RECONCILIATION IN THE FOREST?

An Exploration of the Conflict Over the Logging of Native Forests in the South-west of Western Australia

This thesis is presented for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

David Worth, AssDip Aero Eng (RMIT), MBA (UTS)

Murdoch University, WA Australia

2004
DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own account of my own, original research, that due acknowledgment of other sources has been made where used, and that it contains as its main content, work which has not been submitted for a degree at any tertiary education institution.

Signed:

______________________________
David John Worth
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to ensure that I acknowledge as many people as possible who have helped me over the past six years of my part-time study. I apologise to those I may inadvertently overlook. Firstly, I would like to thank all those who participate in social movements throughout Australia, as through their passion and commitment we get to know more about ourselves as Australians and gain a better understanding of our planet and the communities that inhabit it. In particular, I would like to sincerely thank the people from the pro- and anti-logging movements in Western Australia. Without their willingness to participate and assist my research I would have no dissertation. For many of them it was an important decision because I imposed on them at a time when their organisations were very active in the lead-up to the State election in early 2001.

I also need to gratefully acknowledge the two women in my research life. My wife, Fran, supported me over the whole journey by reading my drafts, correcting my grammar and suggesting changes. In the same vein, I need to thank my son, Daniel, for his patience. I now hope to reward him by locking away the computer and spending more time on his activities. Secondly, my supervisor, Emeritus Professor Cora Baldock, has made a large contribution to the final shape of my thesis. She became engaged with my project from our first discussions. Cora made valuable suggestions at critical times and provided consistent support along the way, with the odd ‘kick in the pants’ when I needed it.

My other ‘family’ has been the academics at Murdoch University and the University of Technology, Sydney (UTS), who offered me their support as well as part-time teaching over the past six years. Their friendship has allowed me to keep in touch with the academic community and developments in the disciplines
associated with my study. They and the other postgraduate students provided valuable sounding boards for my ideas. In particular, I would like to thank Associate Professor Mick Campion, Professor Trish Harris and Dr Dave Palmer for their support over my past four years at Murdoch University. Additionally, I would like to thank Jill Soderstrom and Georgina Wright for their professional administrative assistance and Leonie Stella for her accurate transcription of my interviews.

At the heart of any thesis is the knowledge that precedes the research. I would like to give a big ‘thanks’ to the Librarians at Murdoch University, University of WA, UTS, Sydney University (Fisher Library) as well as those at the State Library (Battye Collection) and the Department of Conservation and Land Management. In particular I would like to thank Niamh Corbert, Librarian at the Parliamentary Library and Information Services, Parliament of Western Australia and Helen Pecheniuk Oral History Reference Librarian at the National Library of Australia. Often I was unsure of what I was looking for and I appreciated the professionalism, knowledge and patience of the library staff I dealt with.

Finally, I would like to thank three people who encouraged my early steps in undertaking a research degree. Professor Mark Lyons, Associate Professor Jenny Onyx, and Dr Thekla Rura-Polley at UTS were important influences for me in the early stages and I appreciated their faith that an engineer with a business degree could make a contribution to the study of Australian social movements.
ABSTRACT

Over the past 30 years in Western Australia (WA), there has been a heated debate about the future use of the remaining temperate old-growth forests of karri and jarrah in the south-west of the State. This debate revolved around policy proposals from two social movements: one social movement wanted to preserve as much of the remaining old-growth forests as possible, and an opposing social movement supported a continued ‘sustainable’ logging of the forests for hardwood products. This research project undertook a comparative case study analysis of one WA organisation from each of these two social movements—Timber Communities Australia (TCA) on the pro-logging side and Liberals For Forests (LFF) on the anti-logging side. It drew on a macro-level European theoretical approach (New Social Movement theory) and a US organisational approach (Resource Mobilisation Theory). The study also investigated the extent to which these two social movement organisations (SMOs) had been effective in influencing the development of State forest policy. For this purpose Schumaker’s (1975) framework for judging the political effectiveness of social movements was used. The key research problem investigated in this thesis is why these two SMOs continued to debate the forest policy issue after more than 30 years of public controversy?

