AN INVESTIGATION INTO STRATEGIC HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT IN INDONESIA: A GROUNDED RESEARCH APPROACH

Arif Hartono

This thesis is presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy of Murdoch University

Murdoch University
2010
DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own account of my research and contains as its main content work which has not previously been submitted for a degree at any tertiary education institution

Perth, 7th October 2010

Arif Hartono
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In the name of Allah, The Most Gracious, The Most Merciful

First and foremost, I would like to extend my greatest gratitude to God, Allah SWT. Only His will helped me to complete this thesis. It was a long and tiring journey and there was a stage when I almost gave up.

A number of people have contributed to the completion of my thesis and I wish to acknowledge my appreciation for their support. Most importantly, I would like to acknowledge and express my deepest thanks to Professor Lanny Entrekin and Professor Brenda Scott-Ladd for their continuous guidance, inspiring ideas, thoughtful suggestions, priceless critical comments, and kind understanding throughout the doctoral journey.

I would also like to thanks the Universitas Islam Indonesia (UII) for providing scholarships to achieve the PhD degree. Thanks also go to Murdoch University for providing a PhD completion scholarship, while I was in a financial emergency stage.

I am grateful to sixty-three HR managers for sharing their experiences in managing people at their companies. Without their information, this study would not have been possible. I am also thankful to Professor Niki (Padang), mas Hamid (Medan), Salim (Makasar), Sarno and Wahyudi (Banjarmasin), and mas Rofiq (Jakarta) for providing accommodation during the interviews in their cities.

Special thanks should go to Dekar and his family (Tifa, Igo, Nia, and Atha) for providing accommodation and a friendly family environment during the critical time for completing the thesis in Perth. I am sorry for disturbing your family life.

I am also grateful to Dr. Hakim and Roman for their support in Perth. For Warsono, Dr. Sobirin, and Al Hasin; thanks for being warm friends during a difficult and lonely period in Yogya.

Special appreciation should also go to Dr. Ghiali for acting as proof reader for this thesis. Her sincere support is an invaluable contribution to the perfection of this thesis.

I am particularly indebted to mbah Pang and mbah Kat for taking care of my father while I was away. I am also grateful to mas Har for his understanding of my situation. Further thanks go to mbak Nis and her family, and also mas Agus for helping take care of my sons.

Last, but never least, my heartfelt thanks to my beloved wife Lilis and my dearest sons Dzoel and Aik, for your prayers, support, encouragement, patience, and understanding. Without your love, affection, and sacrifices this study could not be accomplished. I am so sorry for making your life miserable during my PhD journey.
DEDICATION

To My Loving Family:

Wife: Lilis Ummi Fa’ieza

Sons: Muh. Luthfi Taufik Dzulfikar and Muh. Fakhri Taufik Ghiffari

“I can never accomplished this without your unconditional love and support”

In Loving Memories:

Mother: Hj. Mutiatun

Father-in-law: H Ismakoen

With Love and Respect:

Father: H. Badarudin Mawardi

Mother-in-law: Hj. Umi Mudawamah Solikhah

My entire family
ABSTRACT

This thesis reports on a study investigating the role of strategic human resource management (SHRM) within the Indonesian context. This study is significant for two important reasons. The first is that the link between strategy and HR management in Indonesia appears to have excited little interest from researchers, despite that SHRM has a great deal to offer in assisting organizations manage one of their most valuable assets. The second is that greater understanding of this relationship will enable more strategic formulation and implementation of SHRM. The research has three main foci. The first is to examine how Indonesian organizations align their human resource management (HRM) practices to the business or organizational strategies. Second is to explore the factors that link the HR department to the strategic decision process. The third is to identify key determinants of successful implementation of HR strategy.

No apparent studies so far provide a clear picture of how strategic HR management is implemented in Indonesian organizations; therefore, a grounded theory methodology was used. Data was collected by interviewing sixty-three HR managers from the industry sectors of hotels, hospitals, agriculture and textile manufacturing. Participants were drawn from eight states across Indonesia. Consistent with grounded research principles, data was analyzed using five stages of coding procedure;—open coding, axial coding, selective coding, conditional matrix, theoretical proposition, as described by Strauss & Corbin (1998).

