Creating transactional space for sustainability: a case study of the Western Australian Collaboration

Kathryn Buserlich

A thesis presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
Murdoch University
Western Australia
2007
I declare that this thesis is my own account of my research and contains as its main content work that has not previously been submitted for a degree at any tertiary education institution.

………………………………

Kathryn Buselich
Progressing sustainability requires a more networked approach to governance—an approach that connects otherwise segmented policy areas and fosters greater communication among governments, stakeholders and citizens. Of particular importance is the development of discursive spaces in which diverse actors are able to explore the differing knowledge, perspectives and values raised by the challenge of sustainability. This thesis develops the notion of transactional space to bring into focus the processes of reflection, dialogue and mutual learning that effective sustainability discourse involves. In the first part of the thesis I review literature on the theory and practice of participation, deliberation and collaboration, giving particular attention to the ways in which these processes have potential to create space for a depth of exchange and enable participants to engage with the tensions inherent in complex policy issues. While many authors point to the importance of negotiating difference in these processes, the literature reveals that, in practice, this type of exchange tends to be overlooked or underdeveloped. I therefore argue in this thesis that critical, reflective dialogue plays a key role in generating greater understanding among participants, more comprehensive understanding of policy issues, and more integrative and shared approaches, and for these reasons must be actively developed.

The case study in the second part of the thesis explores this concern for developing reflective exchange in practice. The formation of the Western Australian Collaboration in 2002—a partnership of non-government organizations from a range of social and environmental perspectives committed to ‘a just and sustainable Western Australia’—represented an opportunity to examine the development of participatory and collaborative processes for sustainability. The thesis presents a case study of the WA Collaboration’s development over 2002-2006 to illustrate the potential such networks and open forums offer for transformative exchange around sustainability. It describes the intensive process conducted with the Steering Committee to cultivate a culture of reflection and learning in the organization, and the practical initiatives the process helped to generate.

The thesis concludes with a discussion of the lessons learnt and key principles and practical considerations relevant to fostering transactional space. The WA
Collaboration experience and the review of literature reveal a tendency in practice to privilege action and outcomes over reflection and learning. Furthermore, despite the necessity for a depth of engagement with complex policy issues, funding systems and policy environments often fail to allow the time and resources needed to support genuine dialogue and collaborative work. The thesis provides the concept and principles of transactional space as a means of helping to address this imbalance. They are designed to encourage practitioners to create opportunities for critical, reflective dialogue in a range of deliberative settings.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract ....................................................................................................................... iv

Table of contents ........................................................................................................ vi

List of figures, tables and boxes ................................................................................ vii

List of publications and conference papers arising from the research ...................... viii

Acknowledgements .................................................................................................... ix

INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................... 1

Understanding the challenges involved in progressing sustainability .................. 2

Thesis argument ......................................................................................................... 7

Transactional space ................................................................................................... 9

The contribution of this thesis .................................................................................. 12

The approach and form of the research .................................................................. 13

Thesis structure and outline of chapters .................................................................. 20

CHAPTER 1: CONCEPTUALIZING SUSTAINABILITY......................................................... 25

Origins of the concepts ‘sustainable development’ and ‘sustainability’ ................. 25

The discourse of sustainable development: contribution and deficiencies .......... 27

Sustainability: potential and challenges ............................................................... 35

Conclusion ................................................................................................................ 46

CHAPTER 2: PROGRESSING SUSTAINABILITY THROUGH DELIBERATIVE
AND COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE: THE NEED FOR
TRANSFORMATIVE EXCHANGE ............................................................................... 49

Introduction .............................................................................................................. 49

Sustainability, the renewed interest in participatory democratic process
and emerging network governance ...................................................................... 51

Collaborative initiatives and their potential for sustainability ............................ 64

Deliberative democracy and its role in progressing sustainability .................... 74

Conclusion ................................................................................................................ 90

CHAPTER 3: TRANSACTIONAL SPACE: EXPANDING CAPACITY FOR
TRANSFORMATIVE EXCHANGE ............................................................................... 91

Developing reflective dialogue .............................................................................. 91

Transactional space .................................................................................................. 121

CHAPTER 4: TRANSFORMATIVE EXCHANGE IN PARTICIPATORY AND
DELIBERATIVE PROCESSES .................................................................................. 126

Introduction .............................................................................................................. 126

Citizen-oriented processes ....................................................................................... 128