Interviews with a key range of stakeholders were the key research method of this study. Additionally, an investigation into important economic and social changes in the south west was undertaken using census and other data between 1971 and 2001 and this was supported by an historical analysis of the timber industry in WA’s south west. Finally, a 3-year study of the reporting of forest issues by two local and one national newspaper was completed. The 1998-2000
period was chosen for the newspaper analysis as this was when the new Regional Forest Agreement was being finalised.

This research shows that new values toward the old-growth forests developed among the WA public over the past 30 years and this has created an unbridgeable policy gap between those such as the TCA who wanted the past policies to continue and those such as the LFF who wanted to preserve the remaining native forests. ABS data confirm that the south-west region of WA changed dramatically between 1970 and 2000 as the wine and tourism industries developed and that these changes were different to those occurring in the other wine regions and non-city areas of Australia. As the population increased in this region, a key segment attracted by these new employment opportunities were middle class, well-educated people with new values toward the natural environment.

The interview and newspaper article data clearly showed that the debate in WA in the late 1990s over the proposed RFA provided a new political opportunity for the anti-logging movement to raise their concerns and to establish a renewed public debate about the appropriateness of the WA forest policies. This came at a time when the traditional policy power of the timber industry stakeholders and the government department in charge of the forests (Conservation And Land Management) had been dramatically diminished. The combination of these factors led to the election of the new ALP government and the introduction of a new, non-logging policy for WA’s old-growth native forests.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Declaration  
Acknowledgments  
Tables and Figures  
Acronyms  
Abstract  

**Chapter 1- INTRODUCTION**

1.1 Aims of the Research  
1.2 The Relevance of Social Movements  
1.3 The Research Setting  
1.4 Outline of My Thesis  

**Chapter 2- LITERATURE SOURCES**

2.1 Introduction  
2.2 Macro Level Interactions  
2.3 Organisational Effectiveness Approaches  
2.4 An Intra-Organisation Approach- Resource Mobilisation  
2.5 An Integrating Approach- Policy Networks  
2.6 Conclusion  

**Chapter 3- RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

3.1 Introduction  
3.2 Operationalising the Research Question  
3.3 Research Period  
3.4 Data Collection  
3.5 Data Analysis  
3.6 Conclusion  

**Chapter 4- EARLY HISTORY OF THE FOREST INDUSTRY: from pre-colonial times to 1920**

4.1 Introduction  
4.2 Pre-Colonial Episteme (to 1829) - Aboriginal Use of the Forests  
4.3 Colonial Episteme (1829 to 1920) -  
- The Establishment of Commercial Logging  
4.4 The Growing Economic Value of WA’s Timber Industry  
4.5 Conclusion  

**Chapter 5- SCIENTIFIC EPISTEME: from 1920 to 2000**

5.1 Introduction  
5.2 Royal Commissions and their Effect  
5.3 The Role of Science in Government Forest Policy  
5.4 The National RFA Process  
5.5 The Forest Debate In Hansard  
5.6 The Declining Value of WA’s Timber Industry
5.7 Trade Union Membership 148
5.8 New Industries in the South-west 151
5.9 WA’s Growing Wine Industry 154
5.10 Conclusion 157

Chapter 6- ARRIVAL OF THE ECOLOGICAL EPISTEME (from 2001)
6.1 Introduction 159
6.2 Growing Environmental Insights in Australia and Western Australia 160
6.3 International Environment Scene 170
6.4 Demographic Changes in the South-west Region 176
6.5 2001 State Election Outcome 198
6.6 Conclusion 210

Chapter 7- INTERVIEW FINDINGS
7.1 Introduction 212
7.2 Roles and Stakeholders 213
7.3 Importance of the RFA Process 222
7.4 Effectiveness of Stakeholder Organisations 225
7.5 Resources 230
7.6 Values 237
7.7 Other Important Issues Raised by the Interviews 243
7.8 Conclusion 252

Chapter 8- THE USE OF MEDIA AS A RESOURCE - REPORTING THE RFA DEBATE
8.1 Introduction 254
8.2 Newspaper Content Analysis 256
8.3 Major Events Generating Newspaper Reports 264
8.4 Coverage in *The West Australian* 270
8.5 Perceptions of Bias 280
8.6 Anti- and Pro-Logging Messages 286
8.7 Importance of TV 292
8.8 Conclusion 294

