Dissertation

Music matters in fiction: Creative and critical reflections
Introduction

By the 1960s, eighty percent of Australian schools offered the ABC’s weekly children’s singing programme as the music curriculum in schools.¹ For half an hour, one morning a week, a class monitor would flick a switch on the wall and the speaker above the blackboard would come to life with piano music and song. While the teacher sat at the back of the room, marking spelling, dictation and maths papers, the students sat and listened, sang or spoke in response to the prompts of the voice from the speaker.

Apart from these weekly music lessons, I was one of the few students in my school who learned piano privately, not because we had a lot of money, but because my father, coming from a musical family, decided that, before they reached the age of seven, each of his five children would learn to play the piano and study the theory of music. There were no private music teachers in the newly established industrial town in which I lived, so I attended piano lessons before and after school at the convent. My classical piano education began with easy pieces but I was quickly swept into the Australian Music Examination Board exams. Preparing for a theory or pianoforte exam was like playing a competitive individual sport and involved daily practice for the final that was scheduled for later in the year. Each Wednesday after school I would attend theory lessons with all the other music students in a room at the convent. On two other days, a morning before school and an afternoon, I would attend individual lessons. Mother Patricia would choose the piano pieces she thought I would enjoy and we would begin to discover the techniques and dynamics of each piece. Beginning with the right hand, progressing to the left hand, before two hands played together took

¹ ABC radio music programmes for schools, such as, “Let’s Hear the Music”, were fundamental to Australian state education.
weeks of practice as did memorising and transposing songs from one key to another. Over the years, I developed an appreciation for the enormity of my father’s generosity and imagination, and the world of global music the nuns had opened up for me.

In my fictional work, Impromptu I—X and in this dissertation, I investigate the relationship between music and literature, and the role of music in narrative fiction. I ask, how can reading a work from the perspective of music enhance our understanding and interpretation of a text? These are the questions around which my thesis is organised. Within this paradigm, my thesis concerns how novelists Toni Morrison, David Mitchell and Tim Winton draw on music as practice, discourse, and form in their respective narratives: Beloved (1987), Cloud Atlas (2004), and Dirt Music (2001). In spite of critical attention each of these novels has received, they have seldom been discussed with regard to the power of music, and its explicit and implicit techniques and effects—such as form and genre, voice and expression, thematic progression, tonality and pitch, rhythm and repetition.

In order to explore the questions motivating this dissertation, I provide below a brief overview of the historical relationship between music and literature, and the evolutionary domains of music and literature in the Western tradition that have given rise to the rich, symbiotic relationship they share. In my analysis, I have drawn on Eric Prieto’s interpretations of the historical explanations of music and literature, and his translations of Rousseau’s and Mallarme’s theoretical writings from French to English. Prieto suggests an interdisciplinary project would be incomplete without an understanding of the historical relationship between music and literature (2002a, xi-xii).

---

2 In non-Western oral cultures and Western cultures with strong oral traditions, music and literature, the practical arts are considered united in word, dance, visual arts, and performance (Prieto 2002a, 1).
Music and literature

In Western culture, we can trace the historical relationship between the domains of music and literature from Homer (c900-800BC). Homeric epics performed as song or chant, through rhythm, rhyme and repetition of collective memories and cultural myths, stand as oral recordings of an ancient poetic communication between music, language and performance. But music understood as a metaphor could not have become available to literature if this connection between music and words established in song had not begun to disintegrate in fourth-century Athens with the advent of writing (Prieto 2002a, 1-2). From this time, music and literature emerged as more specialised arts, independent of each other. Literature became a written practice and began to lose its (oral) voice while instrumental music without semantic clues became a non-representational art work until the medieval period.3

Early Church music of the medieval period (500AD-1400AD), included sacred texts set to a melody and sung by a soloist or unison choir without accompaniment, whilst music theory was not limited to sounds and included Pythagoras’s mathematical ratios (Ulrich and Pisk 1963, 16, 26, 28-9; Prieto 2002a, 4).4 Following the development of a single melodic monophonic style (700-800 AD), where new material is inserted within the song (plainchant), the rise of polyphony between 900-1200 AD, as we know from music history, incorporated additional vocal lines above or below the single melody (Ulrich and Pisk 1963, 56). The polyphonic lines sung as counterpoint (part-singing), where voices and instruments are harmonically interconnected, yet independent in

---

3 It was not until the ninth century that mnemonic devices written as “‘Catalonian’ neumes” were used in Gregorian chant as melodic contours (Mundó 2007, 15).
4 Besides sacred music in the medieval era, there was a variety of folk ballads performed by minstrels (Kamien 2002, 71-2).
rhythm and melodic scope, caused confusion in the listeners and the number of vocal lines were gradually reduced and replaced by musical instruments.  

During the Renaissance (1450-1600), Aristotle’s Poetics, from c335BC, were rediscovered, and initiated a discussion about it amongst Italian literary critics (Javitch 1999, 54). Whilst the Poetics concerns tragedy, Aristotle makes it explicit that “as a painting imitates objects and narrative imitates action, music involves the imitation of ‘character, emotion and action’” (Aristotle in Prieto 2002a, 4). With Aristotle’s poetics thus in vogue, the Italian composers, led by Monteverdi (1607), were seeking a return to the monadic vocal style of composition (as a reaction to polyphony), where a song is characterised by recitative, forging a new link between “music, poetry and drama” (Prieto 2002a, 4).  

This monadic idea of music and writing, precipitated the birth of opera. In the operas of the Baroque era, music had a special relationship with word, as Monteverdi (1607) announces: “let the word be the master not the servant of the music” and reiterated in recent times by musician and conductor William Christie: “Great music, grows out of language” (Christie in Jampol 2010, 45). Simultaneously, the Pléiade poets in France, including Pierre de Ronsard (1565) and Jean-Antoine de Baïf (1573), were reforging the connections between literature and music along classical lines, where lyrical language and music were fused in rhythm to form “linear melodic music” (Thomas 2006, 21). While Ronsard insisted on the importance of having some of his poems set to music (Prieto 2002a, 7), de Baïf attempted to re-create the classical Greek mousiké of sung verse composed and performed by poets (Thomas 2006, 20-1).  

---  

5 Church authorities were concerned about polyphony as they thought sacred texts were being overpowered by multi-part and “decadent music” (Benson 2006, 86).  
6 Recitative is a song that adopts the rhythms of ordinary speech.  
7 The French Pléiade poets imitated the Greek and Roman poetic styles of the original Alexandrian Greek poets (285-46 BC), a group of seven, and named after the Pléiade star cluster www.pleiade.org/pleiades_04.html.
During the late sixteenth, seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, music and literature were considered “intimately related” (Thomas 2006, 16). This idea gave rise to what John Neubauer (1988) calls the “verbal paradigm” which was considered by music theorists, such as Spanish Jesuit and musicologist Antonio Eximeno (1796), as the predominant treatise on music of the eighteenth century (Thomas 2006, 16).

However, since the late eighteenth century, Western classical music has been and is still considered by some musicologists as “autonomous”: bereft of meaning and theorised according to its internal mathematical patterns and form (Thomas 2006, 6; Cook and Everist 2001, v-xii; McClary 1987, 14; 2000, 2). Yet, this notion of music is at odds with what Eximeno had intimated a century earlier. Music, he suggests, is not connected to language through “musical mathematics”; rather a “verbal paradigm intergrate[s] music into the network of meanings, into the signifying practices that make up culture” (Eximeno in Thomas 2006, 16). Such a concept initiates the potential of a musical language and a means to communicate ideas and emotions giving music a distinct “role in culture” (Thomas 2006, 17).

Thus, the relationship between music and literature continued to occupy literary critics and philosophers, including the philosopher/composer Jean-Jacques Rousseau (1712-1778) who located the “origin of language in song” (Prieto 2002a, 5). The key to Rousseau’s artistic theory is the term “musical expression” in which expression is implied as imitative (Rousseau translated by Prieto 2002a, 5). His theory was the precursor to the Romantic era of the nineteenth century when composers, such as Franz Liszt (1848-58) and Richard Strauss (1886-1915) looked to literature for music models, such as the tone poem, and writers, such as James Joyce (1922) and Virginia

---

8 This understanding of cultural practice introduced music to the plausibility of a semiotics (Thomas 2006, 16). Julia Kristeva (1989) and Emile Benveniste (1974) consider music as a code in their respective theories of semiotics.
Woolf looked to music to inform their writing of literature (Luening 1980, 192-4, 197-8; Prieto 2002a, 5).⁹

Over the centuries, opera maintained the strongest link between music and literature. With its increasing popularity in early nineteenth-century society and culture, opera necessitated a specialist approach to its spectacular extravaganzas: composers wrote the music, librettists arranged the lyrics, while choreographers, stage and costume designers were integrated where and when necessary (Prieto 2002a, 6). Such specialisation spurred the composer and reformer Richard Wagner (1849) into a counter-activity. Reverting to earlier practices, he sought to model his operatic spectacles on the Greek mousiké by reuniting the features of poetry, music, drama and dance in “love for one another; when at last each art can only love itself when mirrored in the others; when at last they cease to be dissevered arts,—then will they all have power to create the perfect artwork” (Wagner 1895/1993, 155). Unlike his musical predecessors, novelist and essayist George Eliot suggests that Wagner’s operatic theory insisted that poetry, music and drama be given equal attention and without frivolous music lines to highlight a voice but “‘must be content with the degree of prominence which falls to them in strict consonance with true dramatic development and [format]’” (Eliot in da Sousa Correa 2003, 49).¹⁰ In Der Ring des Nibelungen/“The Ring of the Nieblungs” (1854-1874), Wagner extended soliloquy and repartee with true dramatic development, replacing “conventional arias” and limiting the choral section (Ulrich and Pisk 1963, 535).¹¹

⁹ In relation to “Sirens”, Joyce said, “I wrote this chapter with the technical resources of music” (Luening 1980, 185). Woolf’s short story, “A Simple Melody” (1925), epitomises her acute interest in music. ¹⁰ Eliot wrote one of the first treatise on Wagner’s music in English, “Liszt, Wagner and Weimar” (1855), in which she describes his art as an “organic evolutionary development” (da Sousa Correa 2003, 11). ¹¹ Friedrich Nietzsche (1956) was influenced by Schopenhauer’s writings and was initially captivated by Wagner’s music, as featured in The Birth of Tragedy (1872). However, in his later essay “Nietzsche
To achieve continuity and coherence in his new artworks Wagner incorporated two principal features: the leitmotif, or musical patterns which attached a theme or emotion to an individual, such as interwoven musical memories repeated with difference at each successive entrance, and operatic form (Mahaffey 2013, 38). It is not surprising therefore, that mid-to late-nineteenth-century French poets Charles Baudelaire (1845) and Stéphane Mallarmé (1876) focussed on Wagner’s idea of musical design and the “totalizing vision that characterized Wagner’s theory of the ‘art work of the future’” (Prieto 2002a, 7). Wagner’s use of the leitmotif, as a short, fragmented and repetitive phrase, was heard by French novelist Édouard Dujardin (1888) as:

the life of the soul expressed through the incessant eruption of musical motifs ... one after the other, undefined and in succession, the ‘states’ of thought, feelings and impressions brought into existence ... no longer in logical order (Dujardin in Mahaffey 2013, 38).

Another influential nineteenth-century turn on music and literature arose with the Symbolist poets. In particular, Mallarmé’s innovations in language and writing have been critical to contemporary interdisciplinary studies of music and literature. Mallarmé was dedicated to language, and he resented the widely held value afforded “absolute music” (Smyth 2008, 34). Unlike the sixteenth-century French poet, Ronsard, Mallarmé did not seek a reconnection with the Greek classical idea of music and literature, and argued that the inherent link between music and literature had little to do with the Greek concept of oral performance but was constituted by the embodied “metaphorical voice that Mallarmé calls ‘l’idée’” (Prieto 2002a, 7-8). “The Idea” referred to how music became more available as a metaphor that incorporated

Contra Wagner” (1888-9) and The Case of Wagner (1888), he argues that Wagner’s music is inspired by theatrical gestures and posturing.
thought—not as voice or performance, tone or rhythm—but as a “semantic autonomy”, that is, without reducing thought to the “denotation of words” (Prieto 2002a, 8-10).

This characterisation of Symbolist thought deeply motivated Dujardin, who was already captivated by Wagner’s music. Dujardin’s novel, Les Lauriers Sont Coupés (1888), is widely credited as the first interior-monologue novel (Mahaffey 2013, 39). This writing style which depicts a character’s thoughts as overheard in the mind profoundly influenced modernist novelists writing narratives on memory or characters’ inner lives, for example, Marcel Proust’s In Search of Lost Time (1913-27), James Joyce’s Ulysses (1922) and Virginia Woolf’s Mrs Dalloway (1925).

In the contemporary period, music has been integrated into fiction in numerous ways (Smyth 2008, 1). In this thesis, I argue that the three novels I have analysed by Morrison, Mitchell and Winton, all novels influenced by the postmodern era, signify music as expressive political power and symbolic meaning, form and style, practice and technique. Thus reading representations of music in fiction, “becomes part of an empowered interdisciplinary practice” (Benson 2006, 4). As straightforward as this seems, this idea was not entertained in literary criticism until the last two decades of the twentieth century, when a shift in the meaning of musicology, as the study of predominantly Western classical music, shifted from a focus on the internal relationships and patterns of music to one of the historical and cultural perspectives. I begin the next section with a brief overview of musicology and literary criticism and the theorists who have influenced my analysis of the three works of fiction.
Musicology and literary criticism

In its present form, musicology is the study of music that essentially investigates Western art (classical) music embedded in both “the modern university and the high culture of a great civilization” (Kramer 2011, 278). Benjamin Breuer (2011) explains that modern musicology was pioneered in Western culture during the late nineteenth century by Guido Adler (1885) as a “codified”, “scientific method”, and that it became a scholarly concern between 1860s and the First World War (Breuer 2011, iv).\(^1\) The shift in musicology during the 1980s resulted in musicology becoming more attentive to literary theory and resulted in a rupture between systemic (scientific) musicologists, such as David Huron (1999), Henkjan Honing (2011), V. Kofu Agawu (1991), and cultural musicologists, such as Lawrence Kramer (1990), Rose Rosengard Subotnik (1991), and Susan McClary (1991), who saw the need to study music in its socio-political, historical and cultural contexts.\(^2\) Theorists such as Kramer and McClary challenge the view of classical music as expressive and divinely inspired, and “independent of language”, wordless about the evolution of society and culture (2011, 280; 1991, ix-xi).\(^3\) “Music”, Stephen Benson writes, “needed to be put back into the world in which it is made, performed, received and evaluated” (2006, 3).

The transition towards a focus on art’s cultural embeddedness in musicology had already been achieved in literary criticism. But like musicology, traditional literary criticism of the nineteenth-century concerned the rise of the “aesthetic experience”,

---

\(^1\) Since the ancient Greeks, Western music theory has wavered between the sciences and mathematics and the arts (McClary 1985, 150).

\(^2\) Scientific musicology is primarily empirical and data-oriented and involves the study of “acoustics, physiology, neuroscience”, for example, whereas humanities systemic musicology (cultural musicology) includes “philosophical aesthetics, theoretical sociology, semiotics, hermeneutics, cultural and gender studies” (Parncutt 2007, 1).

\(^3\) Over the last twenty years the shift is no longer controversial but it is still significant (Kramer 2011, 20). Kramer, McClary (1991), Subotnik (1991), Richard Leppert (1987), and others, opened the field of musicology to new interpretations that analyse its communal and affective qualities (Thomas 2006, 3).
the “symbol” and the view of literature as an object of study (Eagleton 1983, 21). The separation of literature from ordinary social life supported the view of art as an “end in itself”. With the decline in religion in the late nineteenth-century, English literary criticism and aesthetic theory emerged as an attempt to alleviate the loss of “affective values and basic mythologies by which a socially turbulent class-society can be welded together” (Eagleton 1983, 23-24).

**Key theorists**

Prieto suggests that when novelists turn to music they “tend to see in it a source of models for re-thinking the plot-based forms that have traditionally governed the novel” (2002a, 59). He explains that music understood as a metaphor in the novel can inform the psychological (interior monologue) through “cultural conventions (anthropology), of semiosis (structuralist linguistics), of the unconscious (psychoanalysis), of ideology and entrenched power structures” (2002a, 61). Prieto’s musico-literary analysis is influenced by Nelson Goodman’s *Languages of Art: An Approach To A Theory of Symbols* (1976) which argues that “the disclosure of certain special features of the functioning symbols … takes effect only through application of a general symbol” (Goodman 1976, 169). Prieto, therefore, does not focus on “direct comparisons between musical and literary works” (2002a, xi); rather, he looks for general conventions shared by both literature and music categorised by Goodman as “denotation”, “exemplification”, and “expression” (2002a, xi). In similar terms, I have analysed my three novels according to the formal analogies between narrative text and music and explicit references to music in the text.
Fuelling my thesis including its creative and theoretical discourse is Kramer’s suggestion that the interpretations of music and language are open to all “resources of knowledge” where “signs are indispensable but ... not determinative” (2011, 21). “Musical meaning”, according to Kramer, is neither inherent in the object of interpretation nor constructed as the meaning “encoded in the object” but in determining “their relationship” (2011, 21). Therefore, reading music in the novel can depend on prior knowledge of both music and language practices and this knowledge can demonstrate a change of social and cultural contexts in the novel.

McClary, focuses on the socio-political context of music, including feminism, gender and sexuality, in contemporary popular and classical music (1991, xi). She argues that music styles are indicative of changes in social values and are fundamentally “a human, socially grounded, socially alterable construct” (1987, 15). McClary is influenced by Theodore Adorno’s and Jacques Attali’s insights that reject the history of music “as a flat, autonomous chronological record” and that “understanding musical culture of the past [is] a way of grasping social practices of the present and future” (1985, 153).

I am influenced by McClary’s approach to analysis, and pay attention to the reciprocal and interactive impact of music in society and culture. Such articulations, are influenced by the historical transformation of sound and digital technology that have eliminated the “purely musical” concept of music as meaningless and detached from life and culture (Kramer 2011, 20; Thomas 2006, 12-13). This reorientation, which embeds music in cultural practice, emotive experiences and sensory expression applies to all kinds of music, both classical and popular.

---

15 Prieto suggests that McClary, on occasions, submits her music analysis to popular culture’s fashionable issues (2002a, 280).
Western and non-Western. Hence, I follow Benson’s example of a close reading of the verbal (metaphorical) music in the novel.

Benson however, limits his analysis to classical and romantic music in literary texts, whereas cultural historian Gerry Smyth’s investigation includes various music styles and literary genres, as does the work in this thesis. Benson makes no apology for his method of analysing music in literature that features a particular classical musicological element, such as, “performance”, “form”, or “voice”. (2006, 7). Smyth’s approach to analysis (2008, 7-8) takes up Benson’s close reading of music references in fiction, but includes both popular and classical music genres. Smyth’s method, which has been useful to this dissertation is supported by the work of literary theorist Frédérique Arroyas (2000), who explains that when music is perceived to be present in the novel or is recognised as an influence on the author, the reader may engage in a musical literary analysis, relying on acts of comparison and affinity, using elements from the domains of both language and music (2000, 84-5).

I aim to utilise an array of interpretative strategies; knowledge of musical theory, close reading, and, after Kramer, the “cued and uncued” references to music in “a full, open engagement with music as lived experience, experience rendered vivid and vivified by a host of overlapping cultural associations” (2003, 134).

Music in practice and the selection of texts

In the chapters that follow, I offer ways of reading music in three works of contemporary fiction. In Chapter One, Morrison’s critically acclaimed fifth novel, Beloved (1987) takes the form of a slave narrative set in Cincinnati in 1873. I read Beloved in terms of its techno-auditory aspects, interpreting the novel as a
contemporary remix of the African-American woman Margaret Garner’s nineteenth-century slave experience. I draw on the concept and practice of remix to understand Morrison’s engagement with Garner’s story, and to locate it within the culture and history of black experience and music. In developing my argument, I show how the novel tells the usually unspoken thoughts of slaves, omitted in the original slave narratives. I argue that these stories are heard, recorded and replayed in ways that are similar to those practised in contemporary popular audio culture, which is attentive to sound, listening and sound recording, playback and transmission. In particular, I argue that the mix of dialogues, interior monologues and stream-of-consciousness writing enables the narrator to perform like a DJ, in sampling, manipulating, looping and reconfiguring the apparently seamless flow of memories that transform the lives of the characters, and render the reader a witness to the emergent stories. To my knowledge, no other critic has offered this kind of reading of *Beloved*.