Stakeholder-oriented processes ............................................................................. 130

Bringing together ‘lay’ and ‘expert’ knowledge in assessment processes ............ 132

Processes combining citizen and stakeholder involvement ............................... 135

Processes of open participation ............................................................................. 138

Limitations of current practice and the challenge of fostering reflective and
transformative exchange ....................................................................................... 142

Conclusion .............................................................................................................. 145
CHAPTER 5: THE WA COLLABORATION AND ITS POTENTIAL FOR CREATING TRANSACTIONAL SPACE FOR SUSTAINABILITY ................................................. 146
Introduction .................................................................................................................. 146
The formation of the WA Collaboration ...................................................................... 148
The WA Collaboration’s roles and work towards sustainability ................................. 154
Tensions, process challenges and the WA Collaboration’s potential for transactional space .......................................................... 185

CHAPTER 6: FOSTERING TRANSACTIONAL SPACE WITHIN THE WA COLLABORATION: THE INTENSIVE PROCESS CONDUCTED WITH THE STEERING COMMITTEE .................................................................................. 193
Introduction ................................................................................................................. 193
Becoming involved in the research with the WA Collaboration ................................. 194
Drawing on participatory action research for the research methodology .................. 196
The intensive process ................................................................................................. 204
Outcomes of the intensive process and the continuing work of the WA Collaboration .................................................................................................................. 232
Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 243

CHAPTER 7: DEVELOPING TRANSACTIONAL SPACE IN DELIBERATIVE AND COLLABORATIVE SITUATIONS: LESSONS LEARNT AND CONCLUSIONS ......................................................... 245
Lessons learnt .............................................................................................................. 251
Principles and practical considerations for developing transactional space .......... 255
Applications of transactional space ........................................................................... 268
Returning to the bigger picture: progressing sustainability through participatory processes ......................................................................................... 274

APPENDICES ........................................................................................................... 279

Appendix 1: Examples of collaborative initiatives .................................................. 279
Appendix 2: Participatory processes ........................................................................ 286
Appendix 3: Topics and questions for interviews conducted with four key participants in 2004 ........................................................................................................ 295
Appendix 4: Topics and questions for interviews conducted with the Steering Committee in 2003 ......................................................................................... 297
Appendix 5: Summaries of the backgrounds and perspectives of the Steering Committee organizations ................................................................. 299
Appendix 6: Discussion paper for the Steering Committee ........................................ 316
Appendix 7: Handout for discussion paper feedback session ................................... 329

REFERENCES ............................................................................................................. 331

LIST OF FIGURES, TABLES AND BOXES

Figure 1: The concept of transactional space .............................................................. 11
Figure 2: Principles for developing transactional space ............................................ 257
Table 1: Timeline of selected WA Collaboration activities (2002-2006) ..................... 168
Table 2: Matrix of commonalities and differences ...................................................... 222
Box 1: Policy ‘hot potato:’ commonalities, differences, potentials and tensions ....... 226
LIST OF PUBLICATIONS AND CONFERENCE PAPERS ARISING FROM THE RESEARCH


ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis began with a long-distance mobile phone call between Australia and the United Kingdom and some notes on a bank deposit slip. I have Emeritus Professor Peter Newman to thank for making this call—for starting me on this journey and inspiring me towards sustainability.

To my supervisors, Dr Ian Barns and Janice Dudley, I owe the utmost thanks for supporting me along the way—for being critical yet kind when I needed it. I have greatly valued our many stimulating discussions over the years, and your patience and steady guidance.

To Nicole Hodgson, the Coordinator of the WA Collaboration, a huge thank you for sharing your wealth of experience, for your openness to my involvement in the WA Collaboration’s development, and for your readiness to work together. Special thanks also go to the participants of the research—both from the WA Collaboration and State Government—for your time and valuable contributions. Likewise, I would like to thank Dr Darren Halpin for our fruitful discussions and collaborative work in the early part of my candidature.

I am greatly appreciative of Murdoch University for supporting me in this endeavour with a scholarship, and would like to thank the staff of Murdoch for their assistance over the years. Special thanks also go to my colleagues Sally Paulin, Dr Jenny Pope, Dr Kylie Sheppard and Dr Susan Wong for their friendship and support during my candidature.

Lastly, I cannot thank enough my wonderful family for their constant love, support and encouragement, especially my partner Chris and my mother Pamela.