Chapter 9- ANALYSIS
9.1 Introduction 297
9.2 Factors Operating at the Macro-Societal Level 298
9.3 Inter-Organisational Factors 314
9.4 Intra-Organisational Resources 326
9.5 Conclusion 332

Chapter 10- CONCLUSION
10.1 My Findings 333
10.2 Usefulness of Theoretical Approaches 339
10.3 Limitations of the Research 344
10.5 Further Research 344
APPENDICES
Appendix 1 - Focus Group Question Schedule 349
Appendix 2 - Letter to Proposed Interviewees 350
Appendix 3 - Individual Interview Question Guide 351
Appendix 4 - Annual Timber Export Value From WA (1845-1922) 352
Appendix 5 - Election Results for the District of Alfred Cove (State General) 353
Appendix 6 - WA State General Election- Party Results (1996 & 2001) 354
Appendix 9 - Terms Mentioned in Hansard (1970-1989) 358

BIBLIOGRAPHY 360
## TABLES AND FIGURES

Table 1.1 - A Summary of Forested Areas in Selected Countries (1971)  
Table 1.2 - A Summary of Forested Areas in Selected Countries (1990s)  
Table 1.3 - Amount of Different Types of Forests in Australia (2000) 

Table 3.1 - Interviews with Primary Stakeholders  
Table 3.2 - Interviews with Case Study Stakeholders  
Table 3.3 - Interviews with Secondary Sources  
Table 3.4 – Structure of the Editions of The West Australian (12-17 July 1999) 

Table 4.1 - Estimate of Non-Aboriginal Population of WA (1829-1900)  
Table 4.2 - Timber Exports in the Early Days of Colonisation  
Table 4.3 - Timber Exports in Comparison to Wool Exports in the Early Days of Colonisation  
Table 4.4 - Timber Exports from WA in the Period Before WW1  
Table 4.5 - Export Value of WA’s Major Exports Before WW1 

Table 5.1 –Mentions of ‘RFA’ and ‘Forest’ in Hansard by Party (1998-2000)  
Table 5.2 - End of the Century WA Timber Export Data  
Table 5.3 - End of the Century Comparison of WA Export Data  
Table 5.4 - Value and Size of Selected WA Resource Exports  
Table 5.5 - Australian & WA Woodchip Export Data (1995-2000)  
Table 5.6 - Union Membership in WA and Australia (1986-2001)  
Table 5.7 - WA Agriculture & Forestry Union Membership (1986-2001)  
Table 5.8 - WA Wine Grape Production and Wineries 
Table 5.9 - Australian & WA Wine Exports (2000)  
Table 5.10 - WA Grape Exports 1990-2000 
Table 5.11 - South-West Wine Industry Employment (2000) 

Table 6.1 - Expansion of Conservation Areas in Australia (1968-1988)  
Table 6.2 - Proportion of People Concerned About Environmental Problems (1992-2001)  
Table 6.3 - Proportion of State-owned Forests in WA  
Table 6.4 - Changes in Selected LGA Populations (1971-2001)  
Table 6.5 - LGA Comparison of Population Cohorts (1971-2001)  
Table 6.6 - Labour Force Employment (1971-2001)  
Table 6.7 - Unemployment Rates (2001)  
Table 6.8 - Labour Force Employment- Forestry and Agricultural Sectors (1971-2001) 
Table 6.9 - WA Forestry Employment (1971-1996) 
Table 6.10 - WA Forestry Employment by Gender (1971-1996) 
Table 6.11 - University Qualifications (1971-2001)  
Table 6.12 - University Enrolment (1971-1996)  
Table 6.13 - Reported Religious Orientation (1971-2001) 
Table 6.14 – State Religious Affiliation and Education Values (2001) 
Table 6.15 - Median Weekly Earnings (1976-1996) 
Table 6.16 - 1996 Median Weekly Earnings for Men and Women 