*Cloud Atlas* (2004) comprises six separate novellas and each is written in a different genre: journal, letters, crime novel, unpublished manuscript, interview transcript and oral reminiscence, and each is of approximately equal length. Situated in different historical periods and geographical contexts, the novellas are subtle yet complex hybrid texts. The overlapping stories cover the period from the nineteenth century in the Pacific Rim to the twenty-fourth century in a post-cataclysmic Hawaiian-like dystopia. In this respect *Cloud Atlas*’s formal structure resembles a Western art music sextet, structured like a music scale with each note-like novella setting up its own harmonic history. In Chapter Two I show how music informs its first novella, “The Pacific Journal of Adam Ewing”. Music is a supplement to the narrative of Adam Ewing, its protagonist, and it works as a means of signifying and underscoring the radically
different relations of power, which variously trouble him on his travels. Following Kramer’s reflections on musical narratology, I aim to demonstrate how the novella draws attention to musical sounds, form and practice in representing the stories of oppressed and marginalised groups. In my analysis I refer to Western art music, non-Western music and musical experiences to explore the role of music in relation to different social, cultural and geographical contexts. The chapter demonstrates that Mitchell’s comprehensive understanding of Western art music’s syntax and language, his knowledge of music and literature and their developing histories enable him to compose an exquisite and original literary music novel that draws attention to social injustice and greed inherent in humanity. Besides Smyth’s brief analysis of music form in *Cloud Atlas* (2008, 54-8), no other musico-literary analysis of the novel exists at the time of writing this thesis.16

In the first book-length critical study of Winton’s oeuvre, Salhia Ben-Messahel acknowledges that *Dirt Music*’s story “arises from the music of the land and is a symphony on the theme of Western Australia” (2006, 12), but Ben-Messahel provides little discussion of the role of music in the text.17 I take up Ben-Messahel’s challenge in Chapter Three which is organised around the musical form of the sonata. Winton’s novel, *Dirt Music* (2001) draws on country blues to depict a critical period in the socio-political and cultural life of Australia during the 1990s. I read *Dirt Music*’s narrative through the sonata form, showing how this form interacts with the novel’s thematic content. My analysis examines how sonata form ruptures the linear progression of *Dirt Music*, and motivates the reader to make connections between, and create meaning in

---

16 In addition to my own research, Sarah Dillon, lecturer at The University of St Andrews, Fife, Scotland, and the editor of the first collection of critical essays on David Mitchell’s oeuvre (2011), wrote an email dated 6th June, 2012, saying that she did not know of anyone working on music in the novel, *Cloud Atlas*.

17 In *Tim Winton: Critical Essays* (2014), edited by McCredden and O’Reilly and published by UWAP, the usual themes of love, death, water and landscapes are present, but the theme of music is absent.
relation to, fragmented sections of the narrative. The sonata form is a three-part (ternary) thematic plan that refers to the structure of the exposition, its development and recapitulation with a two part (binary) harmonic outline. Using music to lure, communicate, love and heal tensions in Australia’s past, the words in the title Dirt Music, come to comment on the underlying structure of the novel and the cultural work it performs.

In my conclusion, I discuss how a musico-literary approach to reading/writing music in literary fiction might be particularly valuable in the contemporary context as we live in an overwhelmingly visual culture. I suggest that sharpening our auditory senses, can help us to be more attentive to the power and significance of human expression and experience. In the novel, music in all its forms, can encourage the reader to listen, understand and respond imaginatively to problems of communication in the contemporary world.
Chapter One

Beloved: A Sound Remix

Introduction

Toni Morrison’s critically acclaimed fifth novel Beloved (1987) takes the form of a slave narrative set in Cincinnati in 1873.\(^1\) Morrison’s inventive reimagining of slave experience is important in terms of addressing how African-American histories have been subverted, dislocated, silenced and forgotten by predominantly white political and cultural narrations (Stepto 1991, 6-11).\(^2\) In this chapter, I read Beloved in terms of its techno-auditory relationships, interpreting the novel as a contemporary remix of the African-American Margaret Garner’s nineteenth-century experience as a slave. The fugitive slave mother Garner came to fame in 1856 when her escape from her slave master in Kentucky was thwarted in Cincinnati, Ohio, and during national discussions on fugitive slave cases. Rather than return to slavery Garner murdered her infant daughter and attempted to kill her other three children and herself (Reinhardt 2010, ix).\(^3\) It is relevant to my analysis that Morrison wrote Beloved during the mid-1980s, just as hip hop culture was changing the face of American popular music and influencing youth culture. This period has been described as one of the most innovative in terms of sound and rhythm technologies (Weheliye 2005, 2-4). Before writing Beloved, Morrison said, in an interview with Kay Bonetti:

\(^1\) Future references to Beloved are from the 1997 Vintage edition and will be cited parenthetically.
\(^2\) Stepto identifies three modes of slave narratives: eclectic, integrated and generic (autobiography) or authenticating (novel or historiography) with each having differing literary features (1991, 5-6).
\(^3\) Morrison first accessed Garner’s story when she was editing The Black Book (1974), for Random House. Morrison’s sole source was a nineteenth century journal article citing the “important things” but she neither actively researched Garner’s story, nor is Beloved a fictionalised account of Garner’s story. Rather, Morrison used her imagination to convert her one source into an innovative novel (Reinhardt 2010, x; Weisenburger 1998, 10).
I wanted ... the books to have an effortless and an artlessness, and a non-book quality, so that they would have a sound ... And the closest I came, I think, to finding it was in some books written by Africans, novels that were loose ... the kind that people could call unstructured because they were circular, and because they sounded like somebody was telling you a story. Yet you knew it was nothing simple, as simple as that — it was intricate ... I wanted the sound to be something I felt was spoken and more oral and less printed (Bonetti in Hall 1994, 89).

I draw on the concept and practice of remix to understand Morrison’s engagement with Garner’s story, and to locate it within the culture and history of black experience and music. It is not my intention to universalise black experience but to show and suggest how the novel remixes and samples Garner’s slave experience. In developing my argument, I draw attention to pertinent differences between African, African-American and European music cultures (broadly conceived) to show how remix does not privilege a specific music culture but crosses cultures and musical styles. I argue that Beloved’s stories are heard, recorded and re-played in ways that are similar to those practised in popular audio culture, that is, the stories are attentive to sound, listening, “and the creative possibilities of sound recording, playback and transmission” (Cox and Warner 2009, xiii). In particular, I argue that the mix of dialogues, interior monologues and stream-of-consciousness writing in the novel enables the narrator to perform like a DJ, in sampling, manipulating, looping and reconfiguring the flow of memories that transform the lives of the slave characters, and render the reader an earwitness to these emergent stories. In doing so I have drawn on the work of critics such as Paul D. Miller, an academic, literary critic, novelist and hip hop musician, who

---

4 The original slave narrative, Stepto argues, attempts to “authenticate the former slave’s account”, and is heard as a dialogue of various texts and voices that include white-authored texts by abolitionists (so it becomes an eclectic narrative). A significant issue is white America’s acceptance of the slave’s literacy and the endorsement of abolitionists typically occurs in an introduction or preface to the slave narrative which effectively silences the slave’s voice (1991, 8-9).

5 Audio culture includes all archival sources and is attentive to sound, including the art of listening (Cox and Warner 2009, xiii).
is more widely known by his stage name, DJ Spooky: The Subliminal Kid. Miller identifies stream of consciousness writing in literature as the methodology used to assemble a mix where differences in time, place and culture are collapsed to create a recombinant text. In this writing, a narrator selects and guides the flow of information in a text and is, therefore, comparative to a DJ who mixes and remixes information from music samples as a protector of black aural tradition (Miller 2009, 351). To my knowledge, no critics have offered this kind of aural reading of Beloved.⁶

In Beloved, the pre-existing historical archive of the slaves’ fractured and marginalised narratives re-emerge as a positive power through the imagined memories that are re-presented and relocated in the novel’s social and cultural contexts. Morrison said that her aim in Beloved was to transform her characters from “the historical into the personal … from the page into the imagination” (Andrews and McKay 1999, 11). Related to this re-presentation, and a significant feature of the novel, is that the language of the novel is perpetually interrupted. Thereby, sentences are often disjointed as the sampled information is re-played then improvised by the narrator. Improvisation is recognised as an important feature of African and African-American music cultures and its core criteria and codes are said to be similar to speech acts that rely on pre-existing material (Small 1998, 27). Through improvisation, the narrator provides the reader with a new sense of history based on the “rememories” (36) of the thoughts and feelings omitted in the original slave narratives.

“Rememories” is a term Morrison uses in Beloved for a memory of a place, or an institution-like slavery, a memory which exists even if the place or institution seems to be forgotten, or is destroyed (36). In this sense, Beloved parallels the original African-

⁶ Weheliye (2005) also offers new insights and modes in understanding sonic Afro-Modernity from a techno-auditory position.
American slave narratives, but addresses their implicit and unsayable trauma, through both poetics and, I argue, music.

Confirming the important relationship of music to her writing, in an interview with literary critic and author Nellie Y. McKay, Morrison confirms that her writing style was “not like James Joyce … not like Thomas Hardy … not like Faulkner … [but] like something that has probably only been fully expressed perhaps in music” (Morrison in McKay 1994, 152; italics in original). Morrison says of the importance of re-interpreting the past: “I know I can’t change the future but I can change the past. It is the past not the future, which is infinite. Our past was appropriated. I am one of the people who has to reappropriate it” (Morrison in Taylor-Guthrie 1994, xiii-xiv).

Beloved is a complex novel that addresses the terrible practice of slavery through the depiction of individual and marginalised characters who vocalise their experience of historic events so that they may reshape their world. Such events include the Middle Passage, which refers to the Atlantic slave trade to the New World and The Fugitive Slave Law of 1850, which decreed the fate of slaves recaptured in free states in the USA.

That Morrison’s writerly use of innovative blues modes and jazz techniques draws attention to socio-political and historical issues has been well-documented (Eckstein 2006, 271-283; Rice 2000, 153-180; Reed 2007, 55-71; Kitts 2006, 495-523; Fallon 2006, 524-541; Kodat 2008, 159-171; Rodrigues 1991, 733-54; and Morgan 2008). Clearly, Beloved cuts across a range of eclectic music genres as the novel references spiritual, blues, jazz, operatic, classical and ballad samples (a fragment of information, a sound, or rhythm selected for the remix). Morrison herself argues that this is most

---

7 Cary Nelson makes the point that literary history recovery is not an “innocent process”, as cultural and psychological episodes must be revised and rewritten (Stepto 1991, x).
appropriate as “Black Americans were sustained and healed and nurtured by the translation of their experience into ... music” (Morrison in Cox and Warner 2009, 351). Unlike Morrison’s novel Jazz (1992), the role of music in Beloved has seldom been discussed, in spite of the novel having attracted prolific scholarly attention.⁸

Literary theorist Alexander Weheliye suggests that while contemporary criticism of major black writers, such as Morrison, discusses blues music and the oral tradition, it tends to be limited in scope and neglects sound technology as a new contribution to the field (2005, 6). The importance of sound technology in reading Beloved, I argue, lies in what Miller refers to as sound technologies’ tendency to fragmentation: “Each and every source sample is fragmented and bereft of prior meaning—kind of like a future without a past. The samples are given meaning only when re-presented in the assemblage of the mix” (2009, 349-50). Miller’s description fits Beloved, where each memory leads to another memory, creating a deep sense of continuity in the slaves’ voices as each sound loop is altered, remixed and represented.

In her essay “Memory, Creation and Writing” (1984), Morrison explains that her intent in writing is not to make the reader comfortable but uneasy, compelling the reader to actively respond to the text as if there were an illiterate or pre-reader: “on creating this discomfort and unease in order to insist that the reader rely on another body of knowledge”(Morrison 1984, 387). Beloved’s narrator, like a DJ, is not merely an artist but a dispenser of material from various “temporal, spatial and cultural locations” (Miller 2009, 348). Audio culture, therefore, offers the possibility of a new reading of Beloved, drawing on the slave experience as a mix where the creator and re-mixer (author and narrator) are linked together by a variety of historical, cultural and

⁸ Eckstein (2006), identifies music references as substantive in Beloved and expresses his surprise at the lack of critical engagement with its musical scope.
sound materials creating a flawless web that “mirrors the modern macrocosm of cyberspace where different voices and visions constantly collide and cross fertilize one another. The linkage between memory, time, and place, are all externalized and made accessible to the listener from the viewpoint of the DJ who makes the mix” (Miller 2009, 351). Thus, the mix that informs Beloved can be said to transform its original source and rewrite its own history.

Retelling slave narratives: the story of Margaret Garner

It is on the historical record that in late January 1856, the Ohio River froze, and encouraged by the unusual weather conditions, groups of slaves in neighbouring parts of Kentucky hatched a plan to escape across the river from Covington, Kentucky to Cincinnati, Ohio, a free state. Margaret Garner and her husband Robert, their four children, along with Robert’s parents, Simon and Mary, stole two horses and a sleigh from their slave master. They then crossed the frozen river on foot. In Ohio, the slaves separated into smaller groups to avoid the suspicion of local residents. Eventually, the Garners reached a safe house run by a free slave named Kite, a relative of Margaret Garner’s who had been bought out of slavery by his father. On the outskirts of Cincinnati, the house was on the river road, near Mill Creek Bridge. Later that day, Kite sought advice from Levi Coffin, a well-known Underground Railroad worker, to help arrange the Garners’ escape route north.

---

9 I have used a number of written representations to access Margaret Garner’s story including Bassett (1856) in Reinhardt 2010, May (1856) in Andrews and McKay (1999), Reinhardt (2010) and Weisenburger (1998). Reinhardt draws on commentary for his book from New York, Cincinnati and Kentucky newspapers, speeches, interviews and sermons of the time.

10 Some critics name Margaret Garner’s husband Simon Jr., while other commentators call him Robert. I name him Robert following Reinhardt and Weisenburger (Reinhardt 2010, 9; Weisenburger 1998, 34-5).

11 I use capital letters for Underground Railroad following the example of Beloved. The Underground Railroad was an organisation where fugitive slaves were helped by “conductors” who led them on a path...
Meanwhile, in Kentucky, the slaves’ escape had not gone unnoticed, and by the time Kite returned to his house, it was surrounded by the Garners’ slave master, a US deputy Marshall, an Ohio sheriff and posse. A large, silent crowd of onlookers gathered outside the house as the fugitive slaves barricaded themselves inside, armed with a firearm and batons (May 1856/1999, 26). The sheriff’s men stormed the house, but the ensuing fight was short-lived. Once inside, the officers discovered an infant girl, the Garner’s daughter, bleeding to death. Her throat had been slit and she was bleeding profusely (May 1856/1999, 26; Reinhardt 2010, 5). Screams from another room diverted the officers’ attention away from the Garners’ child, to an adjoining room where they found a pregnant Margaret Garner standing over her two young boys and a baby girl, brandishing a bloodied knife. The boys had been cut across the head and the baby had a large lump on her forehead, but was not seriously wounded. Garner vowed to the authorities that she would kill all four children and herself rather than endure a life of slavery (Reinhardt 2010, 5; Bassett 1856/2010, 215).

Under heavy guard, the runaway slaves were imprisoned in a Cincinnati jail while a US marshal and county sheriff argued over who had official authority over them. Historians are divided as to whether the local community supported the slaves (May 1856/1999, 26). The case was extensively reported in Cincinnati newspapers (May 1856/1999, 26-33; Reinhardt 2010, 177-209), which described Robert, the husband as

---

12 Simon, Mary and Robert were the property of Mr James Marshall and Margaret was owned by John P. Gaines. Archibald K. Gaines, returning to Kentucky from Arkansas, bought Margaret and her four children from his oldest brother, John. Marshall and Gaines owned plantations in close proximity to each other (Reinhardt 2010, 10-11).

13 Reinhardt and Weisenburger confirm that at the time of Garner’s escape and trial, she was pregnant with her fifth child (Reinhardt 2010, 11, 14, 289 n. 22; Weisenburger 1998, 126).

14 May suggests that the local community made “no active desire to effect a rescue” (1856/1999, 26). Reinhardt indicates that there was support for the slaves from an intimidating multiracial group (2010, 6-7).
pleasant-looking and reliable, and Garner as intelligent and articulate (May 1856/1999, 26, 28). At this time, however, debate was raging over the Fugitive Slave Law (1850), which stipulated that it was a crime to assist runaway slaves, and that slaves, re-captured in free states, must be returned to their slave masters.15

At the heart of the Garner case rested an interpretation of slaves as either legal “property”, or “persons”. The Fugitive Slave Law excluded slaves from speaking for themselves as they “could only be known through their slave masters”, thus denying the slaves the right of testifying to their own advantage (Miller 1996, 256). As Franny Nudelman (1992) indicates, a fugitive slave could, however, approach a journalist or white abolitionist lawyer. Garner’s case became a focus for the notable anti-slavery lawyer, John Jolliffe, to argue that the Fugitive Slave Law was unconstitutional. This was part of an attempt to have Garner charged with murder implying recognition by society. It was through the media, therefore, rather than through the legal process, that a slave had the freedom to “speak the unspeakable” (Nudelman 1992, 947).

Abolitionist, orator, and proto-feminist Lucy Stone described Garner in the newspapers at this time as a “quintessential American hero”, likening her to the Americans who died at the hands of the British during the War of Independence (Rushdy 1999, 43). Another contemporary commentator, Rev. P.C. Bassett, after visiting Garner in prison, reported that she was not mad, but cool-headed, and very intelligent. He confirmed that she had decided to kill her children to protect them from slavery (Plasa 1998, 40; Reinhardt 2010, 215).

The court hearing found that Mary Garner, Garner’s mother-in-law—herself a mother of eight—did not assist Garner, but neither condemned nor approved her

15 Under a federal warrant issued by the authority of a US Marshall the Garner’s were taken into custody at the request of Margaret Garner’s slave owner, Archibald Gaines (May 1856/1999, 25; Reinhardt 2010, 23-8).
actions (Reinhardt 2010, 8, 216).\textsuperscript{16} The men, Robert and Simon, however, were charged with being accessories to the murder and found guilty. Both men declared to the jury that they would rather hang than return to slavery. As the Fugitive Slave Law stated that slaves were the property of their slave masters, they were returned to them.

The Garners’ case inspired furious debate and became the longest fugitive slave trial in American history. Although the Fugitive Slave Law denied runaway slaves the right to testify at their trials, Commissioner Pendery permitted Margaret Garner to tell of her excursions from Kentucky to the free state of Ohio, some years earlier, in the company of her slave master and his family (Reinhardt 2010, 64). Garner’s testimony was transcribed verbatim by a journalist from the \textit{Cincinnati Daily Gazette} (1856) and, according to Mark Reinhardt, this is the only record of Garner’s “unmediated” words (2010, 100). Excursions into free states, like Ohio, were significant as they provided slaves with exemption from the Fugitive Slave Law and led to immediate emancipation. The Garners’ lawyers argued that this was sufficient evidence to liberate the Garners and their children. However, the Fugitive Slave Law was found to take precedence as Margaret Garner did not refuse to return to Kentucky with her slave master’s family after the earlier excursion. On this basis, the court found she had voluntarily waived her right to freedom.

After the convoluted court case, Garner and her husband Robert returned to their slave masters.\textsuperscript{17} There is some conjecture regarding their fate, but it remains uncertain (Rushdy 1999, 44; Reinhardt 2010, 142). Garner’s slave experience was often revisited.

\textsuperscript{16} Bassett (1856/2010) records that Mary Garner shared the same cell with Margaret. His records show that Mary spent twenty years as a professor of religion, and he speaks with passion of her hope that death will liberate her from slavery (Reinhardt 2010, 12-3).

\textsuperscript{17} For a comprehensive reading of Garner’s case and the fugitive slave law, see Weisenburger (1998) and Reinhardt (2010).
in the ensuing years, including in 1857, when her story inspired many others including the ex-slave, activist and writer, Frederick Douglass’s speech on “philosophy of reform” which stated that the “progress for human liberty shows that all concessions yet made... have been born of earnest struggle” (Douglass in Reinhardt 2010, 225-7).¹⁸

Ultimately, however, Garner’s story was all but forgotten, until Beloved was published.¹⁹ Morrison has stated that her reason for replaying this slave narrative in Beloved was to address black readers who had “repressed, forgotten or ignored slave narratives, and not as an act to convince a white audience of the slave’s humanity” (Plasa 1998, 56).²⁰

The story of Beloved

The subjects of Beloved are the historical characters of the Garner family represented as Sethe (Margaret) and Halle Suggs (Robert); Denver and Beloved as Margaret Garner’s daughters, and Baby Suggs characterised as Garner’s mother-in-law, Mary. In Beloved, Halle is not able to escape Kentucky with Sethe, and is presumed dead. Morrison invents a representative for Halle as the slave Paul D Garner (referencing Margaret’s surname), who becomes Sethe’s lover. Morrison’s reimagining of Garners’ slave experience can be understood as a remix, in which the historical story is sampled and reconfigured. Circular in its logic, remix reinvents actual events rather than

---

¹⁸ Garner was well known in her lifetime, her story was repeated by nineteenth century poets, cartoonists, journalists. In 1868, a New York banker commissioned Thomas Satterwhite Noble to paint a portrait of Margaret Garner (Reinhardt 2010: 261-62). Douglass who attempted to escape slavery in 1835, taught himself to read and write, and wrote an autobiographical account of his ordeal, Narrative of the Life of Frederick Douglass, An American Slave, Written by Himself (1845/1991); he is one of the founding African-American literary figure (Stepto 1991, ix, 16-26).

