road sub-catchment in the jarrah forest, Western Australia. Habitat trees were excluded in the sampling.....	49
Figure 17 Species richness recorded at individual quadrats in log+notch (a), control (b) and notch-only treatment (c) from Aug. 2009 to Sept. 2010. Vertical axis indicates the number of species recorded.....	53
Figure 18 Species-area plot showing the relationship between cumulative area of the sampling quadrats and the cumulative understorey species richness. Vertical axis indicates the number of species recorded.....	54
Figure 19 Understorey ground cover (%) assessed at individual quadrats in log+notch (a), control (b) and notch-only treatment (c) from Aug. 2009 to Sept. 2010.	56
Figure 20 Log decomposition examples (see Table 7 for full descriptions of classes).	74
Figure 21 Snag decomposition classes (see Table 8 for full descriptions of classes).....	75
Figure 22 Pre- and post-thinning mean dead woody debris (DWD) volume ($\text{m}^3 \text{ha}^{-1}$) for three thinning treatments. Values are means of 3 replicates. Vertical bars indicate standard errors. See Table 9 for significance of treatment differences.	78
Figure 23 Mean dead woody debris (DWD) volume ($\text{m}^3 \text{ha}^{-1}$) by wood types for three different thinning treatments. Values are means of 3 replicates. Vertical bars indicate standard errors. See Table 9 for significance of treatment differences.....	79
Figure 24 Proportion of total dead woody debris (DWD) volumes (%) by wood type. Proportions are means from three replicates.....	79

Figure 25 Mean DWD volume ($\text{m}^3 \text{ha}^{-1}$) by diameter size class for three thinning treatments. Values are means of three replicates. Vertical bars indicate standard errors. See Table 9 for significance of treatment differences.....81

Figure 26 Mean DWD volume ($\text{m}^3 \text{ha}^{-1}$) by decay class for three thinning treatments. Values are means of three replicates. Vertical bars indicate standard errors. See Table 7 for the description of decay classes. See Table 9 for significance of treatment differences.81

Figure 27 Proportion of total DWD volumes (%) by decay class. Proportions are means from three replicates. See Table 7 for the description of decay classes.82

List of Tables

Table 1 Basal area (BA, m ² ha ⁻¹) measured for trees marked as Cull, Crop, Habitat, and Research trees in each plot of the Murdoch Research block at Vardi Road sub-catchment. The planned BA reduction is indicated by the difference between total BA (All trees) and BA of all retained trees. NA = not applicable. See also Table 2 for actual BA reduction.	36
Table 2 Actual thinning intensity (in m ² ha ⁻¹ and as a % of pre-thin BA) measured for the trees after implementation of thinning treatment in each plot of the Murdoch Research block at Vardi Road sub-catchment. The actual BA reduction is indicated by the difference between total BA and BA of all retained trees. NA = not applicable.....	37
Table 3 Significance levels for analysis of variance with various attributes as the dependent variable at treatment level for stand structural parameters from the dry eucalypt forest of south-western Australia. Pre-treatment values were tested in the model as a co-variate. Where the treatment effect was significant (p < 0.05) the Bonferroni test was used for mean separation.....	42
Table 4 Understorey plant species recorded during field sampling in the study quadrats in the jarrah forest, Western Australia. Plant species name followed by asterisk (*) are the most common plant species recorded in more than 61 % of the quadrats sampled.....	50
Table 5 Summary of average species richness for three thinning treatment groups between August 2009 (pre-thinning) and September 2010. Values are means of six quadrats in each of three replicate plots. Note: August 2009 was pre-thinning, while the December 2009 to September 2010 measurements represent post-thinning data. Differences in average species richness were not significant among measurement periods.....	52

Table 6 Summary of average ground cover for three thinning treatment groups. Values are means of six quadrats in each of three replicate plots. Note: August 2009 was pre-thinning and rest of others is post-thinning data.	55
Table 7 Characteristics of wood in five decay classes used for determining state of decay of forest floor logs and stumps based on Pyle and Brown (1999), Spetich et al. (1999) and USDA (2001).	73
Table 8 Characteristics of wood in five decay classes used for determining state of decay of standing dead trees based on Thomas et al. (1979) and Sollins et al. (1987).	74
Table 9 Significance levels for ANOVA with various attributes of dead woody debris (DWD) as the dependent variable at treatment level (L-log+notch, N- notch-only and C-control) for the dry eucalypt forest of south-west Western Australia. Pre-treatment values were used as a co-variate.	77
Table 10 Dry weight density of dead woody debris samples (g cm^{-3}) from the dry sclerophyll forest of the south-west Western Australia by stage of decay class (see Table 7 for differences among decay classes). Samples were collected from Wungong catchment.	78

Abbreviations and Symbols

DEC	Department of Environment and Conservation
DWD	Dead Woody Debris
CWD	Coarse Woody Debris
FPC	Forest Products Commission
CALM	Conservation and Land Management
CC	Conservation Commission
EPA	Environmental Protection Authority
FDWA	Forest Department of Western Australia
WA	Western Australia
USA	United States of America
USDA	United States Department of Agriculture
DBH	diameter at breast height (1.37 m)
TDM	total dry mass
BA	basal area
LAI	leaf area index
NA	not applicable
ha	hectare

mm	millimetre
cm	centimetre
m	metre
m ²	square metre
ha ⁻¹	per hectare
year ⁻¹	per year
°C	degree centigrade
g	gram
l	litre
t	tonne
kg	Kilogram
ln	natural log
>	more than
<	less than
≥	more and or equal to
≤	less and or equal to
L	Log+notch treatment
C	Control treatment
N	Notch-only treatment

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisor, Professor Richard W. Bell for his constant encouragement, guidance and constructive criticism in the course of field research and preparation of this manuscript. Invaluable benefits were gained during this project period from his excellent supervision through scientific insights, discrete attitude and provision of various assistances.

I would like to extend my sincere thanks to Dr. Song Qiu for his regular support as a co-supervisor in planning and implementation of the field activities and his valuable comments, advice and innovative ideas on several aspects in this thesis without which this research would not be enjoyable and fruitful.

I gratefully acknowledge the Water Corporation of Western Australia for providing me with a post-graduate scholarship and Australian Research Council for research fund support (ARC grant number LP0774966) between 2008 and 2011, without which this study would have not been completed. My special thanks go to Michael Loh, Frank Batini and Dr Bishnu Devkota for their inspiring suggestions and constructive guidance from the very beginning of the research to its end.

My sincere thanks go to Richard Boykett and Frank Bailey from Department of Environment and Conservation for their valuable advice; and Dr Philip Ladd for his support to identify plant species collected from the study area. Thanks go to Dr Joe Fontaine, Wendy, Enamul, Satith, Neil, Binit, Sumina, Raju and Bijayanita for their generous help during this research.

Last but not the least; I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my wife Binita and my family members for their support, patience, encouragement and much more moral and physical support throughout the life of this project.

Dedication

Dedicated to my late father

Chhabi Lal Panta