The findings of the study fall into three themes. First, is the approach Indonesian organizations use to align HRM to business or organizational strategies, which usually follows one of two approaches; a best practice or universalistic approach, or a best fit or contingency approach. The best practice perspective confirms a general pattern for managing Indonesian employees and this relates to organizations working within the three following conditions: the organizational process is simple; they have a captive market; and the organization is in a mature life stage. The best fit or contingency domain is adopted by organizations when business or competitive strategy is the major variable for determining the HR strategy. Other factors influencing HR strategy include
internal (organizational) and external (environmental) factors such as the organization’s size, structure, life cycle, access to capital, market competition, technological changes, government rules, global changes, economic condition, culture, and the unions. The interactions among these influence HR strategy, either directly or indirectly by influencing the business strategy.

In addition, SHRM occurs through an integrative or two-way linkage. The integrative linkage is where the HR department is involved throughout the whole process and included in formulating strategy, decision-making and implementing strategy. In two-way linkage, the HR department participates in formulating and implementing strategy but is not involved in the decision making process. The choice for each approach depends on the fit with the organizational mindset, the organizational structure, and informal strategic decision process. Finally the determinants of HR strategy implementation match the central determinants of credibility, organizational support and the role and skills of the HR professional, as found in Western or international organizations. Understanding which factors are being utilized or adapted offers not only a significant contribution to our knowledge of the strategy – HR link, but will also have significant implications for practice in Indonesia and ample opportunity for further testing of this link.

Keywords:
Strategic human resource management, Indonesia, grounded research, best practice, best fit, two-way linkage, integrative linkage, credibility HR strategy, organizational support, role of HR people.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION ii  
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS iii  
DEDICATION iv  
ABSTRACT v  
TABLE OF CONTENTS vii  
LIST OF TABLES xiii  
LIST OF FIGURES xv  
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS xvi  

CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION TO RESEARCH 1  
1.1. Introduction 1  
1.2. Background to the Research 2  
1.3. Research Setting: An Overview of Indonesia 5  
  1.3.1. Demographics of Indonesia 6  
  1.3.2. Socio-Cultural of Indonesian People 7  
  1.3.3. Economy of Indonesia 9  
  1.3.4. Politics and Government of Indonesia 12  
1.4. HRM in Indonesia 15  
1.5. The Purpose of the Study 18  
1.6. The Significance of the Study 19  
1.7. The Overview of Methodology 20  
1.8. The Overview of the Thesis Structure 23  
1.9. Conclusion 25  

CHAPTER II: LITERATURE REVIEW 26  
2.1. Introduction 26  
2.2. The Evolution of HRM 27  
  2.2.1. The Origins of HRM 32
2.2.2. From Personnel Management to HRM 34
2.2.3. The SHRM Era 38
2.3. The Foundation of SHRM 40
2.4. The Approaches into SHRM 45
2.4.1. The Best Practice or Universalistic Approach 46
2.4.2. The Best Fit or Contingency Approach 57
2.4.3. The Configurational Model 69
2.4.4. The Approaches into SHRM: A Summary 69
2.5. The Role of HRM in the Organization 70
2.6. The Implementation of HR Strategy 83
2.7. Conclusion 93

CHAPTER III: RESEARCH DESIGN 94
3.1. Introduction 94
3.2. Selecting a Research Design 95
3.3. Selecting a Research Paradigm 105
3.3.1. Research Paradigm Selected: Interpretive 111
3.3.2. Research Ontology Selected: Constructivist 114
3.3.3. Research Epistemology Selected: Subjective 116
3.4. Selecting a Research Methodology 118
3.4.1. Research Methodology Selected: Qualitative Research 119
3.4.2. Qualitative Methodology Selected: Grounded Study 123
3.5. Research Method: Grounded Theory 126
3.5.1. Data Collection Method 127
3.5.1.1. Sample Technique: Theoretical Sampling 129
3.5.1.2. Preliminary Interviews: Unstructured Interviews 131
3.5.1.3. Main Interviews: Semi Structured Interviews 133
3.5.1.3.1. Designing Semi Structured Interview 134
3.5.1.3.2. Access to Site 134
3.5.1.3.3. Venue of Interviews 135
3.5.1.3.4. Duration of Interviews 135
3.5.1.3.5. Language Used 136
3.5.1.3.6. Interview Process 136

3.5.2. Data Analysis Method 140
  3.5.2.1. Data Transcription 144
  3.5.2.2. Data Coding 145
    3.5.2.2.1. Open Coding 146
    3.5.2.2.2. Axial Coding 148
    3.5.2.2.3. Selective Coding 149
  3.5.2.2.4. Conditional/Consequential Matrix 151
  3.5.2.2.5. Theoretical Proposition 152