¹⁹ Morrison’s text revitalised interest in Garner’s story and spawned numerous academic commentaries. Yanuck, J (1953) is said to be the most adept source on Garner before Beloved’s publication. (Davis 1981, 21; 29; 205; Gilroy 1993, 63–71; Middleton 1987, 20–32; Wolff 1991, 417–440). See Reinhardt (2010) and Weisenburger (1998) for thorough references of the case post-Beloved.

²⁰ A decade after the publication of Beloved, Toni Morrison remixed the text of Beloved in the libretto of Margaret Garner, an opera, which premiered at the Michigan Opera Theatre May 7, 2005.
negates them, these include: life on the plantation; a plan of escape; the Underground Railroad; the attempt to re-capture the fugitive slave mother and her children by the slave owner, a sheriff and posse; the baby’s murder; the effect of Fugitive Slave Law; the trial and newspaper reports; the slave mother’s personality; accounts of abolitionists’ protests and the reported behaviour of the local African-American community living in the town of Cincinnati. In addition, powerful scenarios introduce new material, such as, the haunting of 124, the house of refuge, by the murdered baby girl’s ghost, and an account of the Middle Passage.\textsuperscript{21}

\textit{Beloved} is set in Cincinnati in 1873, seven years after the Civil War. The novel is divided into three sections, and begins abruptly, in \textit{medias res}, usurping the traditional slave narrative form.\textsuperscript{22} According to literary theorist Carl Plasa, the conventional role of slave narratives, involved the slave testifying of their experience to persuade white people of their humanity: “This is my historical life—my singular, special example that is personal, but that also represent the race” and, “I write this text to persuade other people—you, the reader, who is probably not black—that we are human beings worthy of God’s grace and the immediate abandonment of slavery” (1998, 44).\textsuperscript{23} In \textit{Beloved}, starting the narrative in \textit{medias res} allows the DJ-like narrator to destabilise the conventional historical account by sampling events from the past to bring about an alternative outcome for the novel’s characters. I argue that this approach is consistent with audio culture where samples are meaningful only when re-presented in a new

\textsuperscript{21} Barbara Christian argues in her essay “Fixing Methodologies: Beloved” (1993), that few critics have discussed what she terms, “the ‘unspeakable event’: the Middle Passage” and she suggests Morrison uniquely accomplished this in \textit{Beloved}. Prior to the publication of \textit{Beloved} there was scant information on the Middle Passage (Christian 1993, 6; 1999, 204).

\textsuperscript{22} Morrison is committed to beginning her novels in \textit{medias res} and explains that the technique in \textit{Beloved} is “excessively demanding” as “the reader is snatched just as the slaves were from one place to another, from any place to another, without preparation and without defense” (Morrison 2000, 265).

\textsuperscript{23} For summaries of studies of the slave narrative literary conventions and textual politics, see Stepto 1991, 3-31; Hamilton 1996, 429-45; Starling 1988, 1-49; Sekora 1987, 482-515 and Olney 1985; 152-3.
mix, allowing time, place and memory to eclipse the original version’s elements (Miller 2009, 351-2).

In the novel, white abolitionists and “The Colored Ladies of Delaware” (183) are successful in keeping Sethe from hanging, after she murdered her baby. At the opening of the novel, it is 1873 and Sethe now lives with a surviving daughter, Denver (now a young woman of eighteen) at 124 Bluestone Road, Cincinnati.\(^{24}\) Sethe’s two sons, haunted by their mother’s murderous act and the presence of the spiteful unnamed baby ghost at the house, ran away as soon as each boy turned thirteen. This was just before Baby Suggs, Sethe’s mother-in-law, died. Baby Suggs—an unschooled preacher, had been bought out of slavery by Halle, her son. She lived at 124 until her death in 1864, the year before the end of the Civil War. Every Saturday afternoon in the Clearing, “a wide-open place cut deep in the woods” (87), Baby Suggs had conducted church services for the marginalised black community of Cincinnati through the spoken word of love and dance. After the murder of her granddaughter, by Sethe, Baby Suggs retired to her bed and died of a broken heart, “her great big old heart began to collapse” (89).

Paul D Garner, who had been Sethe’s fellow slave at Sweet Home, the Kentucky plantation, twenty years before, arrives unexpectedly at 124, after escaping from a chain gang. He is looking forward to finding work and to a reunion with Baby Suggs.\(^{25}\) The novel then cross-fades to tell the earlier story of the slaves on the Sweet Home

---

\(^{24}\) The house of refuge 124 is written in numerals in the way plantations were named (Morrison 2000, 265).

\(^{25}\) Baby Suggs had been living in 124 for eight years before Sethe’s arrival. Baby Suggs’s son, Halle, arranged her freedom and her whereabouts in Cincinnati was common knowledge amongst the slaves (Morrison 1997, 146, 177).
plantation owned by Mr Garner, a kindly slave owner and his wife Lillian. 26 When Mr Garner dies in dubious circumstances, Lillian employs a relative of her husband as Sweet Home administrator, a man named Schoolteacher. Schoolteacher is influenced by Darwinism, and he is cruel. The plantation becomes a site of trauma for the slaves, who soon planned their escape (197). The escapees included Sethe, Halle, Paul D, Paul A, and Sixo. The half-brothers Paul A, Paul D and Paul F (Paul F was sold to another plantation owner by Mrs Garner soon after Garner died to keep the plantation financially viable) are all called by their middle name, suggesting the slaves’ lack of individuality for their owners. Later when Sethe escapes, she has no idea of what happened to the other slaves. Paul A and Halle (we hear later in a dialogue between Sethe and Paul D) were caught and hung, and Sixo was incinerated (197-8). Paul D, was sold to another slave master, where he suffered humiliating imprisonment and torture. His memories, represented as unspeakable thoughts are sung in Beloved; he says to Sethe: “Sang it sometimes, but I never told a soul” (71).

On his arrival at 124, Paul D has no idea that Baby Suggs is dead, or whether Sethe’s escape was successful. He is also unaware of the murder and Sethe’s short imprisonment. Sethe informs him that Baby Suggs is dead, that her boys have run away, that the infant girl did not survive, that her pregnancy was successful and Denver is now a grown woman, and 124 is haunted by a baby ghost. When Paul D becomes Sethe’s lover, she invites him to stay at 124 for as long as he wants. But tensions rise between Paul D and Denver after Paul D exorcises the baby ghost from the house, only to have it return in the guise of a homeless young woman, who calls herself Beloved, the name Sethe had inscribed on the baby’s gravestone.

26 A cross fade is similar to a flashback as an audio editing device that makes a smooth transition between two different entities by foregrounding or backgrounding sounds, for example, the past and the present.
Paul D has seen numerous homeless women and children wandering the back streets, both pre-and post-Civil War. He does not notice Beloved’s devotion to Sethe and cannot understand why Beloved is forcing him out of the house. Paul D leaves 124 after an altercation with Sethe. At this juncture, Beloved gains control of the household and begins to psychologically torment Sethe and Denver, who come to believe that Beloved is the murdered baby. Both women become subordinate to Beloved’s wiles, until Denver recognises the danger of holding onto the past, and she takes action and restores order.

The samples of memories repeated in the characters’ dialogues and in their interior monologues create loops where the previously interior thoughts of the original story are still recognisable. For example, when Denver prepared to tell her birth story to Beloved:

She swallowed twice to prepare for the telling, to construct out of the strings she had heard all her life a net to hold Beloved ... Denver was seeing it now and feeling it—through Beloved. Feeling how it must have felt to her mother. Seeing how it must have looked. And the more fine points she made, the more detail she provided, the more Beloved liked it (76-8).

These loops generate personal narratives of the same events, such as Denver’s birth and the baby’s murder. The loops show how memories are shared, recorded, manipulated and transmitted by the narrator to talk over the original source. In the following sections I discuss remix technology, before comparing and contrasting relevant and crucial differences between African, African-American and European music cultures. I then show these influences in Beloved through an analysis of the novel’s use of remix.
Reading *Beloved* as remix technology

In remix culture everything old is made new again as sound loops are cut from sound archives using digital software. Both sampling and remix originate with the art form of US black radio identities of the 1940s and 1950s, who preceded the 1960s technical innovations of Jamaican sound system culture (Weheliye 2005, 87; Rose 1994, 34-41).

In the early 1970s, a number of Jamaican DJs, in particular, DJ Kool Herc, acknowledged as the originator of hip hop, arrived in America and influenced the early development of New York DJ’s hip hop culture (Weheliye 2005, 87-92; Hebdige 1987, 137). Tricia Rose explains that many contemporary African-American musicians were initially trained to fix and service new digital technologies, and these newly acquired practical skills eventually informed the creation of innovative black music genres (1994, 63). The relationship between new technology and musical innovation is a long one. The phonograph (invented in 1877 by Thomas Edison) which revolutionised sound manipulation enabled sound artists and technicians to split sound from its origins and reproduce new spatial and temporal sonic landscapes (Weheliye 2005, 7). A proliferation of inventive sound technologies followed and, in the twentieth century, this generated a variety of music styles, including ambient, electronic rock and industrial metal. Audio technologies, such as phonographs, radios, tape recorders, CDs, the Internet, iTunes, iPods, MP3 players, Napster and iPhones have provided a range of composers, musicians, artists and writers with opportunities to sample, record, cut and paste, remix, mash and hack material (using popular terminology). Such manipulated, re-configured and endlessly remixed sound “breaks free of the old associations” to create new contexts, ideas and stories (Miller 2004, 25).
I use Miller’s theories of “rhythm science” and remix to demonstrate that the memory of an event in *Beloved* is represented as being like an infectious virus. Each character’s memories are sampled, edited, distorted, remixed, and replayed in other characters’ sound loops by the narrator who, like a DJ, processes and dispenses the sound material to foreground individual vocals that form links between memory, time and place (Miller 2004, 25; 2009, 351). In this creative process, the historic information in a character’s monologue pops up as a sound interface in other characters’ dialogues and monologues. For example, sound information sampled from a dialogue between the character Paul D and Stamp Paid (*Beloved’s* Underground Railroad man) pops up later in a dialogue between Stamp Paid and Ella, his Underground Railroad co-worker.²⁷ Paul D had said to Stamp:

> That ain’t her mouth ... I don’t know, man. Don’t look like it to me. I know Sethe’s mouth and this ain’t it” (154).

Paul D does not believe what he sees—that is, he distrusts the visual—but he believes what he hears when Stamp reads the article to him as the reader discovers through Stamp’s dialogue with Ella:

> I told him about—I showed him the newspaper, about the—what Sethe did. Read it to him. He left that very day” (187).

Loops in remix reconfigure the sounds in numerous ways, as Miller explains:

> “There’s always more than one map to the territory” (2004, 9). In the above excerpt the reader is not hearing an exact repetition of the information sampled from the first dialogue in the second, but its transformation includes new material.²⁸ The narrator files, samples, edits, loops, and reconfigures Garner’s historical information in the

---

²⁷ Henceforth Stamp Paid’s name is abbreviated to Stamp in keeping with the novel.
²⁸ Repetition in cultural forms tends to represent its transformation (Snead 1981, 146-7).
remix, and it is in this context, Walter J. Ong suggests, that the originality of the new narrative is embedded (1982, 35–6).

As a derivative art, remix selects tracks from an original story or song, to cut and mix. Sampling voices and appropriate sounds from a variety of sources allows the author or composer to decide what to include and highlight in the remixed version. An example of the narrator’s selection of material in Beloved is the sampling and continual remixing of the indecipherable noise heard by Stamp (in Chapter nineteen).

A conflagration of hasty voices—loud, urgent, all speaking at once so he could not make out what they were talking about or to whom. The speech wasn’t nonsensical … But something was wrong with the order of the words and he couldn’t describe or cipher it to save his life. All he could make out was the word mine (172; italics in original).

The confused sounds of the “hasty voices” in the above excerpt anticipate the most poetic chapters (twenty to twenty-three, of the twenty-eight chapters). In these the DJ-like narrator selects, splices, and foregrounds the hasty voices as three individual voices heard by the reader as monologues. Sethe’s is re-presented in (Chapter twenty), Denver’s (Chapter twenty-one), and Beloved’s (Chapter twenty-two). A sample of each monologue from each chapter is given below, and in each, it is possible to hear the sound references, overlaps (underlined) and the disconjunctures:

[Sethe] Beloved, she my daughter. She mine. See. She came back to me of her own free will and I don’t have to explain a thing. I didn’t have to explain to her before because it had to be done quick. Quick. She had to be safe and I put her where she would be. But my love was tough and she back now. Paul D ran her off so she had no choice but to come back to me in the flesh … Some other way, he said. There must have been some other way. Let Schoolteacher haul us away … My plan was to take us all to the other side where my own ma’am is. They stopped me from getting us there, but they didn’t stop you from getting here … She come back to me, my daughter, and she is mine (200–4).

[Denver] Beloved is my sister. I swallowed her blood right along with my mother’s milk. The first thing I heard after not hearing anything was the
sound of crawling up the stairs. She was my secret company until Paul D came. He threw her out ... I love my mother but I know she killed one of her own daughters, and tender as she is with me, I’m scared of her because of it ... She cut my head off every night ... Beloved. She’s mine (205-9).

[Beloved] I [a]m Beloved and she is mine. I see her take flowers away from the leaves she puts them in a round basket the leaves are not for her she fills the basket she opens the grass I would help her but the clouds are in the way ... how can I say things that are pictures I am not separate from her there is no place I stop ... the man on my face is dead ... his face is not mine ... the iron circle is around my neck ... I come out of the blue after the bottoms of my feet swim away from me I come up I need to find a place to be the air is heavy I am not dead I am not there is a house ... she is smiling at me ... now we can join a hot thing (210-13).

In the above excerpts, the words sound confused even irrational, as the narrator blurs Garner’s original story with Sethe’s narrative. Sethe’s and Denver’s interior monologues are punctuated, but the ghost Beloved’s monologue is free from grammatical formality, adopting a topographic space that is otherworldly. This other world suggests African culture where the dead and the unborn are linked to the present by living individuals who connect past and future to both the physical and supernatural realms (Mbiti in Small 1998, 20).29 In these terms, Sethe and Denver are characters related to the ghost Beloved, the historical Garner, and her murdered baby girl.

Remix is continuous, and through the cut and mix of the individual monologues in Chapters twenty to twenty-two, the voices of Sethe, Denver and Beloved are reconfigured in Chapter twenty-three. (See below.) The disjointed, ruptured poetic blocks of sound heard in Chapter twenty-three come to represent the text’s underlying and recycled traumas. Beloved represents opposition to the long-standing omission of the original slave experience from the narrative of American history (Travis 1994, 186).

29 In traditional African culture, humans become mature in society, and their model for society is family. Small explains that because humans are not “confined to the living, therefore, love and generosity are due no less to the dead, who in turn watch over the living community” (Small 1998, 20).
Thus, the remix traces motherhood and the Middle Passage simultaneously and articulates the previously unspoken trauma that reveals deeper motifs. “[Sethe] was about to smile at me when the men without skin [white men] came and took us up into the sunlight with the dead and shoved them into the sea” (216). Such shattered responses engendered by the repetitive and multivocal sounds of the women’s dialogues and monologues challenge the reader as noise, spliced to create the solo parts, is transformed and finally transmitted as a coherent and powerful narrative.

The three female voices in Chapter twenty-three might be recognised by the reader as informed by African-American music, beginning with a solo rant by Beloved:

I [a]m Beloved and she is mine. Sethe is the one that picked the flowers, yellow flowers in the place before the crouching. Took them away from their green leaves. They are on the quilt now where we sleep ... Sethe went into the sea. She went there. They did not push her. She went there. She was getting ready to smile at me and when she saw the dead people pushed into the sea she went also and left me there with no face or hers ... Now I have found her in this house. She smiles at me and it is my own face smiling. I will not lose her again. She is mine.

Unlike her monologue in Chapter twenty-two, Beloved’s rant is now semi-punctuated, with the conclusion of her song informed by an exaggerated ellipsis on a new line, positioned just below the final full stop, as demonstrated in the above quote. The ellipsis is a written example of a hip hop break in a song that can be traced to the music of Africa as I will later go on to discuss. In Beloved, the ellipsis, or break, momentarily suspends the writing before picking up words in a blues song built on a dialogue between Sethe and Beloved. The dialogue suggests the musical form of call and response. Call and response singing tends to be heard by the listener as dramatic expressions of emotion. Call and response techniques alternate under strict rhythmic
rules, and are shaped by the social occasion. The improvised singing might go on for
hours picking up on preceding lyrics (Small 1998, 27).

Tell me the truth. Didn’t you come from the other side?
Yes. I was on the other side.
You came back because of me?
Yes.
You rememory me?
Yes. I remember you.
You never forgot me?
Your face is mine.
Do you forgive me? Will you stay? You safe here now.
Where are the men without skin?
Out there. Way off.
Can they get in here? (215).

The duet continues until another break ruptures and suspends the writing. The break is
represented in the text, not by an ellipsis, but as an extended visual space representing
as an acoustic pause, or silence. Following the topographical silence and on a new line,
Denver’s voice cuts in on Sethe, with a call to Beloved.

We played by the creek.
I was in the water.
In the quiet time we played.
The clouds were noisy and in the way.
When I needed you, you came to be with me.
I needed her face to smile.
[...]
Don’t love her too much.
I am loving her too much (216; ellipsis in italics not in original).

Following this call and response, recorded by the sisters, Sethe joins her daughters
in a haunting choral piece, which samples the pre-existing material heard above but is
written without full stops indicating an interactive, improvised free-flowing mix, that
suggests the oneness of the group, joined as they are in persecution and experience.

Beloved
You are my sister
You are my daughter

199
You are my face; you are me
I have found you again; you have come back to me
You are my Beloved
You are mine
You are mine
You are mine

I have your milk
I have your smile
I will take care of you
[...]

I waited for you
You are mine
You are mine
You are mine (216-7; ellipsis in italics not in original).³⁰

The stream-of-consciousness style of writing is a literary equivalent to a music remix
(Miller 2009, 354). A mix in music either develops a life of its own, or is fractured, and
left to circle around the beat as the changing “same”, as in the words “you” and
“mine” repeated in the excerpt above.

What is immediately striking in Morrison’s use of remix as a narrative strategy is
the emotive language, missing in the original nineteenth-century slave narratives.
Moreover, when the narrator adds a break, or interrupts the slaves’ and marginalised
characters’ songs, dances and iterative narratives of historical events, it is an
opportunity for the author to insert new material into the text. In Beloved, the new
material includes references to Dred Scott (173), the Settlement Fee (249), the Colored
Ladies of Delaware, Ohio (183), the baby’s funeral (183) and all these extend the
original story, creating a reflexive remix that transforms and challenges this source
material. In this sense, of the three basic types of remix, (extended, selective, and
reflexive) reflexive is the most appropriate type for Beloved as it allegorises and

³⁰ "You are mine" is repeated so often throughout the novel it seems to suggest “your story is my story”
which is Morrison’s desire for her black readers.
extends the art of sampling by adding or deleting material, and although the original tracks are recognisable the remixed version “challenges the original” and “claims autonomy” (Navas 2010, 159).

In music, improvements in audio skills such as “beat mixing” and “beat juggling” on two turntables allows DJs to seamlessly manipulate and merge different records, spawning a culture of remixed sounds and new compositions. With such advanced sound innovations, DJs disrupt the seamless flow of techno disco sounds in order to stress the rhythmic elements of older records known as (“the breakbeat”). As well, the technique of scratching is used, where the breakbeat of an older melody is substituted or dubbed by a different rhythmic solo (Weheliye 2005, 87). In general, when creating a breakbeat, DJs isolate and lengthen sampled material to form the base of a new track. When “scratching”, they move a vinyl record back and forth on one of two turntables assisted by a cross fader, to manipulate sounds and match the rhythm of the record playing on the other turntable.