Table 7.1 Stakeholders Judgement on Political Effectiveness 

Table 8.1 - The Number of Forest Articles Published (1998-2000)  
Table 8.2 - The Number of Forest Articles Published Each Month in WA Newspapers (1998-2000) 
Table 8.3 - The Number of Forest Articles Published Each Day- The Sunday Times & The West Australian (1998-2000) 
Table 8.4 - Editorials on Forests Issues (1998-99)
Table 8.5 - Coverage for Sourced Organisations in The West Australian (column cms) (1998-2000) 272
Table 8.6 - Journalists Writing on Forests Issues in The West Australian (1998-2000) 274
Table 8.7 - Stakeholder Articles in The West Australian (1998 - 2000) 277
Table 8.8 - Article Location in The West Australian (1998 to 2000) 278
Table 8.9 - Examples of Minor Changes in Metro Edition Headlines 283
Table 8.10 - Examples of Headlines Altered in Metro Edition 284
Table 8.11 - Articles Added to the Metro Edition of The West Australian 286
Table 9.1 - Forest Policy Network Stakeholders (1970-2000) 312

Figure 1A - Depiction of the founding of the new Swan River Colony 3
Figure 1B - Map of Western Australia 13
Figure 4A - Felling karri by axe and cross-cut saw 82
Figure 4B - Native Timber Exports from WA (1845 to 1890) 95
Figure 4C - Native Timber Exports from WA (1891 to 1922) 96
Figure 5A – 1923 Cartoon from the Western Mail 109
Figure 5B - Mentions of CALM in Hansard (1983-2000) 136
Figure 5C – Costs and Revenues of Australia’s Forest Services (1920-1980) 144
Figure 5D – CALM Forest Royalties (1988-1998) 145
Figure 5E - Changes in Sawmill Employees in Australia (1920-1983) 146
Figure 5F - Changes in Jarrah Timber Distribution (1829-2000) 148
Figure 6A - Comment on the apparent political power of timber workers and green supporters 159
Figure 6B - National Membership of ACF & TWS (1967- 1992) 169
Figure 6C - Map of LGAs in the South-west 178
Figure 6D - South-west Regional Population Growth (1971-1996) 180
Figure 6E - LGA Population Distribution (1996) 183
Figure 6F - Changes in Religious Affiliation (1971-2001) 192
Figure 6G - Selected 1996 Median Annual Earnings Distribution 196
Figure 6H - 1996 Median Annual Earnings Distribution-3 South-west LGAs and Nedlands 197
Figure 8A - The Amount of Coverage of Forest Issues Each Month in WA Newspapers (1998-2000) 259
Figure 9A - Cartoon on the intervention of Archbishop Carnley 297
Figure 9B - Population Growth in Manjimup and Augusta-Margaret River LGAs (1971-2001) 306
Figure 10A - Even the cartoonist feels the pressure 333
# ACRONYMS

**Australian States-**

- NSW- New South Wales
- VIC- Victoria
- QLD- Queensland
- WA- Western Australia
- SA- South Australia
- TAS- Tasmania
- ACT- Australian Capital Territory
- NT- Northern Territory

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AAP</td>
<td>Australian Associated Press</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABARE</td>
<td>Australian Bureau of Agricultural Research Economics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABC</td>
<td>Australian Broadcasting Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABS</td>
<td>Australian Bureau of Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFFA</td>
<td>Agriculture, Fisheries &amp; Forestry Australia Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFL-</td>
<td>Australian Football League</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALP</td>
<td>Australian Labor Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CALM</td>
<td>Department of Conservation and Land Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCWA</td>
<td>Conservation Council of WA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COAG</td>
<td>Coalition of Australian Governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTRC</td>
<td>Conservation Through Reserves Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DLP-</td>
<td>Democratic Labor Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPA</td>
<td>Environment Protection Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FIFWA</td>
<td>Forest Industries Federation of WA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FPS</td>
<td>Forest Protection Society (now TCA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MP</td>
<td>Member of Parliament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAC</td>
<td>Resource Assessments Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFA</td>
<td>Regional Forest Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFF</td>
<td>Liberals For Forests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NLA</td>
<td>National Library of Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SW</td>
<td>South-west</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TCA</td>
<td>Timber Communities Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TLC</td>
<td>Trades and Labour Council (now Unions WA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWS</td>
<td>The Wilderness Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>Western Australia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WAFA</td>
<td>West Australian Forests Alliance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>