3.5.2.3. Manual Analysis 152

3.6. Establishing Trustworthiness 154
3.7. Ethical Considerations 155
3.8. Conclusion 157

CHAPTER IV: RESEARCH FINDINGS 158
4.1. Introduction 158
4.2. Background of Participants 159
4.3. Research Findings 162
  4.3.1. The Approaches to SHRM 163
    4.3.1.1. The Best Practice or Universalistic Approach 163
      Organizational Process 164
      Market Condition 166
      Organization’s Life Cycle 166
    4.3.1.2. The Best Fit or Contingency Approach 167
      4.3.1.2.1. Business Strategy 168
      4.3.1.2.2. Internal or Organizational Context 171
        Organization’s Size 171
        Organization’s Structure 172
        Stage in Organizational Life Cycle 173
        Access to Capital 174
4.3.1.2.3. External or Environmental Context
- Market Competition
- Technology
- Government Rules
- Global Changes
- Economic Condition
- Culture
- Union

4.3.2. The Role of HRM and Its People in the Organization
4.3.2.1. The Two-Way Linkage
- Organizational Mindset
- Organizational structure
- Informal Strategic Decision Process

4.3.2.2. The Integrative Linkage
- Organizational Mindset
- Organizational structure
- Informal Strategic Decision Process

4.3.3. The Determinants of HR strategy Implementation
4.3.3.1. The Credibility of HR Strategy
- Level of Understanding of Business Strategy
- Compatibility with the Condition of Organization
- Involvement of Organization’s Members

4.3.3.2. Organizational Support
- Top Management Support
- Partnership among Departments
- Organizational or Corporate Culture

4.3.3.3. The Role of HR Department’s Staff
- The HR Staff Capability
- The HR Staff Autonomy
- The HR Staff Commitment

4.4. Conclusion
CHAPTER V: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION 225

5.1. Introduction 225

5.2. The Approaches to SHRM 226
   5.2.1. The Best Practice or Universalistic Approach 226
   5.2.2. The Best Fit or Contingency Approach 230
      5.2.2.1. Business Strategy 232
      5.2.2.2. Internal or Organizational Context 233
         Organization’s Size 234
         Organization’s Structure 236
         Stage in the Organizational Life Cycle 237
         Access to Capital or Quality of Business Funding 238
      5.2.2.3. External or Environmental Context 239
         Market Competition 239
         Technology 240
         Government Rules 241
         Global Changes 243
         Economic Condition 244
         Culture 247
         Union 250
      5.2.2.4. The Adoption of the Best Fit in 251
         the Indonesian Organizations

5.3. The Role of HRM and Its People in the Organization 253

5.4. The Determinants of HR strategy Implementation 258
   5.4.1. The Credibility of HR Strategy 258
      Understanding of Business Strategy 259
      Compatibility with the Conditions of Organization 260
      Employee Involvement 260
   5.4.2. Organizational Support 261
      Top Management Support 261
      Partnership among Departments 262
Organizational Culture 263

5.4.3. The Role of HR Department Staff 264
   The HR Staff Capability 265
   The HR Staff Autonomy 266
   The HR Staff Commitment 267

5.4.4. The Determinant of HR Strategy Implementation 267
   in the Indonesian Organizations

5.5. Characteristics of Each Industry 270

5.6. Limitations, Conclusions and Recommendations 274
   5.6.1. Limitations 274
   5.6.2. Conclusions and Recommendations 275
      5.6.2.1. The Approaches into SHRM 275
      5.6.2.2. The Role of HRM in the Organization 278
      5.6.2.3. The Determinants of HR Strategy Implementation 279