The breakbeat and scratching strategies of remix can be applied at a macro level in Beloved, where the older melody of Margaret Garner’s story is substituted by the new rhythmic solo of Sethe’s narrative. In addition, the breakbeat can be heard in reverse at a microcosmic level. For example, in the text below, the narrative is temporarily suspended in a small scene where an old memory of the plantation comes rolling out in all of its beauty, dubbed in Sethe’s memory as:

the plash of water, the sight of her shoes and stockings awry on the path where she had flung them; or Here Boy lapping at the puddle near her feet, and suddenly there was Sweet Home rolling, rolling, rolling out before her eyes in shameless beauty ... remembering the soughing trees rather than the boys hanging (6).
In the above excerpt, the sound of water produces an acoustic space as the narrator erases the emotional trauma Sethe experienced at the Sweet Home plantation. The traumatic visual space—“the sight of her shoes and stockings awry on the path”—triggers a memory that is then refitted, recycled and reshaped by the narrator as Sethe remembers the beautiful sycamore trees of the plantation as well as the old memory associated with the boys hanging from boughs of trees (6).31

Bringing visual and acoustic elements into the discussion draws attention to the senses. Philosopher Marshall McLuhan, is interested in the way “our senses shape ... and are shaped by their environment” (Cox and Warner, 2009, 67). In the electronic milieu of today, remix does not take place in a cultural or political void; it crosses cultures and music styles. Rose (1994), in her revision of rap music, acknowledges that Western, mainly European, classical music “continues to serve as the primary intellectual ... reference for ‘real’ musical complexity and composition.” She suggests a comparative study of African, African-derived and European musical cultures “is of the utmost importance if we are to make sense of rap’s music and the responses to it” (1994, 65). And whilst McClary claims that the predominant music in the twentieth-century flows from the blues, other musicologists mourn the passing of a “main stream” arguing instead for “stylistic pluralism” (2000,32). For these reasons, I offer a brief, but necessary overview of African, African-American and European music cultures that are innovatively remixed in Beloved.

31 McLuhan contrasts “visual space” and “acoustic space” as different modes of engaging with the world (2009, 68).
**African, African-American and European music cultures and Beloved**

It would take volumes to fully explore the diversity of African, African-American and European music cultures, and their historical contexts, including the rupture to West African society by the slave trade; the Renaissance’s impact on European philosophy and the arts following the Middle Ages; and the interaction between African and European music cultures in America following migration during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. For the purpose of this discussion, I confine myself broadly to African, European and African-American music-making cultures in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

Musicologist Christopher Small argues that “temporal, physical and social continuity” tends to inform all aspects of African life including economics, politics, religion, and the arts, especially music and dance, which often evolve as “a single unity” within the community (Small 1998, 20-2).  

African music, rich in percussive, dissonant sounds, can include purring, thumps, and whistles, mimic any of “nature, animals, spirits and speech” (Maultsby 2000, 162). Manipulating the mouth, tongue, cheeks, or percussing the chest with both hands can create noisy sounds arranged in order and tempo to form musical compositions shaped by the event and, sometimes, abandoned just as quickly as they are adopted (Small 1998, 26-7).

Many African musicians, therefore, do not focus on music and dance as such but on the social gathering which reinforces the importance of human life and the religious framework which shapes it (Small 1998, 25). Historian P. Sterling Stuckey explains that for Africans in nineteenth-century American slave culture, “dance was primarily devotional, like a prayer … The whole body moving to complex rhythms … often linked

---

to the continuing cycle of life, to the divine (1988, 25). Such concepts inform Beloved’s weekly church service conducted by Baby Suggs, as the sounds of laughing, dancing, crying, and loving their own flesh are heard as “groundlife shuddered ... for the living and the dead” (87-8).

By contrast, European culture generally separates the arts from religion and politics (Small 1998, 20). Typically, Western classical music does not emerge from social occasion but draws on melodic progression and mathematical principles in an isolated compositional practice (score) and performance-oriented music. On this basis many Europeans did not acknowledge music that “did not conform to their rules and scales” (Epstein and Sands 2006, 36).

Western classical music tends to be goal-oriented and characterised by melody and harmonic resolution as it strives for consistency “of pitch, of time, of timbre and of vibrato” (Borneman in McClary 2000, 35).

African and African-American music has long been acknowledged for its emphasis and organisation on “repetitive words and rhythms” heard in the “slave songs, blues, spirituals and jazz” (Snead 1981, 150). Dynamic rhythm informs the lyrics of work songs sung by Paul D. For example,

Little rice, little bean,
No meat in between.
Hard work ain’t easy,
Dry bread ain’t greasy (40; italics in original).

Rhythmic complexity and repetition are to African and African-American music as harmony is to Western classical music. Of significance, what is referred to as African-American music, originated in America, and has been influenced by the exposure to Western music traditions, in nineteenth-century American society, including folk
songs, ballads, dances and marches (McClary 2000, 37). However, it is recognised that a collective core memory of African sounds was maintained by the slaves, which informs African-American music with a wide range of notes that may sound out-of-tune to Europeans. Such distorted, vibrato-like sounds, imitate African music tradition where the pitch is skewed as the note is approached from above or below, the timbre is percussive while the musical idea is prompted rather than fixed (Borneman in McClary 2000, 35). In the excerpt below, such an example of indeterminate pitch and percussive sound is suggested in Beloved’s voice:

“What might your name be?” asked Paul D.
“Beloved,” she said, and her voice was so low and rough each one looked at the other two. They heard the voice first—later the name (52). After four weeks they still had not got used to the gravelly voice and the song that seemed to lie in it. Just outside music it lay (60).

European music by comparison, tends to seek resolution in tonal harmony, albeit in the anticipation of a final harmonic chord or perfect cadence. But the organisation of sounds and rhythms, as well as the spontaneous outbursts of energy in African and African-American music defies closure. African and African-American music breaks (“the cut”) melodic and rhythmic threads by repeating pre-existing material, but never repeating the same music twice. Such cuts tend to interrupt the flow of music and skip back to earlier phrases in the music or song, offering the musician and the listener, a new beginning by introducing a different pattern of timbre or pitch. (Snead 1981, 151). Repetition, James Snead explains, is necessary in African and African-American musical forms as it organises the possibility of the characteristic improvisation and call-and-response aspects that develop over a common beat, shaped by the “black church”, “black folklore”, “poetry” and “song” (1981, 151).

---

33 In The Harvard Concise Dictionary of Music and Musicians, Don Randel defines a cadence as “a melodic or harmonic configuration [of notes] that creates a sense of resolution (finality)” (1999, 105).
I draw on the role of repetition in remix to understand Morrison’s engagement with Garner’s story, and to locate it within the culture and history of black slave experience. In order for remix culture to develop the dynamics of repetition and representation, something must pre-exist: the original story or song. To be clear, then, European, African and African-American cultures differ in their interpretation of repetition. The activity of repetition in black music culture, according to Snead means “the things circulates ... in an equilibrium. In European culture, repetition must be seen to be not just circulation and flow, but accumulation and growth” (1981, 149). This means that in black culture “the thing ... is there for you to pick it up when you come back to get it ... it continually ‘cuts’” (Snead 1981, 150). In European tradition, as in Western classical music’s melodic and harmonic progression there is always progress and an aim toward resolution. Generally, African and African-American music is cyclical but not without melodic sound, and the phrases tend to be short, repetitive and repeated with slight variation (Small 1998, 113). For example, in *Beloved*, there is often a deliberate play on words.

You came back because of me?
Yes.
You rememory me?
Yes. I remember you.
You never forget me?
Your face is mine.
[...]
You are my face; I am you.
Why did you leave me who am you?
I will never leave you again
Don’t ever leave me again
You will never leave me again
[...]
I loved you
You hurt me
[...]
You came back to me
You left me
I waited for you
You are mine
You are mine
You are mine (215-7; ellipsis in italics not in original).

In the above sample, the verbal flow and layering demonstrate how the repetition, in this African-American song gradually ignores punctuation rules while amplifying the emotional content to inform the reader of the inherent ruptures faced by slave mothers and their families during slavery. Snead argues that “repetition is an important and telling element in culture, a means by which a sense of continuity, security and identification are maintained” (1981, 147). Thus, African-American music practice (blues in the above quote) is infused by the African tradition where a ritual, dance or song is cut to confront “undesired or unpleasant facts or conditions” (Snead 1981, 150).

When African and African-American music traditions were drawn into a relationship with European music traditions with the advent of slavery, different tonal harmonies and chord progressions filtered into African-American music styles, not in an adoption of harmonic progression, as such, but in the invention, for example, of the blues note and jazz scales that defy closure (Maultsby 2000, 157; McClary 2000, 32-3). At the same time, African and African-American improvisatory music traditions began to challenge European notions of “structure, form, communication and expression” (Lewis 2009, 273).34

---

34 Not all nineteenth-century classical composers followed European classical conventions. Arthur Schoenberg rebelled against European music traditions (McClary 1985, 153). Schoenberg railed against repetition in theme and variation suggesting it was a repressive ideology, and Igor Stravinsky, for different reasons, raged against the Romantic period’s notion of selfhood and individuality. He developed repetitive ostinato in his works as an example of “primitive” freedom heard in African and African-American music, with and pitted against European music. Claude Debussy followed Stravinsky’s compositional flair by including techniques from Asia (Kamien 2002, 285-7).
One of the emphases of African-American music discussed above is improvisation as a strategy of response and continuity, shaped by the occasion in live performance. An African-American musician might design a course of action during a performance, but will not be committed to a “technical blueprint [score] regardless of its effect on the listener” (Small 1998, 45-6). This strategy is evident in the description of the church service in *Beloved*, which always began in a certain way, but then is described as having got “mixed up”. After positioning herself on a:

huge flat-sided rock, Baby Suggs bowed her head and prayed silently ... Then she shouted, ‘Let the children come!’ and they ran from the trees toward her. ‘Let your mothers hear you laugh,’ ... ‘Let the grown men come,’ ... ‘Let your wives and children see you dance,’ ... It started that way: laughing children, dancing men, crying women and then it got mixed up (87-8).

*Beloved’s* use of Baby Suggs’s “call” is informed by both African and European traditions. In African cultures the call is a democratic mode of organisation in public rituals including religious gatherings, and was brought to the New World by the slaves (Epstein and Sands 2006, 34-5). Similarly, in the first century of European Christian tradition the call announced antiphony, a call and response style of liturgical singing, which has survived in musical notation in the Roman Catholic Church to the present (Thibodeau 2006, 244). However, when the Africans arrived in America they had to adjust to various new sounds, dances and surroundings, and European traditions. Through scrutinizing the differences they learned to fuse the new music with their African culture (Epstein and Sands 2014, 40-1).

“Let the children come” in the above quote, is an example of what Weheliye terms the “cultural language” of improvisation that cannot be captured by the

---

35 Ronald Radano, in analysing the spirituals of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, discusses white fascination with the spirituals and the difficulties of white musicians in notating the songs on manuscript paper to be played or sung by whites (Radano in Weheliye 2005, 94-5).
extended musical notation of European music that is written down, filed as a score and later performed in the exact manner at a different time and place (2005, 94-5). In contrast, Snead suggests African and African-American music sets up suspense and interrupts it at “irregular intervals.” Moreover, the black church manifests repetitions at the crux of music and language (Snead 1981, 151). Thus, the rhetorical strategy, takes the form of *anaphora* in which the repetition comes at the beginning of the clause: (“Let the children come ... Let your mothers ... Let the grown men ... Let your wives and children”) (87-8). Here, according to Snead, the preacher cuts her own speaking by interrupting the flow of her rhythmical words; simultaneously, the listeners in reacting to the preacher’s calls at irregular intervals, produce a cut, a modest shift in the “texture of the performance” (1981, 151).

Another example of the improvisatory style of call-and-response is heard in the novel when a band of imprisoned and chained slaves compose a work song:

“Hiili!” It was the first sound, other than “Yes, sir” a blackman was allowed to speak each morning, and the lead chain gave it everything he had ... “Hiili!” at dawn and the “Hoooo!” when evening came ... They chain-danced over the fields, through the woods to a trail that ended in the astonishing beauty of feldspar ... They sang it out and beat it up, garbling the words so they could not be understood; tricking the words so their syllables yielded up other meanings (108).

The above excerpt refers to its own internal fragmentation as “garbling”, “tricking” to produce different meanings. It is an example of how established African and African-American protocol and repertoires are shaped, re-shaped and reused in the everyday life of the novel’s slave characters to subvert, deconstruct and reconfigure the dominant culture’s semantic codes.

European and African music cultures have long influenced contemporary American music styles, such as folk, ballads, blues, jazz, rhythm and blues, soul, gospel,
rock and pop, country blues, funk, rapping, scratching and hip hop, formed out “of their particular historical conditions and experiences” (McClary 2000, 33). The importance of musical heritage to Beloved is ironically acknowledged when Amy Denver, the young white servant girl who helped Sethe (Sethe names her baby daughter after Amy) sings “Lady Button-Eyes” during Lu’s (aka Sethe’s) labour. In the emotional shift following the birth of Denver, and after a silence, Amy says to Sethe: “That’s my mama’s song. She taught me it” (81).36 “Lady Button Eyes” is a poem written by Eugene Field, a white American poet whose lawyer father represented the significant case of Dred Scott, the African-born slave who unsuccessfully sued his slave master for his freedom in 1857.37 This reference to Field’s song is an example of how a European-American song in an African-American literary text has been drawn on to inform both contexts. The insertion of the song “Lady Button Eyes” in Beloved’s music mix is both personal and impersonal. It draws European-Americans (Amy Denver and Field) and the African slave characters (Sethe and Dred Scott) into equal focus without diminishing either subject.

Much European music and literature in the twentieth century adapted repetition and cyclical insights not as a progression toward goal-oriented direction and tonal resolution but, as McClary suggests, “to observe how manipulated one is by musical patterns ... in other words ... to deconstruct—these rhetorical devices” (2000, 144). Similarly, Morrison’s rich cultural childhood and formal education in English and the classics fuels her novels in blending “rational and magical tonalities” to rediscover and reconstruct her African past (Ndongo 2007, 25).

36 From 1550-1850, British indentured servants brought to America a repertory of ballads and folk songs that survived through oral transmission. In stark contrast, Small explains, practically nothing remains of African songs (Small 1998, 17-46).
37 Scott was eventually manumitted (freed); the case is generally discussed as the lawsuit that started the Civil War (Public Broadcasting Service 1995-2014).
Remixing Beloved

Remix invokes an acoustic method of organising and recognising information and experience (Davis 2008, 54). Each interior monologue, dialogue and stream-of-consciousness writing in the text suggests a sound and aural origin, through the speech acts and thoughts of the slave characters. Those are then sampled and remixed in loops by the narrator to evoke memories that bring the past into the present as in the quote below. Acoustic sound anchors the meaning of images in sounds that in turn suggest non-linear and multi-sensory spaces. Like a sampling machine, the narrator dispenses any sound or experience, real or imaginative to do this work. For example, when Sethe is rubbing Denver’s hair with a towel the narrator creates an acoustic space through the dialogue between Sethe and Denver.

“Maybe we should unbraid it?” asked Sethe.
“Uh uh. Tomorrow.” Denver crouched forward at the thought of a fine-tooth comb pulling her hair.
“It hurts,” Denver said (60).

In the excerpt above, the narrator creates a visual image organised along a linear, sequential, causal line. However, when Beloved asks Sethe a question the narrator opens an “acoustic space”, a space we hear rather than see:

“Your woman she never fix up your hair?”
“My woman? You mean my mother? If she did, I don’t remember. I didn’t see her but a few times out in the fields ... She nursed me two or three weeks that’s the way the others did. Then she went back in the rice and I sucked from another woman whose job it was ... So, to answer you, no” (60).

---

38 McLuhan, while investigating electronic media and acoustic sensibilities in the ways we experience the world, defined acoustic space as the “‘mind’s ear’ or acoustic imagination that dominates the thinking of pre-literate and post-literate humans alike (2009, 71).
In this scene, Sethe’s action of combing Denver’s hair, creates a double movement in which the absence of Sethe’s mother and the presence of her daughters creates perpetual movement between objects of thought and representations, in which mixing the past with the present is extended through call and response: “‘What happened to her?’” asked Beloved. “Hung’” said Sethe (61). The word, “hung” produces a break in the conversation, as the narrator picks up Sethe’s erased memory to navigate her past in an interior monologue. Miller suggests that interior thoughts can be changed in the “real” world (2008, 10). This concept is suggested when the narrator updates Sethe’s thoughts in the following quote:

Nan was the one she knew best, who was around all day, who nursed babies, cooked, had one good arm and half of another. And who used different words. Words Sethe understood then but could neither recall nor repeat now. She believed that must be why she remembered so little before Sweet Home except singing and dancing and how crowded it was. What Nan told her she had forgotten, along with the language she told it in. The same language her ma’am spoke, and which would never come back … [Sethe] was picking meaning out of a code she no longer understood. Nighttime. Nan holding her with her good arm, waving the stump of the other in the air. “Telling you. I am telling you, small girl Sethe,” and [Nan] did that. She told Sethe that her mother and Nan were together from the sea (62).

In the quote, the stream-of-consciousness dimension partly recovers the past for Sethe as she revisits a childhood, which includes Nan, a friend of her mother’s. This memory serves to remix African culture and language with the historic Middle Passage creating rememories for Sethe and new memories for her daughters. It is also a means to educate the reader about forgotten episodes such as sexual assault in black American history: “Both [Sethe’s mother and Nan] were taken up many times by the crew” (62). Through the sound loop of memories, the reader learns that Sethe’s mother and Nan
were shipped from Africa to America and, while at sea, repeatedly raped. Sethe’s mother threw away all her babies except Sethe, whose father was a fellow African:

The one from the crew she threw away on the island. The others from more whites she also threw away ... You [Sethe] she gave the name of the black man. She put her arms around him (62), said Nan.

The juxtaposition of Nan’s and Sethe’s different memories are sampled, recontextualised and transmitted as a series of vexed traumas, that include the historic rapes and infanticide, as a turbulent terrain that had been erased from Sethe’s memory and obscured by successive and dominant white American political and cultural discourses (Christian 1993, 204). In these terms, samples of Sethe’s and her mother’s motherhood resonate in the acoustic space and the non-linear, simultaneous difference shatters memories in a powerful disclosure. As Miller writes: “You can never play a record the same way for the same crowd.” He explains that this is why remixes occur, and it is the same with memory: “Memory demands newness” (Miller 2004, 113). Thus, the shifting current in the excerpts above, predicts a better future for the slaves as Sethe, unlike her mother, has the time and freedom to comb her daughter Denver’s hair. Unlike her mother, Sethe has no memory of the West African familial village and scant recall of the communal and social events with which her slave mother identified.

As such, African imagery and cultural references to the “little antelope dance” are sampled and mapped from Denver to Sethe and return suggesting it is one of Sethe’s forgotten memories. That is, the emotional content of her African culture is stripped away from Sethe, to be refitted and embodied by Denver.

But she could not, would not, stop, for when [Sethe] did the little antelope rammed her with horns and pawed the ground of her womb with impatient hooves. While she was walking, it seemed to graze, quietly—so
she walked, on ... Finally, she was horizontal ... A dying thought ... she waited for the little antelope to protest, and why she thought of an antelope Sethe could not imagine since she had never seen one (30).

Whilst I have argued the relevance of audio mixing strategies to *Beloved*, there are obvious differences between the technology used by an audio DJ and *Beloved*’s narrator. For example, in print technology an author manually uses the computer mouse to cut-copy-paste data as an interface in a written text, whereas audio sound requires the DJ to listen to the song and isolate an instrument, or vocal to build the song using a mixing console or sound desk. In spite of this, both styles of mixing strategies can be understood as watching the flow of content in order to spin and manipulate different tracks which endlessly loop as iterative extensions of various parts to the whole. In the above excerpt, Denver’s loop is continually cut and flipped to include Sethe’s memories of her treacherous escape from her slave master. As Denver’s mix spins the narrator uploads more historical information:

it must have been an invention held on to from before Sweet Home, when [Sethe] was very young ... she remembered only song and dance ... Oh but when they sang. And oh but when they danced and sometimes they danced the antelope. The men as well as the ma’ams, one of whom was certainly her own. They shifted shapes and became something other. Some unchained, demanding other whose feet knew her pulse better than she did. Just like this one in her stomach (30-1).

This mix which creates “something other” is uncompromising in portraying black history in terms of the art traditions of African and African-American culture, including the narrator’s reference to the antelope dance.\(^\text{39}\) Sethe’s memory of the antelope dance returns with the story of Denver’s birth. In terms of better understanding the

\(^{39}\) Shipboard accounts during the Middle Passage document Africans forced to dance by the crew. Naturally, they performed their native dances. Further studies were observed and documented in diaries, journals memoirs kept by slave holders, travellers and missionaries (Burnim and Maultsby 2006, 8).
novel’s remix strategy, Miller suggests that music’s qualities are endlessly flexible and contextualising (2004, 21). Miller explains that a DJ “mix” permits the DJ to take the best source material available to create a new invention. In *Beloved’s* mix, the DJ-like narrator challenges the limits of historical accounts requiring the reader to witness and piece together fragmented parts into an evocative and inventive (or innovative) record of black African slave practices in America.

