The Deakinite Myth Exposed
Other accounts of constitution-makers, constitutions and citizenship

This thesis is presented for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
of Murdoch University

2005

Geoffrey Trenorden
BA Honours (Murdoch)
I declare that this thesis is my own account of my research and contains as its main content work which has not previously been submitted for a degree at any tertiary education institution.

..............................................

Geoffrey Trenorden
Abstract

As argued throughout this thesis, in his personification of the federal story, if not immediately in his formulation of its paternity, Deakin’s unpublished memoirs anticipated the way that federation became codified in public memory. The long and tortuous process of federation was rendered intelligible by turning it into a narrative set around a series of key events. For coherence and dramatic momentum the narrative dwelt on the activities of, and words of, several notable figures. To explain the complex issues at stake it relied on memorable metaphors, images and descriptions.

Analyses of class, citizenship, or the industrial confrontations of the 1890s, are given little or no coverage in Deakinite accounts. Collectively, these accounts are told in the words of the victors, presented in the images of the victors, clothed in the prejudices and predilections of the victors, while the losers are largely excluded. Those who spoke out against or doubted the suitability of the constitution, for whatever reason, have largely been removed from the dominant accounts of constitution-making. More often than not they have been ‘character assassinated’ or held up to public ridicule by Alfred Deakin, the master narrator of the Conventions and federation movement and by his latter-day disciples. Those who opposed Deakin I have labelled anti-Deakinites.

To anti-Deakinites, the journey to federation was characterised by compromises and concessions that reflected or produced a series of exclusions (of individuals, groups and ideas) from Deakinite stories of federation, often for reasons of political exigency. They acknowledge that compromises had to be made in bringing about federation. Men with a national viewpoint they believe, often acquiesced to states’ rights men whose primary interest was a good deal for their state or colony. Anti-Deakinites are critical of the heroes in Deakinite accounts (of the Ultra-Federalists) believing that
these men would have federated any time after 1891 with an undemocratic and illiberal constitution.

Events that were to influence the course of Australian history took place during the 1880-90s. Yet the dominant accounts of constitution-making do not acknowledge the context within which the constitution was written. It is difficult denying that these must have influenced the Constitution-makers as they began their work in 1891. The central claim of my thesis is that many accounts of Australian constitution-making and federation have been selective in their descriptions of the events and the organisations and individuals involved, leading to the misrepresentation of these seminal episodes in Australian history. This misrepresentation has occurred as a consequence of the privileging of, what I label, the Deakinite account of constitution-making and federation over all others.
# Table of Contents

Abstract .................................................................................................................................................. iii

Table of Contents ................................................................................................................................. v

Tables .................................................................................................................................................. vi

Acknowledgments ............................................................................................................................. viii

Introduction ............................................................................................................................................. 1

Deakinites ............................................................................................................................................... 4
Critics – The Anti-Deakinites ............................................................................................................. 8
Exclusions and Omissions .................................................................................................................. 12
Federation as Myth and Metaphor ..................................................................................................... 14
Structure of Thesis .............................................................................................................................. 17

Chapter 1 - The Deakinite Account of Constitution-Making ................................................................. 22
1.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................................... 22
1.2 Deakin and Deakinites .................................................................................................................. 25
1.3 Federation at any Cost ................................................................................................................... 33
1.4 Ultra-Federalists, Anti-Billites, Liberals and Democrats ........................................................... 35
1.5 Heroes ........................................................................................................................................... 38
1.6 The Deakinite Vision .................................................................................................................... 51
1.7 The Deakinite People ................................................................................................................... 56
1.8 Enemies ......................................................................................................................................... 60
1.9 Ultra-Federalists and Compromise ............................................................................................. 64
1.10 The Journey to Federation ......................................................................................................... 66
1.11 The Compromising of Citizenship ............................................................................................. 69
1.12 Conclusion ................................................................................................................................... 74

Chapter 2 – Exclusions from the Deakinite Account .......................................................................... 77
2.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................................... 77
2.2 Excluded Men ............................................................................................................................... 81
2.3 Excluded Positions ....................................................................................................................... 93
2.4 The Exclusion of Citizenship ....................................................................................................... 98
2.5 Excluded People ........................................................................................................................ 102
2.6 Conclusion ................................................................................................................................... 108

Chapter 3 – Class, Politics and Society ............................................................................................... 111
3.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................................... 111
3.2 Class in Australia .......................................................................................................................... 116
3.3 Class and Society .......................................................................................................................... 127
3.4 Politics and Class .......................................................................................................................... 134
3.5 Conclusion .................................................................................................................................... 144

Chapter 4 - Labour and Class Conflict ................................................................................................. 146
4.1 Introduction ................................................................................................................................... 146
4.2 Precursors to the Great Strikes ................................................................................................... 151
4.3 Mining Unions ............................................................................................................................. 156
4.4 The Extension of Trade Unions ................................................................................................... 159
4.5 Increasing Conflict ....................................................................................................................... 163
4.6 Capital versus Labour .................................................................................................................. 169
4.7 Constitution-makers and Industrial Turmoil ............................................................................. 176
4.8 Conclusion ................................................................................................................................... 180
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 5 – Middle-Class Men</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Introduction</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Delegates’ Attendance at Conferences, Conventions and Meetings</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Results of Referenda</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Gender, Ethnicity and Birthplace</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5 Delegates and Public Office</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6 Vocational Interests</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7 Religious Background</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8 Education and Family</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.9 Conclusion</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 6 – Rethinking Compromises and Possibilities</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Introduction</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 Deakinites and the Absence of Citizenship</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Constitutions and Theorists</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Rethinking Compromises</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 Possible Effects of Citizenship on the Class Structure</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6 Conclusion</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Conclusion                                           | 263  |
| Bibliography                                         | 269  |
| Other Works Consulted                                | 275  |
**Tables**

**Table 1:** Delegates’ Attendance at Significant Federation Meetings and Conventions Prior to the Federal Conventions of 1897-98 .................................................. 193

**Table 2:** Commonwealth of Australia Constitution Bill Referenda Results 1898-1900 195

**Table 3:** Year of Birth of Delegates attending Federal Conventions of 1897-98 .......... 197

**Table 4:** Convention Members by Country of Birth .................................................. 197

**Table 5:** Delegates’ Backgrounds of Public Office .................................................. 200

**Table 6:** Vocational Backgrounds of Delegates ..................................................... 215

**Table 7:** Religion of Delegates .............................................................................. 217

**Table 8:** Education Levels of Delegates ................................................................. 220
Acknowledgments

There are a number of people I would like to thank who have accompanied me on the journey to the successful completion of my thesis. Thanks to David Savat who constantly reminded me of the power of youthful exuberance. To Yvonne Haig, thanks for the coffee and conversations, many which reassured me I was not altogether mad. Many thanks to Helen Brash who set me on the intellectual journey several years ago. Thanks also to my good friend Ian Green for the coffee, breakfasts and for listening to my arguments with good grace. To my Supervisor, Dr Ian Cook, thank you for your patience, tolerance and perception. I have been truly fortunate to have had you as my guide and mentor. Finally, thank you to my family. Tim, you were fortunate to have been working away from home for the past couple of years. Scott, thank you for listening with good grace to my opinions and ideas. At crucial times your comments were priceless. To my wife, Noele, thank you for listening ‘above and beyond the call of duty’. Without your support and love a project like this would have been impossible.