REFERENCES 281

APPENDICES 323

Appendix 1a Introduction Letter to Potential Respondents 323
Appendix 1b Covering Letter from the Rector of Universitas Islam Indonesia 324
Appendix 1c Ethical Approval from Murdoch University 325
Appendix 2 Translation of Finding Themes 326
Appendix 3 Characteristics of Best Practices 380
Appendix 4 Prototype of SHRM across Industries 382
Appendix 5 List of Publications 384
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Five Stages of HRM 28
Table 2.2: Stereotypes of Personnel Management and HRM 35
Table 2.3: Perspectives of Personnel Management and HRM 37
Table 2.4: Emergent Directions in HR Practice: From HRM to the New HRM 39
Table 2.5: HRM Links to Strategy and Structure 42
Table 2.6: The Supporters of the Best Practice Approach 47
Table 2.7: The Supporters of the Best Fit Approach 59
Table 2.8: Business Strategies and HR System 62
Table 2.9: Business Strategy and HRM Choices 63
Table 2.10: HR Strategy: Two Different Scenarios 66
Table 2.11: Phases in SHRM 72
Table 2.12: Competency Framework for HR Professional 82
Table 3.1: Alternative Choices in Each Stage of Selecting a Research Design 100
Table 3.2: Alternative Knowledge Claim Position 101
Table 3.3: Theoretical Perspectives in the Social Sciences 109
Table 3.4: Basic Belief of Alternative Inquiry Paradigm 111
Table 3.5: Dimension for Comparing Five Research Traditions in Qualitative Research 122
Table 3.6: Data Collection Activities in Grounded Theory Research 128
Table 3.7: Semi-structured Questionnaire 138
Table 3.8: Data Analysis and Representation in Grounded Theory 144
Table 4.1: Profile of HR Respondents 160
Table 4.2: Profile of Industry Respondents 161
Table 4.3: Findings Related to the Approaches to SHRM 163
Table 4.4: Findings Related to the Best Practice Approach 164
Table 4.5: Findings Related to the Best Fit (Contingency) Approach 168
Table 4.6: Findings Related to the Role of HRM in the Organization 186
Table 4.7: Findings Related to the Two-Way Linkage 187
Table 4.8: Findings Related to Integrative Linkage 191
Table 4.9: Findings related to the Determinants of HR Strategy Implementation 197
Table 4.10: Findings Related to the Credibility of HR Strategy 198
Table 4.11: Findings Related to the Organizational Support 204
Table 4.12: Findings related to the Role of the HR Staff 215
Table 4.13: Distribution of Indonesian SHRM 223
Table 5.1: Indonesian Cultural Dimensions 248
### LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>The Distribution of Interviews Location</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>The Matching/ Michigan’s Model of HRM</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>The Harvard’s Model of HRM</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>A Theoretical Framework of SHRM</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Involvement of HRM in Decision-making Processes</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Interaction of Strategy Formulation and Implementation</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>The Basic Implementation Process</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>HR Strategy Implementation</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>The Obstruction Processes in Strategy Implementation</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>A Scheme for an Analyzing Assumption about the Nature of Social Science</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Crotty’s Model of Selecting a Research Design</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Basic Principles of Creswell’s Research Design Model</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Creswell’s Research Design Model</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Sarantakos’ (1998) Research Design Model</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Sarantakos’ (2005) Research Design Model</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Four Paradigms for the Analysis of Social Theory</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>Steps in Data Coding</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>The Summary of Research Findings</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>A Model of SHRM within the Indonesian Context</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFTA</td>
<td>ASEAN Fee Trade Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APEC</td>
<td>Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASEAN</td>
<td>Association of South East Asia Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPS</td>
<td>Biro Pusat Statistic (<em>Statistics Central Bureau</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAFTA</td>
<td>China-ASEAN Free Trade Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIA</td>
<td>Central Intelligent Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPA</td>
<td>Dewan Pertimbangan Agung (<em>Supreme Advisory Council</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPD</td>
<td>Dewan Perwakilan Daerah (<em>Regional Representative Council</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPR</td>
<td>Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat (<em>Council of People’s Representative</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HCM</td>
<td>High Commitment Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HPWS</td>
<td>High Performance Work System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR</td>
<td>Human Resource</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRM</td>
<td>Human Resource Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labor Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISO</td>
<td>The International Organization for Standardization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KKN</td>
<td>Korupsi Kolusi Nepotism (<em>Corruption Collusion Nepotism</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KPK</td>
<td>Komisi Pemberantasan Korupsi (<em>Corruption Eradication Commission</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KY</td>
<td>Komisi Yudisial (<em>Judicial Commision</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MK</td>
<td>Mahkamah Konstitusi (<em>Constitutional Court</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPR</td>
<td>Majelis Permusyawaratan Rakyat (<em>People’s Consultative Assembly</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCB</td>
<td>Organizational Citizenship Behaviour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBU</td>
<td>Strategic Business Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHRM</td>
<td>Strategic Human Resource Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPSI</td>
<td>Serikat Pekerja Seluruh Indonesia (<em>Indonesian Workers Union</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UMK</td>
<td>Upah Minimum Kabupaten (<em>Regency Minimum Wage</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>World Trade Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>