Another important remix strategy, developed and discussed above, is starting the novel in *medias res*. In this way, the narrator extends the remix of the novel by introducing the baby ghost (*Beloved*) and a supernatural world that is neither social nor historical, and is not mentioned in Garner’s story. The baby girl’s death is a memorable recombinant strategy that allows the novel to foreground the symmetry of the different scenarios that align Garner’s text with Sethe’s, while simultaneously making them different. The space formed by the baby’s murder builds as a cyclic sound interface in this work, and it pops up in all the characters’ dialogues and monologues. This gives the reader a sense of the events surrounding and contributing to the murder. In this way, the DJ-like narrator manipulates, rotates and organises the sound material representing the characters’ experiences, collective memories and emotive responses. Miller explains that such sampling can transform any expression and sensation heard in any culture (2008, 7). A particularly striking example of this flexibility occurs when Baby Suggs’ loop opens up new channels (heard in the following quote) to express Garner’s mother-in-law’s sorrow and mediated loss of children through slavery.40

40 In the historical account, Simon and Mary Garner, Margaret’s parents-in-law, were separated from each other for more than half their married life. Most of Mary’s eight children were sold to other slave holders (Reinhardt 2010, 11).
So Baby’s eight children had six fathers ... Halle she was able to keep the longest. Twenty years. A lifetime. Given to her ... for hearing her two girls ... were sold and gone and she had not been able to wave goodbye ... “God take what He would,” she said. And He did, and He did, and He did, and then gave her Halle who gave her freedom when it didn’t mean a thing (23, italics in original).

God gave Halle to Baby Suggs, she believes, to make up for hearing that her two girls were sold and gone before she could say goodbye (23).

As a monument to the character of the historical figure of Margaret Garner, who emerges as intelligent, articulate and steely, in the records, Sethe’s strength is represented as unbounded in Paul D’s and Denver’s monologues. 41 Paul D says Sethe had “iron eyes and a backbone to match” (9) when she first arrived at Sweet Home as a twelve-year-old. But just before she escaped Sweet Home, Paul D saw that the psychological traumas she had endured as a slave had destroyed her sensitivity and her eyes now “needed to be covered, lidded, marked with some sign to warn folks of what that emptiness held” (9). Now reunited with Sethe in Cincinnati, Paul D sees that her vitality has returned and she is strong enough for him to trust her. Within a few pages in the text, Paul D’s memories and understandings of Sethe drift into Denver’s maelstrom where Sethe appears as:

The one who never looked away, who when a man got stomped to death by a mare right in front of Sawyer’s restaurant did not look away; and when a sow began eating her own litter ... And when the baby’s spirit picked up Here Boy and slammed him into the wall hard enough to break two of his legs and dislocate an eye ... still, her mother did not look away ... Now here was this woman with the presence of mind to repair a dog gone savage with pain rocking her crossed ankles and looking away from her own daughter’s body. As though the size of it was more than vision could bear (12).

41 Bassett records that in his interview with Garner she “almost chills the blood in one’s veins” (Bassett in Reinhardt 2010, 215).
With Paul D’s arrival, Sethe is untethered as she regresses to adolescent-like behaviour, sitting barefoot and rocking, and embarrassed by Denver’s obesity (12). Paul D, however, has no idea of Sethe’s criminal act of infanticide until Stamp, the Underground Railroad man, shows him a newspaper article. Paul D, illiterate, and distrustful of newspapers, refuses to believe what he sees, that the photograph in the paper is Sethe. Eventually, when he hears the story, he accepts the truth and confronts Sethe: “What you did was wrong” (165). Although Paul D loves Sethe, his blunt judgement creates a temporary fracture in their relationship as the novel, not a sentimental remix, challenges the reader with Margaret Garner’s decision to murder her baby girl to save her from slavery. Through Paul D’s response to Sethe’s crime, the text provokes the reader to unpack the moral complexity of the historical slave mother’s decision.

In the inclusivity of the remix, Miller explains, an ever-shifting network of familiar and unfamiliar territory echoes and reconfigures the relationship of the original narrative to various scenarios (2008, 10). On this basis, a sumptuous party was held at 124, hosted by Baby Suggs, to celebrate Sethe’s escape. The party overflows with food, song and dance and is subsequently recorded, adapted, exaggerated and circulated as gossip and jealousy through the black community.

It was Stamp Paid who started it … [he] went off with two buckets to a place … where blackberries grew … he got back to 124 and put two full buckets down on the porch … She [Baby Suggs] made pastry dough … three pies, maybe four … Sethe thought she might as well back it up with a couple of chickens. Stamp allowed that perch and catfish were jumping into his boat … it grew to a feast for ninety people … Ninety people who ate so well, and laughed so much, it made them angry … Baby Suggs’ three (maybe four) pies grew to ten (maybe twelve). Sethe’s two hens became five turkeys … (135-7).
The celebratory party causes contention and envy in the African-American ex-slave community because they come to believe Baby Suggs and her family have too much wealth and happiness (137). As on the morning of the murder, when nothing seemed to be wrong, there was no sign of death, “yet the smell of disapproval was sharp” (138). Baby Suggs knew the dissent about the party was directed at her by people like herself. At this point in the narrative she has a premonition. She hears horsemen thundering into town, and the hostility in the black community toward Baby Sugg’s kin, fails to warn Sethe of the approach of her slave master. A warning by a member of the community might have provided a way to escape, and prevented Sethe’s decision to murder her child.

The link between memory, time and place in Baby Suggs’ vision is subsequently cut and reset to the morning of the murder where reference is made to the Biblical book of “The Revelation” as “four horsemen came—Schoolteacher, one nephew, one slave master and a sheriff” to re-capture Sethe and her children (148). However Sethe’s quick thinking and murderous act confuses the horsemen and they are left dumbfounded: “‘What she want to go and do that for?’” (150). As Sethe is taken into custody by the Cincinnati sheriff, the four horsemen, thwarted by the slave’s act, return empty-handed to Kentucky.

The mix described above mirrors the divisive nature of slavery where different voices and visions collide. Baby Suggs imagines that her black community’s dissent prevents Sethe from hearing the men’s arrival. The depiction shows Garner frustrating the powerful slave owners, and shows the length slave-masters went to to pursue their property. The narrator’s skill in sampling historical, social, political information

42 The reference suggests the four riders of the Apocalypse in the Biblical book of the Revelation of St John, chapter 6 and verses 1-8, representing conquest, war, famine and death.
from archives, while regulating time, memory, subjectivity, and shared experience through characters’ interior monologues and dialogues resonate as an aural interplay of fact and fiction. This can be seen in the narrative when Ella, a long term Underground Railroad co-worker of Stamp (who gave Sethe and her newborn, Denver, safe passage to the house at 124), hears a rumour that 124 is occupied by an unknown ghost-like woman, and she is stirred into action.

On being told of the ghost, Ella remembers being raped at the hands of a white man and his son, and her resultant inability to touch her white baby, leaving it to die. Whilst Ella understands Sethe’s murderous actions of twenty years earlier, she and Sethe have been estranged. Sethe’s proud, haughty and independent attitude on her release from prison had ruptured their friendship. In spite of this, when Ella hears about the ghost she says she “didn’t like the idea of past errors taking possession of the present” (256). The task of rescuing Sethe from the daughter-like ghost named Beloved is eventually achieved by Ella because of her changes in attitude. That is, Ella comes to recognise the importance of love and forgiveness in the healing process. Ella finds the solution to the ghost Beloved’s demands on Sethe in singing. The other women’s singing, that Sethe hears, remembers and responds to, interrupts her actions for:

> When the music entered the window she was wringing a cool cloth to put on Beloved’s forehead ... Sethe and [Beloved] exchanged glances and started toward the window ... For Sethe it was as though the Clearing had come to her ... where the voices of the women searched for the right combination, the key, the code, the sound that broke the back of words (261).

> As the women gather and sing outside the fence at 124, each is filled with memories of the singing in the Clearing (the space in the forest which was the
preacher Baby Suggs’ healing place). As they maintain their harmony, they recall their shared history, specifically the image of love for self and one another, which are the prophetic words used by Baby Suggs in her preaching (88-9). The words now represent an alternative future for Sethe, in this sense it is significant that the women’s singing samples a traditional African religious paradigm in an African-American context. In southern African American church services (the invisible church) functioned in the woods or fields and expressed themselves through an African cultural lens that included “prayer, communal singing, testifying but not always preaching” (Burnim 2014, 53). They composed their own folk spirituals instead of singing established repertoire (Burnim 2014, 52).

The deepest irony of the novel, given stories like the one above, and a most poignant example of remix, is Morrison’s decision to give the name Garner to Sethe’s slave master. Sethe’s dead daughter born at Sweet Home, is therefore Beloved Garner. This suggested forgiveness is an example of how remix challenges the original source and claims autonomy by adding to and deleting original components, creating a new medium where both history and fiction are related to yet independent of each other (Navas 2010, 10). The remix, however, is always dependent on the legitimacy of the original, sometimes the only original element that is recognisable is the title.\(^4\) The novel relies on the original historical account and by sampling the name Garner, the text come to acknowledge the Garner name self-reflexively, signifying and acknowledging Margaret Garner’s story while validating it as an important and relevant remix.

\(^4\) Navas cites as an example the Mad Professor’s famous dub/trip hop album No Protection, as a remix of Massive Attack’s song, Protection. The only recognizable feature left intact by Mad Professor, is in the title (Navas 2010, 159).
Conclusion

Morrison’s audio approach to Garner’s historical account in *Beloved* replicates sounds, ideas, stories and images in loops to effectively demonstrate the unspoken thoughts of the slaves, omitted from the original slave narratives. These thoughts are in turn developed through new and emergent forms of interconnection and communication. Audio culture strategies, such as sampling, looping and remixing, shape the novel to undermine and deconstruct the original slave account. The strategies allow the novel to diversify, fragment, recycle as its multilayered remix is re-presented in the narrative’s interior monologues, stream-of-consciousness writing and in the characters’ dialogues.

Replication, as Gilles Deleuze suggests, “makes us ill, it also heals us; if it enchains and destroys us, it also sets us free” (1994, 19). As repetition, loops and remix start a forgotten story in *Beloved*, the novel demonstrates the necessary freedom to sample and remix a variety of historical, narrative and imaginative material to set both past and present in a new relationship; the past no longer forgotten but actively engaged in by the present. *Beloved* is a multilayered, multifaceted and polyphonic text; it offers the reader many experiences in familiar and unfamiliar ways. To repossess historical memories and reclaim a forgotten ancestry, Morrison’s narrator remixes the past in the present. On this basis, Morrison’s novel serves as a monument to healing, as well as to a nation’s forgetfulness. Morrison speaks about *Beloved* “as a prayer, a memorial, a fixing ceremony for those who did not survive the Middle Passage and whose names we do not know” (Morrison in Christian 1993, 11) as such the novel takes the historic opportunity to resituate and rename Margaret Garner as one who is beloved.
Introduction

David Mitchell’s novel, *Cloud Atlas* (2004), comprises six separate novellas each written in a different form and each of approximately equal length.\(^1\) Situated in distinct historical periods and geographical contexts, the novellas are subtle yet complex hybrid texts nestled in one coherent work. The entire work can be likened to a Matryoshka (Russian) doll, where each doll-like piece is bequeathed in a tangible form—published journal, cache of letters, music recording, unpublished novel manuscript, film, and catechism (recorded on an “orison”)—to the protagonist in each succeeding story.\(^2\) The overlapping pieces trace a story from the nineteenth century in the Pacific Rim to a futuristic, dystopian narrative set in the twenty-fourth century on a post-cataclysmic Hawaiian-like island. Each novella is encountered in two parts in the work, one in the first half and the other in the second. The first set of five stories suspends each novella in mid-section, then the sixth and central story is written in its entirety, before the second set of stories picks up on the first set. Each story is continued and drawn, one after the other, to the novel’s conclusion. The six protagonists’ individual narrative voices vocalise the central theme of hope in a world where greed and the will to power permeate its histories, and focus the reader’s listening on the corresponding yet diverse stories (Smyth 2008, 55).\(^3\)

---

\(^1\) References to *Cloud Atlas* are from the 2004 Random House edition and will be cited parenthetically.  
\(^2\) An orison is an egg-shaped recording machine in the fifth novella, “An Orison of Somni-451”.  
\(^3\) Besides Smyth’s (2008) brief synopsis of music form and expression in *Cloud Atlas*, there are no other musico-literary analyses of *Cloud Atlas*.  

In the first novella, “The Pacific Journal of Adam Ewing”, I argue that music is interwoven as a supplement, to the narrative of Adam Ewing, the protagonist, as a means of signifying and underscoring the radically unequal relations of power, which variously trouble him on his travels. Following Lawrence Kramer’s work on musical narratology, I aim to demonstrate how harnessing music in this way draws attention to musical sounds, form and practice in analysing the stories of the oppressed and marginalised groups. Kramer writes:

In relation to a narrative, music is a supplement, in the deconstructive sense. In relation to narrativity, music is performative, in the sense of the term developed by speech-act theory. And in relation to narratography, music is something like an embodied critique of discursive authority (1996, 100).

I have drawn on Western art music, non-Western music and musical experiences more broadly to help me in this endeavour. I highlight the novel’s music form and the underlying musical interconnections that shape the text as a whole before analysing the first novella.

Music matters in Cloud Atlas

In the second and arguably most musically inflected novella, “Letters from Zedelghem”, the main protagonist, Robert Frobisher, is a musician and composer, who writes a work titled Cloud Atlas Sextet which mirrors the structure of the novel Cloud Atlas, in which each novella is envisioned as a solo performance. As the second novella’s protagonist and composer Frobisher explains to his lover, Rufus Sixsmith, a scientist in the third novella, that the narrative form is his musical masterpiece:

---

4 The socio-political, cultural, and black and white voices common to all three novels framed my choice of analysing the first novella of Cloud Atlas rather than the more musical second novella set in the 1930s. The second novella will be a significant study, but is beyond the remit of this thesis.
a “sextet for overlapping soloists”: piano, clarinet, ‘cello, flute, oboe, and violin, each in its own language of key, scale, and colour. In the first set, each solo is interrupted by its successor: in the second set, each interruption is recontinued, in order” (445).

The title *Cloud Atlas* has been described by Mitchell as inspired by the classical piano music piece, *Cloud Atlas I–X* (1985-99), by the Japanese composer Toshi Ichiyanagi: “I bought the CD just because of that track’s beautiful title”, Mitchell remarked in 2010 (interview with Adam Begley, 2010). In another interview in 2007, Mitchell explained to James Naughtie:

In the title itself, "Cloud Atlas", the cloud refers to the ever changing manifestations of the Atlas, which is the fixed human nature which is always thus and ever shall be. So the book’s theme is predacity, the way individuals prey on individuals, groups on groups, nations on nations, tribes on tribes. So I just take this theme and in a sense reincarnate that theme in a different context (Naughtie 2007).

Insisting on creative experiment, Mitchell informs the reader about how the narratives in his oeuvre are constructed by inserting a miniature model with an explanatory note in his texts (interview with Harriet Gilbert, 2010). The formal structure of *Cloud Atlas* resembles a Western art music sextet and this is made clear for the reader in the second part of the second novella.

Tonality, assumed by contemporary musicologists to be the foundation of Western music is more than a parsing influence in *Cloud Atlas*. Thus, Frobisher’s composition is structured like a music scale with each note setting up its own harmonic history. The sextet reflects the structure of *Cloud Atlas* itself which can be understood.

---

5 Mitchell, in an interview with Begley for *The Paris Review* (2010), is surprised to learn that the phrase ‘cloud atlas’ is mentioned in his preceding novel *Number9Dream*: “The cloud atlas turns its pages over” (Begley 2010).

6 Mitchell suggests that reincarnation in *Cloud Atlas*, is visually represented by a comet-like birthmark on the body of all the protagonists except, the sixth protagonist, Zachry (Naughtie 2007).

7 Key signatures, scale and tone colour reference the harmonic background of tonal compositions (McClary 2000, 66).
as beginning on the first half of the home-key novella, ascending uniformly in one
direction, through the first half of the five key-like novellas, and reaching a terminal
point in the sixth novella, before descending as a melodic inversion of the ascending
scale to the second part of the first novella or home-key.

In the first set of the second novella, the visual analogy for Frobisher’s
revolutionary music, and therefore for Cloud Atlas, is the set of nesting stories
represented in Vyvyan Ayrs’s composition, Matryoshka Doll Variations. (52). In the
novel, Ayrs, is a well-established composer in the Western art music world, suffering
syphilitic paralysis and progressive blindness. Frobisher is employed as Ayrs’s
amanuensis, and he seeks to exploit Ayrs by surreptitious theft, including the sale of a
rare book from Ayrs’s library: The Pacific Journal of Adam Ewing. Ayrs and Frobisher,
loosely based respectively on the English composer Frederick Delius and his
amanuensis Eric Fenby, are represented as equally egotistical and tempestuous (Smyth
2008, 56). Each is bound in a working relationship, by the art of music composition, to
a callous world of artistic influence (70, 446, 455). The composition Matryoshka Doll
Variations anticipates Frobisher’s own composition and Cloud Atlas, as in it two halves
of a whole are pulled apart to reveal a smaller modification of itself “encased in a nest
of ‘shells’” (393). Ayrs’s composition is an ingenious ploy in Cloud Atlas as it provides
imagistic clues for an aural reception and understanding of the novel, when Frobisher’s
music composition is reviewed late in the novel (445, 468).

A difficulty with Western art music is that it developed “as something to be
listened to ‘for itself’ as art or entertainment rather than as something mixed in with
social occasion, drama and ritual” (Kramer 2002, 1). This is also true of Frobisher’s
Cloud Atlas Sextet, and Frobisher himself indicates to the reader of the second novella
that his sextet is a stand-alone work (445). The reader now assumes this refers to the underlying structure of the novel, but Frobisher goes on to say he is unsure if the composition is radical or gimmicky as his metaphorical clarinet cadenza has “spectral and structural peculiarities ... semi-invented notation and singular harmonics” (468).

Such commentary by Frobisher about his composition risks jeopardising the coherency of the work just as it unnerves the listening Verplancke, a Belgian policeman, amateur musician and baritone vocalist. As a musician in the Western art music tradition, Verplancke is eager to perform the piece and urges Frobisher “to post a published copy of the score for his ensemble” (468).

Mitchell privileges Western art music throughout the novel, which begins with the artistically rich, yet individualistic musical context of the west in the mid-nineteenth century. Throughout the novel, the six protagonists’ voices embody different aspects of Western art music expression, which configures instrumental sound in a particular tonal approach, developed and built into the imaginative harmonic composition. As mentioned above, each of the protagonists’ voices in Cloud Atlas corresponds to a solo for a different Western orchestral instrument: Adam Ewing—piano; Robert Frobisher—clarinet; Luisa Rey—’cello; Timothy Cavendish—flute; Somni-451—oboe and Zachry—violin. These solos then affect the music histories, syntax and language of each novella. Of particular interest to this chapter is the piano voice of Adam Ewing, the protagonist in the first novella. This novella links the reader to Ewing’s voice and thereby to the rising popularity of the piano in the mid-nineteenth century when piano music was known by music historians as “black and white” (Dunsby 2001, 502), since piano music is organised on the “black-versus-white patterns of its keys (Cook 1990, 102).
Ewing’s piano voice is therefore given narratorial freedom in the first novella to record all the characters’ voices, both black and white, as inclusive sound, and for the reader to hear the socio-political, historical and economic injustices endured by the marginalised characters in its story. In that a pianist uses both hands and each finger of their hands, they have been described as independent “sound-producing agent[s]” (Cook 1990, 101). As such, the pianist has an extensive register of bass and treble sounds at their disposal (unlike the violinist or oboist who produce music in the treble register). Hence, the pianist has a wider sense of harmonic structures than the cellist, flautist, oboist and violinist who are all confined to single staff scores (Cook 1990, 102-04). In these terms, it is Ewing’s nineteenth-century piano voice that starts and ends Cloud Atlas registering a tonal range of seven plus octaves underscoring the harmonic tension and unequal relations of power in the protagonists’ voices.

In a 2010 interview, Mitchell suggested that though Cloud Atlas “is not too overlaid with music … [it] doesn’t mean it is not there” (Gilbert 2010). As such, reading the subtle presence of music in the novel requires the reader to be attentive to the protagonists’ voices. In the second novella, for example, the reader is indirectly told of the multiple meanings, forms, and implications of the novel in reference to the sound of Frobisher’s clarinetist voice: “it’s an incomparable creation. Echoes of Scriabin’s White Mass, Stravinsky’s lost footprints, chromatics of the more lunar Debussy, but truth is I don’t know where it came from” (470). The description calls up Walter Pater’s celebrated quote: “All art constantly aspires towards the condition of music” (Pater 1973, 45).

---

8 Mitchell has suggested Olivier Messiaen’s “Quartet For the End of Time” and Toshi Takamitsu’s music as influences on the novel (Gilbert 2010).
Whilst *Cloud Atlas*’s overarching narrative structure is that of a Western art sextet, a variety of Western and non-Western music styles inform and are referred to in the six novellas. In the third novella set in the 1970s, the protagonist, Luisa Rey, a journalist investigating an atomic energy conspiracy is reading a text titled *Harnessing the Sun: Two Decades of Peacetime Atomic Power*, while listening to a playlist of hits from Carole King’s album, *Tapestry* (110). The song lyrics for the album title “Tapestry” speak of meeting a man and the world unravelling. In the novella Rey meets the scientist, Dr Rufus Sixsmith, (Frobisher’s lover in the second novella) in a lift during a power outage. Sixsmith is targeted by corrupt politicians and conservation groups, he is murdered, though appears to have committed suicide. Through her link to Sixsmith, Rey discovers that the *Cloud Atlas Sextet* has been recorded but is rare: “Only five hundred recordings pressed ... In Holland, before the war, my, no wonder its rare ... *Cloud Atlas Sextet* must bring the kiss of death to all who take it on” (119).

In the fourth novella, “The Ghastly Ordeal of Timothy Cavendish”, set in the first decade of the twenty-first century, a jazz sextet is heard playing in the background, at Jake’s Starlight Bar, by Cavendish, a book publisher, on the night of the Lemon [book] Prize Awards. In these passages, Jazz is associated with the body, as the music “kicked off a rumba” (147) and sets the atmosphere by provoking lively and emotive conversation amongst the attendees. This mood disintegrates during the course of the evening resulting in the murder of the prize-winning author (150).

The fifth novella, “An Orison of Somni-451” is set in an identifiable Korean technological political dystopia. The fabricant clone-like protagonist Somni-451 is born, lives and works at Papa Song Corp where the cycle of time is “indistinguishable from any other” (185). Somni-451 escapes Papa Song but is recaptured. An archivist
(interviewer) asks Somin-451 questions and her oboe-voice answers are recorded on an orison that is bequeathed to the protagonist in the sixth novella. Somni-451, who is in a position to answer questions on social issues of the past, present and future, is shown in the text to be fascinated by sounds:

“I heard off key-singing; a popsong about Phnom Penh Girls” (204).
“I first encountered birds ... For whom did they sing?” (205).
“Passing thru cloisters, I heard music. Not AdV or popsong but naked, echoing waves of music. ‘A choir’” (217).

Music informs Somni-451’s experiences of freedom and understands how “one’s environment is a key to one’s identity, but that my environment, Papa Song’s, was a lost key” (229). Past environments no longer exist for Somni-451 and the testimony of her life, recorded on the orison, offers spiritual guidance to the marginalised community in the sixth novella.

In the sixth novella, “Sloosha’s Crossin’ An’ Everythin’ After”, Zachry, the sixth protagonist, reveals through his violin voice the genesis of music, the cataclysmic Fall understood as giving rise to the language which evolves in his community after “[a] squeezywheey an’ banjos an’ catfish fiddlers an’ a presh rare steel guitar ... then the drummin’ started up, see ev’ry tribe had its own drums” (287). Zachry dances to the music and with each beat of the drum memories return of life before the Fall (287).

Such passages in the novella highlight not only the auditory and the physical aspects of music, but also its social-temporal character: “an’ boom-doom an’ pan-pin-pon till we dancers was hoofs thuddin’ an’ blood pumpin’ an’ years passin’ an’ ev’ry drumbeat one more life shedded off me” (287). But Zachry cannot describe his memories in words because the language he spoke before the Fall no longer exists: “there ain’t the
words no more” (288). In this sense, his “violin voice” represents the language of the new and emerging civilization that is an aural means of transmitting information:

This heavy dialect implies that the story has passed directly from Zachry’s lips to his son’s ears, and will continue to pass thus from generation to generation ... until more advanced media comes into play and the cycle begins again” (Hopf 2011, 118).

This futuristic understanding of the origins of language and music echo Herbert Spencer’s (1858) nineteenth-century evolutionary view that music “had originated in emotionally heightened speech, becoming gradually refined as a separate form” (Spencer in da Sousa Correa 2003, 12-13).

In these separate but overlapping novellas, Western art music represents the continuity in the novel via the virtuoso-like protagonists’ solo voices. The protagonists’ voices articulate music as a means for protesting against adverse social conditions and the recurrent predacity of dominant cultures on marginalised individuals and communities.

I now turn from the general significance of music in Cloud Atlas to its specific role in the first novella “The Pacific Journal of Adam Ewing”. I argue that the narrative and the style of narration draws attention to and highlights musical sounds, form and practice in the telling of the stories of oppressed or marginalised groups and individuals. I aim to demonstrate that music as inclusive sound is interwoven into Ewing’s story as a supplement to the narrative adding an alternative means of signifying social-political, historical and economic injustices in the radically unequal relations of power that trouble, the key protagonist Ewing on his travels.
The music supplement to Adam Ewing’s story

Narrative is a recognised story, combining sequences of events over a given period of time (Kramer 1996, 100). In these terms, the language, settings and characters in “The Pacific Journal of Adam Ewing” are full of intertextual and historical references to Herman Melville’s *Moby Dick* (1851), and Richard Henry Dana’s *Two Years Before the Mast* (1840), in addition to Jared Diamond’s *Guns, Germs, and Steel: The Fate of Human Societies* (1997) (interview with Begley, 2010). The intertextual influence of Melville’s and Dana’s canonical works and Diamond’s text thus connects the reader’s understanding of the “situatedness” of the novella to a larger nineteenth-century cultural canvas (Orr 2003, 83-4).

To explore Ewing’s narrative and the marginalised characters’ stories in relation to their time and place, I have divided the following section into the five geographical contexts depicted in the first novella which, I argue, act like a metaphorical song cycle in classical music style form where the stories of each geographical setting acquire their own space and landscape. Musical effects, forms and experiences in Ewing’s narrative transport the reader out of the every day and into the characters’ stories, which variously relate narratives of unequitable power relations and predacity. Generally, the words in each song of a classical song cycle are written by the same person and usually sung to a piano accompaniment, as is the case in this novella. Of all the musical instruments associated with the novel’s protagonists’ voices, as described earlier, the piano provides an instant image for the reader who is able to visualise each key on the keyboard. Thus the black-versus-white plan of a keyboard reinforces the idea that each note has its own position, a specific history, feel and distinctive sound in
relation to itself and the other notes. Similarly, each character in the novella, whether
black or white, has a unique history, and distance/interval between their stories.

1. Chatham Isle

The first and last stories of the novel, which make up the two parts of the first novella,
are written in the first person. The first part begins mid-way through the nineteenth
century and mid-way through Ewing’s journey from Australia to America. Ewing is a
young, white and wealthy American middle-class lawyer, who is married to Tilda, and
father to young Jackson. He is on his way home to San Francisco from Australia aboard
the English mercantile ship, *Prophetess*. He is detained for a week in an “Indian
hamlet” (3) on Chatham Isle, now part of New Zealand. Here the ship must await
repairs after a storm at sea. During a nature walk, Ewing notices recent footprints and
these lead him to a white man who becomes his confidant, doctor and potential
murderer. Dr Henry Goose is a London surgeon, rejected by London’s nobility for
malpractice. Following the damage to his reputation by the noble Marchioness of
Mayfair, Goose had travelled with the intention to practice medicine away from
England. Recently, he had worked as a doctor on a mission in Fiji. Goose is waiting for a
long overdue Australian sealer, *Nellie*, to transport him to Australia, where he wants to
get work as a ship’s doctor on a passenger ship to London.

Following their initial meeting, Ewing suspects Goose is a lunatic but, after a
lengthy conversation the following morning, Ewing realises that this judgement is
premature and “unjust” and based on professional cynicism (5). A day later, the pair
walk together and hear the first musical sound referred to in Ewing’s stream-of-
consciousness narrative. The musical sound—a beelike “hum”—interrupts their
conversation and they determine to find its source. Through listening to the musical sound, they discover a small poverty-ridden community on the outskirts of Chatham Isle. The lament represents both “natural space and natural language” for the slaves. Benson writes “‘wordless’, [music] creates ‘a space we might enter/in innocence’” (2006, 42). Ewing and Goose see wretched slaves suffering from scabies sitting in the mud and humming and they watch a brutal and public flogging of a young male slave. Here, the hum works to undercut the narrative’s linear trajectory by delaying Ewing and Goose in the village. They are confused by the slaves’ humming, and are unable to tell whether the collective hum is made in sympathy for, or in condemnation of their fellow slave (6). Ewing and Goose, are perplexed by the wordless lament sung in unison by the slaves. The two men are represented as the only whites amongst the Indians who exist within a socio-political hierarchy of three castes, and God-like, an Indian chieftain sits on his “throne” (6) dressed in a feathered cloak. Around him thirty tattooed Indian men stand with their women and children to watch the punishment. All the while, the lowly caste of “duskier [and] sootier slaves” (6), less than half the number of their masters, continue to sit and hum.

According to Kramer, music becomes disruptive in the narrative when it seeks to destabilise the dominant regimes of “musical composition and reception” (1996, 101). In these terms, the slaves in Cloud Atlas are powerless to overthrow the dominant culture of their community, but their humming in unison draws Ewing’s attention to

---

9 Jim Samson argues that noisy interruptions to daily life, for example, Ewing’s investigation of the humming noise in the first novella, have a rational function that changes the way listeners, including Ewing see the world (2001b, 9).
10 Georgian–Australian ethnomusicologist and evolutionary musicologist, Joseph Jordania, lists humming in his research on music and emotions as a contact call, a call that warns a group of impending danger or as an audio measure for an individual maintaining contact with a group (2010, 43).
11 In Maori singing, the “Waiata tangi”, or weeping lament, is a dirge-like wailing, sung on a chanting note or microtones ranging two intervals, the second to the fourth (McLintock 1966). www.teara.govt.nz/en/waiata-tawhito-traditional-maori-songs/page3.
their story. The slaves, Ewing, Goose and the reader discover later in the narrative, are Moriori, the original inhabitants of Chatham Island who were brutally colonised in the 1830s by Maori warriors.\textsuperscript{12}

Ewing and Goose do not understand the highly specific social context of the flogging scene, but the narrative works to facilitate an understanding for the men and the reader of the spectacle to address the suffering inherent in the slaves’ story. In my reading of the text the “hum” establishes a cohesive order within the slave group in contrast to the singling out of the slave for flogging. The hum, in general, has also been read as “the primal form of song and its tone as the first language behind all words” (Tomlinson 1999, 45). In this sense it may signify the intimate hope of freedom for the slaves marginalised within the hierarchical power system. Countering the hum is the dynamic lash of the whip in the hand of the tattooed “Goliath” striking the prisoner’s naked flesh: “His body shuddered with each excoriating lash” (6). The humming drone of slaves, the striking of the whip, and the hovering silences of the Indian chief, the tattooed masters, and their wives, and children cause Ewing to swoon “under each fall of the lash” (6). Attali suggests that “primitive sounds of language, of the body, of tools, of objects, of the relation to self and others” is coded. Music, or any arrangement of sounds, including noise, therefore, produces or assembles a community of inclusiveness that projects a centre of power (Attali 2009, 7).

Ewing, who imagines the slave already “in the care of the Lord” (6), is unprepared when the beaten slave lifts his head, and stares at him. The eye-to-eye social interaction is described in Ewing’s story as “uncanny, amicable knowing! As if a theatrical performer saw a long-lost friend in the Royal Box and, undetected by the

\textsuperscript{12} The Moriori tribe of the windswept region in a pre-European era numbered less than 1000 inhabitants and was considered primitive, non-confrontational and peace-loving this set them apart and made them vulnerable to their Polynesian neighbours (Sutton 1980, 67-9; Evans 2006, 2).
audience, communicated his recognition” (6). The association of the moment with a theatre audience, and the description of the look between the two men as expressive and egalitarian, anticipates a powerful moment later in the narrative, when Autua saves Ewing’s life.

The theatrical reference locates Ewing’s position in his own society, as well as his sense of responsibility to vulnerable individuals, and his own self-importance. In particular, as a mid-nineteenth century middle-class white male in a non-Western colonised culture, Ewing knows that he could intervene in the flogging. As such, after the men’s eyes meet, and despite being confronted by a domineering, knife-waving tattooed slave master, Ewing inquires as to the slave’s misdemeanour (7). But Ewing’s attempt to intervene is thwarted by Goose who leads him away saying: “Come, Adam, a wise man does not step betwixt the beast [and] his meat” (7). The statement, together with other of Goose’s pessimistic philosophy on predatory human nature as well as his lyrical rhymes suggest the influence of Spencer’s position on natural selection and the survival of the fittest influenced in turn by Charles Darwin’s *On the Origins of the Species* (1859).13

The day after is a Sunday and Ewing, Goose and the “God fearing of Ocean Bay” (8) hear the ringing of the chapel bell as a call to worship.14 The church service serves to unite what is referred to as the “rattle bag” of Christian denominations, although the underlying structure of the worship service is influenced by Lutheran traditions. The reader is informed that the German church founder, a Lutheran, died over a

---

13 Spencer coined the phrase “survival of the fittest” in his essay, “Progress: Its Laws and Cause” (1858, 536-8) which was influenced by Charles Darwin’s text *On the Origins of the Species*. Conversely, Darwin first used Spencer’s new phrase alongside his phrase “natural selection” in his 5th edition of *On the Origins of the Species* (1869, 91-2).

14 Church bells were Asiatic in origin and brought to Europe by the Celts, but the bells of the later period were Gothic and had an important role in moderating daily lives (Lang 1963, 81).
decade ago. The service is characterised by references to the Bible and the choir.\textsuperscript{15} “Biblical passages were read ... we joined in a hymn or two nominated by rota” (8). A rota, or round, a vocal work that dates from the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, does not have a hierarchy based on an instrument or voice of superior value but works toward an equitable and harmonic unity. Johann Forkel, a nineteenth-century German musician and music theorist, suggests communal singing creates a “community of equal citizens who all work independently but harmoniously toward the common good” (Forkel in Butt 2001, 214).

The rota of the narrative’s key religious scene is the impetus that empowers and privileges the voices and connects the protagonist to the marginalised characters of Chatham Isle’s worshipping community. When hierarchical relationships of pitch or tone in a musical composition are drawn together in a single governing impulse they tend to remain unnoticed (McClary 2000, 73). This is true for the church setting, as Ewing discerns, through the communal prayers offered spontaneously by the congregation, that the gathering resembles more the concerned and neighbourly Early Christians of Rome than the latter day Church “encrusted with arcana [and] gemstones” with which Ewing is more familiar (8-9). The plainer service means that the repertoire of instrumental and vocal music with which he is more familiar is absent: “No organist played a Magnificat but the wind in the flue chimney, no choir sang a Nunc Dimittis but the wuthering gulls, yet I fancy the creator was not displeased” (8).\textsuperscript{16}

The privileging of nature and culture here gestures perhaps towards the inherent value

\textsuperscript{15} The Lutheran church is a Protestant denomination founded in 1517 by Martin Luther, a German monk and former Catholic priest. “After theology”, Luther said, “I accord to music the highest place and the greatest honour” (Dreyfus 1996, 242-3).

\textsuperscript{16} Johann Sebastian Bach’s companion texts, Magnificat and Nunc Dimittis, are two of the three most important cantatas in Western ecclesiastical tradition, along with the Benedictus. These cantatas are heard every morning and at evensong in Catholic and Protestant religious traditions. Mitchell’s citing Bach’s texts is a clear example of Carolyn Abbate’s thesis that “interpretative writing on a given work becomes in some sense part of that work as it travels through history” (1991, 17, italics in source).
of creation and conservation. Historically—music theorists, according to McClary, have attempted to analyse music in terms of mathematics and science and have “shaped our perceptions … conditioning us not to recognize silencing—not to realize that something vital may be missing from our experience … [of] the imperfect material, social world we inhabit” (1985, 150). Alternatively, Henry David Thoreau in his text Walden (1854) exalted nature and argued that man’s activities damaged the environment. This sentiment, I suggest, is linked to the pessimistic and predatory theme, and characterised in all six novellas of Cloud Atlas.

After the service, Evans, an elder at the church, who is a white settler and sheep farmer, invites Ewing and Goose to join his family, along with the lay preacher, D’Arnoq, for the customary Sabbath meal. Evans invites his wife to say the grace for the meal, an interesting scene in a faith more usually represented as patriarchal and puritanical where women were generally silenced. Over the meal, the narrative draws attention to the voice of D’Arnoq, who is marginalised within the wider Chatham Isle community for his work amongst the Moriori. Because of this work he is derogatorily referred to as: “A White Black, a mixed-blood mongrel of a man ... a Bonapartist general ... a Polak” (16). Thus the vocality and project of listening to D’Arnoq’s story might be read as positioned “on the borders of language and music, and of textuality and musicality” (Benson 2006, 59). The specific manner in which D’Arnoq’s voice is heard in the narration is said to unlock “a Pandora’s box” (11). As such, Evans, Ewing, Goose and the reader hear an emotive and lengthy monologue that is “unbroken three hours later” (11). Here I refer to Spencer’s text “Essays” (1858), as discussed earlier, to support the idea that emotional speech and, in particular, D’Arnoq’s monologue, is the foundation from which music developed (Spencer in da Sousa Correa 2003, 32).
Ewing, transported back in time during the monologue, elevates D’Arnoq’s voice to the calibre of canonic literature: “His spoken history, for my money, holds company with the pen of a [Daniel] Defoe or Melville” (10). Since D’Arnoq’s tone of voice and narrative is represented of virtuoso standard, I use the idea that the origins of language came from “warnings, cries for help ... that is a kind of music ... eighteenth-century opera could see an ideal image of itself reflected in the artless natural cry” (Thomas 2006, 70-1). With an ear to the relation between voice inflections and song the narrator opens a space for an association between operatic music and literature. For example, D’Arnoq speaks (or rather, sings) of the demise of the Moriori tribe of Rēkohu (11-12). Blow by blow by blow by blow, D’Arnoq’s tonal voice sounds:

The first blow to the Moriori was the Union Jack, planted in Skirmish Bay’s sod in the name of King George by Lieutenant Broughton of HMS Chatham ... needy sealers, the second blow to the Moriori’s independence who disappointed the Natives’ hope of prosperity by turning the surf pink with seal’s blood ... The third blow to the Moriori was the whalers ... Fourth, those motley maladies ... however, the tattooed Maori conquistadors ... impaled [Moriori men and women] ... children hiding in holes, scented [and] dismembered by hunting dogs. Some [Maori] chiefs ... slew only enough to instil terrified obedience in the remainder. Other chiefs were not so restrained ... fifty Moriori were beheaded, filleted, wrapped in flax leaves then baked in a giant oven with yams [and] sweet potatoes (12-15).

The excerpt above, refers to the series of desecrations that silence the Morioris’ voices and culture. In short, Ewing’s Christian hope is shaken by D’Arnoq’s revelation of greed and white and black brutality (17). Only Goose is resigned to the Morioris’ fate heard when he responds to Ewing’s project of civilising the Black races by conversion to Christianity:

After years of working with missionaries, I am tempted to conclude that their endeavours merely prolong a dying race’s agonies for ten or twenty years. The merciful plowman shoots a trusty horse ... might it not be our duty to likewise ameliorate the savages’ sufferings by hastening their extinction? (16-17; italics in original).
On a mid-week morning some days later, Goose attends a woman patient at the request of Evans. While he does so, Ewing strikes out alone to canvass “Conical Tor”, a lookout to the north of Ocean Bay. As he scales the hill, Ewing imagines he hears music and talking. From this point on he is guided by sound, which he relates to musical effects and fantasies fuelled by fear. Musicologist Nicholas Cook after John Cage (1966), suggests that “composing music becomes not so much a matter of designing musically interesting sounds as such, as of creating contexts in which sounds will be heard as musically interesting” (1990, 12). For example, in the jungle environment, Ewing interprets a sudden downpour of hailstones as “frenzied percussion”; and the song of the tui becomes speech repeating the Old Testament law: “‘Eye for an eye!’” (18). The frightened “hoo-rush” of a mollyhawk’s flapping wings morphs into a fantasy of a wild boar that then becomes a spear-waving, hate-filled Maori warrior (19).

In this mix of nature’s sounds, Ewing accidentally falls into a well, and knocks himself senseless. In his unconscious state, he imagines he returns home to San Francisco. He sees his wife Tilda and son Jackson, but is dismayed when he attempts to speak and a rough Indian language escapes his lips. Because of these primitive sounds and indecipherable speech, he is rejected by his wife and son. This scenario echoes Spencer’s nineteenth-century theory of music’s evolutionary function derived from two separate functions of speech, “expressive and intellectual” (Spencer in da Sousa Correa 2003, 13). That is, Spencer orders the speech of nationalities according to his criteria of expressive inflection and monotony. Ultimately, Spencer’s psychology of “‘language of sympathetic discourse’ by which we communicate and share happiness develops simultaneously with the civilising process” but Spencer’s view of this process
is restricted to “‘a cultivated few’” (Spencer in da Sousa Correa 2003, 20). Ewing’s primitive vocal utterances, as an imagined state, allow for Ewing’s personal experience of exclusion and rejection demonstrated by the inharmonicity of his own voice, to be made known to the reader.

After a week in dry dock, the *Prophetess*, a British sailing ship, sets sail on a Friday for Bethlehem Bay, with Ewing but without a full crew. The crew of fifty is described as a mix of nationalities, including Swedish, British, Dutch, American, and five Spanish Castilians sailors who, along with Goose, jump ship at Chatham Isle. Goose, the quack opportunist, becomes the *Prophetess*’ medical officer. Goose’s intention is to prey on Ewing, for he believes Ewing is carrying great wealth. Over lunch at the Evans’s farm, Ewing had disclosed to D’Arnoq, Evans and Goose his difficulties in locating an Australian beneficiary of a will effective in California. Moreover, Goose convinces Ewing, a hypochondriac, that Ewing is suffering a potentially fatal ailment caused by a parasitic worm infection in his brain. According to Goose, Ewing needs constant medical supervision.

Once at sea, Ewing experiences a dramatic awakening when the figure of a man unfurls himself from under the hawser (coils of rope) covering the floor of his cabin hissing: “Missa Ewing” (26). Ewing jumps with surprise as he identifies the intruder’s “uncut language” as Indian. The intruder introduces himself saying: “‘My name is Autua’” (26), a friend of Mr D’Arnoq, the Christian lay preacher of Chatham Isle. When he mentions the Maori whip, Ewing identifies him as the battered Moriori slave. Autua dabs at his eyes with his fingers and then at Ewing’s eyes, to remind Ewing of the look of understanding they had exchanged while he was being flogged.
The gaze, is the dominant way in which Western society engages with and understands the world. But Attali argues, “the world is not for the beholding. It is for hearing” (1985, 3). Similarly, ethnomusicologist Philip V. Bohlman argues that music might be something else: “multiple ontologies of music exist at both the individual and local level, as well as at the global level” (2001, 17). Here Bohlman recognises both individual musical experiences and music cultures other than his own. I apply these ideas to Ewing’s narrative as his story cycle moves into the space of the open sea and aim to show that music is embedded in the narrative as a process of illumination on the barbarism of dominant groups seeking to exert power over marginalised groups and individuals.

2. Sea shanties and a sailor’s song

In this section, music, as Peter Erspamer suggests, serves as a locus for representing unequitable power relations, social coherence and as a means to overcome the divides of “class, ethnicity, and religion” (2002, 150).

By reciting his own history in pidgin English, Autua’s distinctive speech undercuts D’Arnoq’s story as he represents (the) authentic cultural voice in the underlying dynamics of the Moriori story. In this sense, the black and white notes of Ewing’s imaginary piano voice records all black and white characters’ distinctive stories in an inclusive narrative.

Autua tells Ewing how his father was one of the first Moriori to encounter the brutality of the Maori landing on Chatham Isle. He refers to the sighting:

of the “Great Albatross” ... of the Albatross servants’ gibberish (a bird language?); of their smoke breathing ... of those “shouting staffs” ... every Moriori who had not perished became a slave of the Maori ... Maori thrive
In the above excerpt, following Kramer, I read Autua as lending his voice to the dead. The relevant poetic device here is prosopopoeia, defined by Kramer as “the lending of a face or voice to things faceless and voiceless, among them the dead—to appropriate that coherence and claim that authority on behalf of the living” (1996, 116). Autua’s voice is assigned its own distinct mode of subjectivity to highlight the genocide of his race and how his culture might have evolved in the present.

Later in the narrative, Ewing discovers that it was D’Arnoq who had hidden Autua in his cabin so that Ewing could assist his escape. But Ewing has been ostracised by the ship’s captain and first mate, Boerhaave, and he is loathe to help. Autua, determined to escape his enslavement, believes death is better than living as a slave. But death has no voice and it risks destabilising Ewing’s narrative of recording injustice inflicted on a marginalised community by dominant powers. By tracing the music supplement through Autua’s speech the narrative articulates a “private, passionate, confessional self [and] give[s] its authentic identity a social face” (Kramer 1996, 104). Autua presses a dagger into Ewing’s hand and insists that Ewing kill him, but faced with this proposition, Ewing promises Autua that he will approach the captain in the morning. Though he is tempted to betray Autua, he says “in the eyes of God my word was my bond, even to an Indian” (27). The “even to” here indicates his own consigning of Autua to a low status, in spite of his sympathy. When Ewing’s good conscience overcomes the temptation to betray Autua an imaginary sea shanty is sung by the wind:

The cacophony of timbers creaking, of masts swaying, of ropes flexing, of canvas clapping, of feet on decks, of goats bleating, of rats scuttling, of the
pumps beating, of the bell dividing the watches, of melees [and] laughter from the fo’c’sle, of orders, of wind shanties [and] of Tethy’s eternal realm (27).

During the night, however, Ewing and Autua are awakened by another musical noise: “a falsetto yell” (27). A drunk Castilian sailor, Ewing discovers after a hasty analysis, has fallen from the rigging to his death on the deck. Ewing remains on deck with Goose to observe the Catholic ritual of committal of the body to the elements:

I stayed to watch the Castilians perform their Catholick [sic] death rites over their countryman before knotting up the sack [and] committing his body to the deep with tears [and] dolorous adios! (28; italics in original).

Music in Cloud Atlas is a vehicle for and resistance to cultural assimilation as heard in the Castilians’ performance and ritual of burying and valuing their dead in the above excerpt. Music, Erspamer suggests can also precipitate change in individuals and society (2002, 147-8). This idea is suggested in the novel when Ewing returns to his cabin and coaxes forth Autua’s familial history and his crime against his slave master, Kupaka (29-32). Ewing is shaken by the injustice inflicted on Autua, but he knows he must reveal the stowaway’s presence to Captain Molyneux. On this basis Autua is eventually added to the ship’s crew (32-3).

In the novel musical effects establish musical moments which record and add a rich, aural dimension to the significance of the characters’ stories. For example, one Sunday evening shortly after Autua’s acceptance on the crew, Bentnail, a sailor working in a team on the front deck, sings ten bawdy verses of an improvised sea shanty on the subject of the world’s brothels. The obscene song shocks Ewing but Goose enjoys it and adds an eleventh stanza about “about Mary O’Hairy of Inverary
that turned the air yet bluer” (38). Of particular interest here is Bentnail’s improvised sea shanty considered in relation to the sailors’ task. The sailors are laying grass flat on the deck to turn twine into ropes. While sea shanties developed from the essential rhythms associated with particular shipboard tasks, the music produced from the labour of the repetitive rhythmical chores mutate into “strident laments or an epic alleluia in the face of a hard existence” (Lloyd 1975, 270). Shanty repertoire insists that the sailors hear the leader’s (shanty man) voice sing out an impromptu rhythmical verse of rhyming words, which is then typically accompanied by a chorus. This chorus is repeated between the verses and sung by all the sailors working on the job. It was discovered that sailors worked better when they sang (Lloyd 1975, 278). After Bentnail’s shanty, the sailors are “coerced” (38) into singing solos. Rafael, a young Australian on his maiden voyage, is the next sailor pressured into doing so.

Rafael, the same age as Ewing’s son (499), “sat on the ‘widow maker’ [a reference to the ship] [and] sang these lines in a voice unschooled yet honest [and] true:—Oh, Shenandoah, I long to see you ...” (38). His melodious tenor voice is beautiful and stuns the sailors into silence. In this way, in terms of reading the musical effects in narrative, the young sailor’s solo produces a profound silence in the characters’ stories that are unfolding on the ship. The silence in the text is an uncanny instant where the absent voice of music is heard by the audience; instead of representing a failure of sound it powers Rafael’s narrative to what Benson terms “full individuation” (2006, 51). The question, therefore, arises for Ewing: “Why should Rafael, an Australian-born lad, have an American song by heart?” (38). Rafael answers Ewing’s unexpressed question: “I din’t know ’twas a Yankee un ... My mam teached it me before she died” (38).

17 Saunders attributes the original sea shanty to Western music culture, and in particular to the British sailor. He dates the first recorded shanty to 1549 (1928, 339-57).
18 A ship was termed a “widow maker” in the nineteenth century relating to lives lost at sea.
voice, in Benson’s terms, is both “internal and external ... it makes manifest the self, but in doing so, puts the self elsewhere” (2006, 51 n 23).

Thus “Shenandoah” can be understood as a hybrid song, in that it is a sea shanty, but also an art song. The intimate, persuasive art song has its birth in the Romantic era of the early nineteenth century and is autobiographical in essence (Samson 2001a, 272). As such, Rafael’s song selection shifts the shanty sung by the men, away from its obscene references. It now recalls a musical memory of Rafael’s absent mother (and, by association, of all the listeners’ families who are absent). The song is the only trace Rafael has of his mother, and his life memory of her is captured there. Through his singing voice, Rafael privileges the memory of his mother’s voice, and experiences his mother’s love for him through its lyrics: “I’ll leave you never ... I’ll love you ever” (38). “Shenandoah” holds a marginal place in Western art music, but in this scene, the song articulates the poor, young sailor Rafael’s gentle and vulnerable nature.

Kramer convincingly argues that it is a common experience to remember being moved by a singing voice, “in which the text serves as a supplement or point of departure” (2002, 52). Thus, Rafael’s mother’s voice provides Rafael with both pleasure and identity: ”’It’s the only thing of hers I got still. It stuck in me’” (38). Here Rafael’s story momentarily halts Ewing’s narrative’s to become the primary dimension of depth and interiority that is in Kramer’s terms “borrowed from the responses of our own bodies as we listen to the insistent production of rhythms, tone colours and changes in dynamics” (1996, 112). Once the distance between the spirit of the mother and the son’s voice has collapsed into silence, Kramer’s claim that there is an intimacy between the listener and the spirit behind the voice is realised (2002, 52). Rafael’s

---

19 According to Saunders, the song is completely unsuitable for a hard-working sailor’s rhythmical sea-shanty, “Shenandoah’s” rhythm is unpredictable, as it is based on broken rhythm or rubato and more akin to the art song (1928, 341-2).
singing voice precedes a silence which creates an emotion in Ewing and the others that goes beyond the words and the music (39). This silence can be read as representing “the apparent absence or temporary cessation of any organised or intended sound; as such it is linked with some of the most fundamental emotions and experiences of which the human subject is capable” (Smyth 2008, 167). Ewing, for example, subsequently remembers his own boyhood and absent mother. Like Rafael, he was subject to foster care and, as such, looks to help Rafael: “How I wish I could help him” (39; italics in original). The closeness of Rafael to Ewing has already been established in the novel, for example, the first emotion experienced by Ewing after the death fall cry of the Castilian was ‘relief’ that it was not Rafael’s (28).

Through combined experiences, the reader first learns of Ewing’s meeting with Rafael in the Tasman Sea when they were both seasick. Ewing knows that Rafael’s foster mother, Mrs Fry of Brisbane, unlike Ewing’s foster parents, “my Mr [and] Mrs Channing”, provided Rafael with the “smatterings” of an artistic education, and that this sets him apart from the crew. Rafael’s excitement and great anticipation of a life at sea is expressed through Ewing’s narrative: “that sprite lad, aglow with excitement at his maiden voyage [and] so eager to please, has become this sullen youth in only six weeks” (39). Ewing observes that Rafael’s “luminous beauty is chipped away … Already he looks rather given to rum [and] water” (39). These changes in Rafael’s demeanour trouble Ewing (39). To Ewing’s mind, Rafael has become a brooding melancholic but, without saying why, Goose suggests the change in Rafael is predictable.

The climax of the final scene in this section, and in turn the first part of the narrative, is a conversational image between Ewing and the ship’s cook. “I asked Finbar [the cook] if he thought [Rafael] was ‘fitting’ in well.” Finbar’s Delphic reply, “Fitting
what in well, Mr Ewing?” left the galley cackling but myself quite in the dark” (39; italics in original). The essence of this scene lies in the motley crew’s explosive response to Ewing’s question and Ewing’s inability to recognise the transgressive energy of the crew, which unfolds later.

3. Bethlehem Bay

In the second set of the first novella, Rafael’s tenor voice is heard starting the third song of the song cycle, singing the passionate call to the sighting of land: “‘Land! Ahoyyyyyy’” (475)

It is Sunday as the Prophetess glides through the pristine waters into the bay. Standing on the deck, Ewing describes the raucous noise, “daubed with cacophonous jungle” (475), before describing the design of the settlement dwellings. A hierarchy of buildings from the thatch dwellings built on stilts by the seashore to timber buildings built up the hill by craftsmen, and just below the hill top, a “proud church” with a cross symbolising the pinnacle (475). This image of the Bethlehem Bay church stands in stark contrast to the Chatham Isle church’s “modest cruciform” (8). In Bethlehem Bay, the church’s lofty position suggests a superiority and elitism that is traced in the stories to power and wealth (478-9, 480-1, 482, 489-491).

Later when a skiff transfers Ewing, Goose, Captain Molyneux and Boerhaave to the bay (475), the captain says that he is going to “‘Call on the King in his Counting House’” (476). The allusion to the nursery rhyme evokes images of economic greed and predacity. Most important in this allusion are the implications for the captain’s identity and voice. Captain Molyneux’s voice is given a sarcastic, disrespectful tone; he uses

20 Economic liberalism in the nineteenth century was organised by individual decisions rather than institutions (Adams 2001, 20).
profane words, and has materialistic interests. He cannot understand why the main street is deserted, and the shops vacant until a church bell rings and breaks into his story of the bay's silence; only then does he realise it is Sunday: “It’s the Sabbath, by G—[and] these holy s—s’ll be a—braying in their rickety church” (476). After a steady climb the captain, Ewing, Goose and Boerhaave reach the church, where they are viewed with suspicion by the silent Nazarene Indians.

In comparison to the Indians, Giles Horrox, the preacher–leader is bold and direct:


Although Horrox interrogates the visitors, he is easily seduced by the captain’s verbal introduction of the men as respectable, an effect largely achieved through speech inflexions, and the men’s titles, such as, Mr. Boerhaave “of the Dutch Reformist Church,” Dr. Henry Goose, “Physician of the London Gentry [and] late of the Feejee Mission” [and] Mr Adam Ewing “American Notary of Letters [and] Law” (477). Seduced by the captain’s charade, Preacher Horrox, welcomes the men to the parsonage for lunch. Over lunch Horrox’s voice sounds out the colonising battle between the missionaries and the Spartan-like warriors of Borabora on the beach at Bethlehem Bay (478).

After lunch, Ewing walks the main street of the settlement alone. Hearing the sound of singing, he follows the sound to the church. But when he arrives there, the singing stops and he sees: “A rotund White stood in the pulpit sermonizing” (481) on

---

21 The London Missionary Society was established in 1795, through William Carey’s missionary work with Bengal Mission. During the nineteenth century the society expanded to the Pacific Islands after the establishment of a British colony in New South Wales, Australia (Houghton 1980, 205).
the benefits of smoking to an Indian congregation. Here music is shown as not only important for Ewing as an individual but for the social connections and interactions it brings about. He hears the quasi-preacher instructing the local blacks in lyrical, Biblical-style to intensify the importance of his message:

“So it came to pass, see, Saint Peter ... taughteth ... what was what with the Old Baccy, an’ this is what I’m teachin’ you now, see ... Nah, Tarbaby, you’re doing it all wrong, see, you load your baccy in the fat end ... Do it like Mudfish next to you” (482; italics in original).

Even at this mundane level the music in Ewing’s story effectively articulates radically unequal relations of power. Foisting a smoking culture onto the Indians, and thereby creating a nicotine addiction, the mission coerces locals to work for them, and to earn money to buy tobacco. A young white missionary named Mr Wagstaff observes the farce with Ewing. He tells Ewing that the practice has its history in a missionary endeavour in Tahiti, where the missionaries believed that Polynesians “spurn industry” because they have no need for money (482).

Ewing’s narrative presents competing interpretations of greed, lust for power, and hope, and in this context the lengthy discussion over dinner between Horrox and Goose that night is illuminating. For example, Horrox embellishes a theory that “Nature’s Laws [and] Progress move as one ... The superior shall relegate the overpopulous savages to their natural number” (488). The speech is influenced by Spencer and Goose interrupts to promote his own thesis on the laws of survival influenced by Darwin (489). As such, the reader hears the civilising intent of the mission, as well as Goose’s pessimistic view of the necessary extinction of certain cultural and racial others.
To Horrox’s displeasure, Goose argues that the white race of all dominions are rapacious “for treasure, gold, spices [and] dominion … This rapacity, yes, powers our Progress; for ends infernal or divine I know not” (489). Horrox’s belief that white races dominate the world with divine grace and Goose’s counter-thesis are heard in echoes the following morning through Ewing’s stream-of-consciousness narration. He observes Indian workers singing while weeding a copra field. Wagstaff is the assigned overseer of the Indian quasi-slaves and he carries a whip but is said to use seldom. Mission-appointed Indian guards have the job of “leading hymns (“land shanties”) [and] reprimanding slackers” (491; brackets insitu). The music referenced here suggests it has a social purpose of unifying and calming a group that might otherwise be disorderly or un-productive (Locke 2001, 504).

Without comment, and in silence, Ewing moves away from the plantation and into a schoolroom where five white and five black females are participating in a revue. The schoolroom scene links Ewing’s narrative to the wider nineteenth-century debate on the role of music in women’s lives and female education. Literary theorist Delia da Sousa Correa suggests that advocates for radical reform of women’s education in Victorian times, including Mary Wollstonecraft, condemned music education on the basis that it favoured emotional sensitivity, domesticity and marriage at the expense of reason (da Sousa Correa 2003, 61-2). da Sousa Correa explains that feminist reformers were not against music as such, but suggested its inclusion in a “professional” education rather than domiciled in a “conventional feminine preoccupation with trivia” (da Sousa Correa 2003, 63).

According to Erspamer, music, like lyric poetry “possesses semiotic value” (2002, 145) that could “transcend barriers created by differences in social class, ethnicity, and
religion or it can accentuate such barriers” (2002, 146). Thus the power and influence of the religious leaders in Bethlehem Bay over the Indigenous community is heard in the voice of each girl as she recites a commandment and sings a choral work: “O! Home Where Thou Art Loved the Best” (491). Music in this sense, Erspamer explains, becomes a focus for “social interaction”, therefore, of injustice, or of interest between the performer and the listener (2002, 146). In the above, Ewing is not interested in the lyrics; instead his attention is diverted from the voices to material matters and specifically to nostalgia and the piano, “whose past was more glorious than its present” (491).

Music in the scene above is prevented (by the narrator) from becoming a universal carriage of change that embraces differences in class and race. Instead, the reader hears the repercussions faced by the black girls following the choral performance: when they are silenced and excluded from the question-and-answer time with Ewing. Singing in the colonisers’ language, but unable to understand the meaning of the words is shown to raise barriers and to accentuate conflict as “only White misses raised their hands” (491).

As Ewing, Goose, Captain Molyneux and Boerhaave depart the island, Mrs Horrox informs Ewing that “departees’ were once presented with a garland of plumeria, but the Mission elders deemed garlands immoral. ‘If we allow garlands today, it will be dancing tomorrow. If there is dancing tomorrow … She shuddered. [Ewing says] ‘Tis a pity” (492). The irony heard in Ewing’s voice characterises the reality that the Indigenous people of the Bethlehem Bay community are exploited, manipulated and inaudible to those in authority.
4. Back at sea

The fourth song of the song cycle begins with Goose interrupting Ewing’s journal writing, by seeking the latter’s help with rhyming words for his epic poem dedicated to the once whipped slave, the “True History of Autua, Last Moriori” (492), written in the Byronic heroic tradition. Ewing, troubled by his experiences at Bethlehem Bay, meditates on Melville’s recently published novel, Typee (1846), which details crimes against Islanders committed by Pacific missionaries. Ewing considers whether or not Indians of Raiatea and Chatham Isle would prefer to remain undiscovered. The context for this question in Ewing’s narrative has its roots in Spencer’s deliberations on progress and human endeavour echoed in Horrox’s account of assisting Indians in their climb up “Civilization’s Ladder” and Darwin’s theories on the survival of the fittest implicated in Goose’s pessimistic rhymes on survival (488-9). Ewing, more optimistically, decides that in all professions there are “some good, some bad … Is not ascent their sole salvation?” (492). The ascent here implicitly refers to the role of the church, although he recognises that his youthful ideas of Christian hope and common good have diminished, as have his deeply held beliefs in social progress. Such ideals are incompatible with the inequality he observes on land and at sea.

Ewing hears the seven bellssignalling the first watch change at 11.30 pm. He walks the deck unable to sleep through the noise, the sailors’ songs, and the debilitating effect of his “worm” (497). On the deck, he is baffled to find Rafael in a drunken stupor, and lying in the foetal position. The next day, while Ewing is leaning over the ship’s bulwark vomiting, a side effect of his cerebral “worm” infestation (498), Rafael’s hanged body is found. The discovery is heralded by the muffled cry of Mr Roderick, the ship’s second mate, the cry expressing deep emotion and disturbance. Rafael died, it is
discovered, between the end of his watch and the sound of the first bell. Goose, repeating the words of Bentnail, tells Ewing that Rafael, entrapped by Boerhaave and his lackey of preying sailors, had been sexually abused for weeks. Ewing seeks justice for Rafael, but Goose sounds caution as “innocence falls prey to savagery” (499). In the aftermath of Rafael’s death, the reader learns more of Ewing’s own childhood woes. Finally, Ewing confronts the captain over the abhorrent assaults, but without evidence he is powerless to implicate Boerhaave as the perpetrator. Dismissed by the captain, the final note to Rafael’s story is heard in Ewing’s determination and belief that: “no state of tyranny reigns forever” (500).

Goose’s story of moral and emotional bankruptcy in his private and public life are woven together in all the characters’ stories. For example, the reader learns that Ewing’s health has been deteriorating because Goose, as an opportunist predator, has been poisoning him. When Goose reports to the captain that Ewing’s condition is contagious, Ewing is isolated in quarantine. At this point, Goose can murder Ewing without fear of being seen. While in the grip of death, Ewing overhears Goose’s nihilistic, venomous, and deceitful words to Autua, who is seeking to visit Ewing. When Goose falsely says that Ewing does not want to see him, Ewing realises the truth: “My worm? A fiction, implanted by the doctor’s power of suggestion! Goose, a doctor? No, an itinerant, murdering confidence trickster!” (503). But Goose’s capacity to deceive is boundless and, in a dramatic turn, he imitates the stricken Ewing’s voice in a poetic performance with ventriloquist, operatic undertones:

Let me guess what you’re trying to tell me—‘Oh, Henry, we were friends, Henry how could you do this to me? [He mimicked my hoarse, dying whisper.] … “Surgeons are a singular brotherhood, Adam. To us, people aren’t sacred beings crafted in the Almighty’s image, no, people are joints of meat; diseased, leathery meat … He mimicked my usual voice very well. ‘But why me, Henry, are we not friends?’ Well, Adam, even friends are
made of meat. ‘Tis absurdly simple. I need money ... ‘But, Henry, this is wicked!’ But, Adam, the world is wicked ... You will be dead within the hour [and] for me, ‘tis hey, ho! For the open road (503-4; italics in original). 22

In the excerpt above, Goose colonises Ewing’s voice and renders him silent before fleeing the scene. Then Autua, quick-thinking and persistent, discounts Goose’s lies and breaks open the door to save Ewing from certain death. This spectacle is reminiscent of one of Wagner’s dramatic operas as Autua sends the ship’s first mate, Boerhaave, a Dutchman, flying over the ship’s bulwark, before he carries Ewing down the gangplank to the dock. The scene draws the fourth song to its conclusion.

5. **On land once more: Honolulu**

The fifth and final song in the song cycle of the first novella is set in Honolulu. Ewing records that, from the harbour through lanes

bustling with innumerable tongues, hues, creeds [and] odors. My eyes met a Chinaman’s as he rested beneath a carved dragon. A pair of women whose paint [and dress] advertised their ancient calling ... (505)

colouring the street with unity and diversity. As Autua carries the incapacitated Ewing through the streets he enquires of strangers:

“Where doctor, friend?” Thrice he is ignored ... before an old fish seller grunted directions to a sick house (505).

The foreign sounds establish a mix of languages and cultures that Ewing hears, sees and determines as exotic difference in race, creed and vocations. In spite of the socio-political-cultural-religious mix, he also hears prejudice against Autua’s black face,

---

22 Hey Ho! For the Open Road” is an old song listed in the *Catalog of Copyright Entries: Musical Compositions, Part 3* (United States Government Printing Office 1939, 2369).
a prejudice that may now affect his survival: “‘No medicine for stinking Blacks’” (505). 

Through patience and commitment Autua finally makes his marginalised self heard, in a different language.

A nun tried to “shoo” us away with a broom, but Autua enjoined her, in Spanish as broken as his English, to grant his White charge sanctuary. Finally, one sister who evidently knew Autua arrived [and] persuaded the others that the savage was on a mission not of malice but of mercy (506).

In the above excerpt, Autua defies the nun’s order to “shoo” (506). In his persistence, Autua communicates his message in Spanish. Although his voice sounds unusual, “broken”, it is recognised by one sister who manages to convince the majority on the truth of Autua’s story. This is the starting point for a new appreciation of the role that language and music must perform in this narrative. Each story harnessed so far in Ewing’s story is unfulfilled. It is as if, as J. Hillis Miller suggests: “Each story and each repetition or variation of it leaves some uncertainty … And so we need another story, and then another story, and yet another” (Miller in Kramer 1996, 101). In this novella, alternative—and/or “foreign”—sounds must enter the narration to rupture the dominant order and accommodate a variety of experiences that suspend endings, create divergence and instability until Ewing’s narrative metaphorically threads these stories together.

At night, as a patient in the hospital, Ewing has time to philosophise about his experiences. He hears imaginary music that sounds like a running stream, “the stream grinding boulders into pebbles through an unhurried eternity” (507). The water image is represented in Ewing’s story as if the flow of the thoughts to scholars formulating histories and laws “that govern the rises and fall over civilisations” (507).

23 In 1848 Richard Wagner wrote: “I will destroy the order of things that turns millions into slaves of a few ... ” (1966, 237).
The final image in Ewing’s story, and thus the novel as a whole, is significant and poignant. From the infirmary, and at a distance, the reader hears Ewing deliberating:

Belief is both prize [and] battlefield, within the mind [and] in the mind’s mirror, the world. If we believe humanity is a ladder of tribes ... If we believe that humanity may transcend tooth [and] claw, if we believe diversified races [and] creeds can share this world ... if we believe leaders must be just, violence muzzled, power accountable [and] riches of the Earth [and] its Oceans shared equitably, such a world will come to pass (508).

Ewing’s musing refers to all the stories in his narrative and to his own conscience, and he informs the reader of his transformation and intent to make a difference in his society when he returns to San Francisco. “I shall pledge myself to the Abolitionist cause, because I owe my life to a self-freed slave [and] because I must begin somewhere” (508).

It appears Ewing’s aim is to tell the truth of what he has learned through his travels and how he will work at a localised level. But this response is only possible in as far as his invented fiction is heard. Such grand thinking by Ewing is immediately contested in an imaginary dialogue with his father-in-law: “Oho, fine ... but don’t tell me about justice ... Naïve, dreaming Adam ... your life amounted to no more than one drop in a limited ocean!” (509). Then, the reader hears Ewing’s resilient response: “Yet what is any ocean but a multitude of drops?” (509).

The sound of one drop dropping in an ocean composed of multiple drops is, of course, inaudible, but as literary theorist Peter Dayan writes, “while the music is in the process of vanishing, literature lives ...” (2006, 133). Paying attention to music in a narrative is an act of listening in to the depth of stories that need to be heard as an intersection of “rhetoric and history” (Kramer 1996, 121). The conclusion to the music supplement heard in Ewing’s piano narrative decentres the authoritative speaker, as
histories of excluded voices are told as imaginary voices and sounds and songs that can be recognised and answered, but never heard the same way twice.

**Conclusion**

Throughout the various historical and geographical spaces traversed in the first novella of *Cloud Atlas*, music and sound signify diversity, resistance, hope and freedom for the narrator-protagonist and for the marginalised characters. Music effects in narrative are supplementary, and comparable to a film score. In this chapter, I have established how Western art music, non-Western music and musical experiences draws the reader’s attention to marginalised voices and to the protagonist Adam Ewing’s solo in the novella “The Pacific Journal of Adam Ewing”.

In particular, I have shown how the narrative and style of narration in Adam Ewing’s narrative draws attention to the musical sounds, form and practice in the telling of stories of oppressed and marginalised groups and individuals. In this way, I have demonstrated how music as supplement to the narrative is interwoven in Ewing’s narrative as an alternative means to signify radically unequal relations of power and prejudice endemic at local, national and global levels. Each novella in *Cloud Atlas* creates a paradigm shift in key and style heard in each virtuosic individual solo. The key to the *Cloud Atlas Sextet*’s success is heard as all solo performers provide insight into the role of music in their experiences. Of significance, the intimate silences often suggest something missing or unspoken, and this absence can serve to begin the process of uniting communities by drawing attention to persistent social injustice in various times and places. Changing attitudes, overcoming prejudices and pessimism in the novella begins and ends with Ewing’s story. Like the ripple effect of a drop of water
in an ocean, music has the power to touch the heart and change the attitude of all who are listening. Following Ewing’s example, the novel implies that change begins within the individual and this suggests to the reader that it is up to each one to heal relationships in the world.
Chapter 3

*Dirt Music Sonata*

**Introduction**

Tim Winton’s seventh novel, *Dirt Music* (2001), is set in Western Australia during the last decade of the twentieth century.¹ In this chapter, I read the novel as structured like a sonata and argue that the sonata form interacts with the subject matter of the narrative to enhance the reader’s understanding of a range of Australian issues, such as conservation and the environment, cultural diversity, and Indigenous issues.² In this regard it must be noted that both the novel and the sonata form, a classical European music form, share their roots in the eighteenth century and express themselves in part through conventions that evolved in Western history (Witkin 2005, 28)

Sonata form is generally used as the first movement in a multi-movement composition, such as a symphony or concerto. In music theory terms, the sonata form is a single movement divided into an exposition, a development section and recapitulation (a ternary structure). The sonata form is written ABA or ABA¹. A literary sonata is more often written as ABA¹ (the numerical indice is used in music to distinguish a repetition of the same key or theme). The recapitulation repeats expositional material but with a difference. Overall, the large-scale sonata form in music has a binary structure that unites two contrasting themes—a primary and a secondary theme—into a coherent whole (Brown 1948, 162).

---

¹ References to *Dirt Music* are from the 2009 Picador edition and will be cited parenthetically.
² Narrative design structured on the sonata form has been observed to inform work by writers such as Anthony Burgess, James Joyce, Thomas Mann and Virginia Woolf (Chamberlin 2006, 11).
Sonata form is the most significant of the macrostructure individual music movements from the eighteenth century and has been described as neither “a set of ‘textbook’ rules nor a fixed scheme” (Hepokoski and Darcy 2006, 15). I aim to demonstrate that the sonata form’s built-in dynamic tension advances the linear trajectory of Winton’s novel with the sonata’s contrasting themes present in the novel as the tonal realisation of past and present tenses. I draw on Kramer’s (2011), McClary’s (1991), James Hepokoski’s and Warren Darcy’s (2006) work on hermeneutic inquiry and sonata form analysis respectively to demonstrate how reading the novel through the sonata form constructs particular understandings of Dirt Music. As I will discuss, Kramer argues that a hermeneutic interpretation of a work reinforces “singularity” rather than “generality” of a phenomena that is historically peculiar, culturally arbitrary and debatable (2011, 2, 8-11). Hepokoski and Darcy suggest that their “Sonata Theory” analyses “form as dialogue” in music in relation to norms, such as themes, deformations, tonality and tempos (2006, 11; 558).

Winton himself stated at the launch of Dirt Music, that “on a literal level there is a lot of music in the book” (Ben-Messahel 2006, 211). In the first book-length critical study of Winton’s oeuvre, Salhia Ben-Messahel acknowledges that Dirt Music’s story “arises from the music of the land and is a symphony on the theme of Western Australia” (2006, 12), but she, and more recent work on Winton, provide little discussion of the role of music in the text (McCredden and O’Reilly 2014). The title Dirt Music, unlike Brian Castro’s The Bath Fugues (2009) or Toni Morrison’s Jazz (1992), does not literally suggest a music form or genre, but is a metaphor for both the environmental sounds and country blues music heard at the surface level of the narrative, as well as, I will argue, the political tensions in Australia at the time of its
writing. For example, during the 1970s and 1980s environmental groups across the states and territories of Australia formed alliances to strengthen and consolidate their long-term environmental and conservation reforms. However, it was not until 1992 that these alliances came together to form the political party, the Australian Greens, part of a global movement which in part aims to protest against and prevent potential environmental disasters (Brown and Singer 1996, 5-42).

The pairing of dirt with music in the title may be read not only as an enviro-musico motif but also as a pairing of image and texture with sound. These two recur throughout the novel and are often used to refer to and bring together disparate elements. For example, nature is represented as sound consistently as: “The paddocks thrum with cicadas, crickets, birdwings” (86) and the tides are represented as “ebbing and flowing in a nearly incessant murmur” (353). Nature’s power as a representation of mental and environmental disturbance is also evident when the water is associated with “delirium … something special in the way the reef morphs and throbs” (126), and when the “earth thrums beneath [Fox], stirs a thousand grinding clanks and groans” (232), and “the sound of the world is raw” (369).³

In this chapter I show how the novel’s sonata form and ternary structure—exposition, development and a recapitulation—interacts with the novel’s key binary themes of dysfunction and dislocation. These binary themes move towards relationship and connection in the development before returning to the themes of dysfunction and dislocation in the recapitulation section. In this sense, the sonata form ensures the inextricability of content and form; as Adorno writes: “Form can only be form of a content” (1992, 6). Hence, the exposition, development and recapitulation

³ Words can never become music, but as Prieto explains, writers can use musical syntax in word patterns, with the differing length of sentences as tension and resolution to harness allusions to musical models and technique that metaphorically affect the “real-world” issues for the reader (2002a, 53).
patterns of the sonata form act like markers to divide the text into three sections. In this sense, central to the sonata form design is the inherent progression toward a predetermined aim (Hepokoski and Darcy 2006, 16-7). Section one of the novel comprises the exposition, sections two to seven the development, and section eight the recapitulation. In this regard, the novel encourages the reader to make connections and identify contrasts between the three different sections and it is in these interconnections, contrasts and correlations that I have read in relation to sonata form.

Overall, the sonata form is a musico-formal movement that can evoke the broadest and most intimate concerns of humanity by “telling the grand themes of quest, renewal and closure” (Burnham 2001, 208). It is worth noting that Leonard Ratner likens sonata form to a “debate”, while Hepokoski and Darcy compare it to an utterance that instigates a dialogue at the acoustic level of the text that the reader then hears (Ratner in Chamberlin 2006, 11; 2006, 9-11). The binary structure in Dirt Music—its primary theme of dysfunction and secondary theme of dislocation—is informed by the novel’s central relationship between Georgie Jutland, a forty-year old ex-nurse, and seasoned overseas traveller, and local musician Luther Fox. The third significant protagonist is Jim Buckridge, Georgie’s wealthy and powerful lover who adds a third dimension to Georgie and Fox, represented as the binary subjects in that he threatens to destabilise them. It is Georgie’s dysfunctional theory of love, her

---

4 Calvin Brown describes instrumental music as narrative in terms of the composer’s ability to represent “a series of actions involving characters and objects in their progressive relationships” (1948, 257). Kramer considers the idea of music as narrative troublesome (instrumental music cannot tell stories), but he concedes that Renaissance instrumental music has constantly accompanied stories (1995, 110-11).

5 Georgie Jutland is referred henceforth as Georgie, and Luther Fox, as Fox, as is consistent with the novel.
wishes, her confusion and her longing for guidance that becomes eroticised through explicit and implicit references to music in the novel (333).

The theme of dysfunction personified in Georgie’s story, launches the sonata form’s trajectory and emotive tone. Dysfunction establishes the specific key and mood of the drama in the sonata and initiates the events of the exposition, instigating Fox’s journey away from home (enacting the secondary theme of dislocation), as he embarks on a quest for identity. The two-part outline leads into a progressively comprehensive and diverse narrative that, I argue, is shaped by the sonata form. I aim to demonstrate how, in the novel, the sonata form’s dynamic tension interacts with the ternary form to advance a linear trajectory in echoing the wider issues of the binary themes including identity, conservation, reconciliation, and forgiveness. In order to explore these ideas further a brief synopsis of the novel is provided below.

**Reading *Dirt Music***

In *Dirt Music* the erudite musician Luther Fox abandons his hobby farm located at the perimeter of a marginalised seaside community named White Point. White Point is represented as a typical Western Australian coastal town, with a fluctuating, seasonal population. The novel shows that during the 1950s, White Point was a lawless, violent town populated by returned soldiers, drifters and migrants. Though women arrived later, the town remains fractured, dysfunctional, and racist. There are no black or Asian faces in White Point, just gaudy-looking houses that replaced tin sheds when the rock lobster boom made local fishermen wealthy overnight. Like much of Winton’s work, *Dirt Music* depicts marginalised characters living in regional, isolated communities in Western Australia.
Fox is portrayed as full of grief one year on from a tragic car accident that claimed the lives of his only sibling William (Darkie), his sister-in-law Sal, his nine-year-old nephew Bullet and his six-year-old niece Bird. Fox was nine years old when his mother died after being speared by a falling tree bough during a storm. Eight years later his father Wally died a slow death from mesothelioma. Such losses have changed Fox and now he refuses to play or listen to music, though as a boy, he had tuned into the intimate sounds of nature: “the breathing leaves, the air displaced by birds” (104).

Although his intuitive ear and vivid observation dulled after his mother died, as a boy he kept his music. As an adult, without music, Fox is unable to express himself and his daily life is a repetitive project of forgetting and deliberately disremembering (103). His work of pilfering fish at White Point and selling his catch to a Vietnamese restaurateur, whose own history is one of war and retribution, gets Fox through each day.

Rejecting her privileged background, Georgie comes to live in White Point with her wealthy lover, Jim Buckridge, a recent widower and the father of two young sons. He has power in the White Point community, and a reputation as an intimidator. Georgie’s and Fox’s paths cross when Fox is on his way home from an early morning dive with a truck load of illegal fish, and Georgie is stranded next to a broken-down car. The meeting leads to a brief affair. Fox then receives a violent, anonymous threat to his life that forces him into a quest for self-discovery. He hitch-hikes north to Broome, and from there organises a flight to Coronation Gulf, an isolated island off the Kimberley coast of Western Australia where he re-discovers the art of playing and listening to music.

The event that shapes Georgie’s story begins with a dispute over a video game between Georgie and Buckridge’s younger son, Josh, and his retaliation in calling her
stepmother: “She could barely believe that a single word might do her in” (10). The crisis, which prevents her from sleeping, becomes a catalyst for change in Georgie’s future at White Point. This is also the night she unveils the fish-poaching life of the thirty-six-year-old Fox. In contrast to Georgie and Buckridge, Fox has no identity in the seaside town and a family history of alienation pits Fox against White Point’s community. This history in turn links to the local Aboriginals’ story of dispossessing from the land that is yet to be fully acknowledged in Australia. In this sense, the structure of the sonata form informs Dirt Music’s themes of dysfunction and dislocation in terms of an ongoing search for identity by Fox as he journeys away from White Point toward the north of Australia and the idea of his recuperation. In the following section I discuss sonata form and tonality in theory and practice to demonstrate how Dirt Music’s themes advance the linear progression of the novel’s plot to address a range of Australia’s cultural, environmental and socio-political issues.

Sonata form and tonality in theory and practice

Emerging during the period of Enlightenment, the sonata form in music enabled audiences without a musical background to anticipate the shape of the musical piece, and to judge its harmonic (tonal) and rhetorical themes or subjects (Smyth 2008, 44-7; Prieto 2002a, 49). In particular, sonata form over the course of the nineteenth century, was modified by a number of composers, including Beethoven (1795-1822), who resisted the form’s traditional adherence to uniformity in favour of developing its diverse and individualistic elements. This was consistent with encouraging a more spontaneous personal response by the listener to a musical work (Smyth 2008, 45). In

---

6 McClary argues that musical practice has been reconfigured differently in different historical eras according to the praxis available to the composer (1991, 25).
a nineteenth-century sonata, the opening theme of the binary form was customarily associated with an energetic, dominant masculine subject in comparison to a secondary, feminine, lyrical theme. In reverse, Dirt Music’s primary theme, I argue, is personified as an antiphonic female protagonist and the secondary theme manifests through a lyrical male lead.

Music theorist and musician Charles Rosen argues that unless the listener understands the oppositional tonality behind the changes in the sonata form, the music itself will not be understood (Rosen in Cook 1990, 47). I suggest that the same principle applies to the representation of music in Dirt Music, where certain voices or tones characterise the different protagonists’ stories. In particular, the interwoven, yet distinct and alternating stories of Georgie and Fox accentuate the tension as each story is narrated in a different tone, tense and voice. Georgie’s story of dysfunction is told in an atonal voice narrated in past tense (as in the first excerpt below) while Fox’s story of dislocation (in the second excerpt below) unfolds in a free-flowing melodic voice narrated in present tense.

When Georgie sat down before the terminal she was gone in her seat, like a pensioner at the pokies, gone for all money. Into the welter of useless information night after night to confront people and notions she could do without (4).

When he coils droplines back into tubs and racks up hooks by their crimped traces, the diesel generator drones behind the wall. He stows the gear up on the boat, checks his batteries and steering, tilts each motor up and down before wiping off the screen and console (51).

---

7 German composer and music theorist Adolph Bernhard Marx (1845) considered that the secondary theme might be determined as feminine. His suggestion quickly transpired into music theory (Marx in McClary 1991, 15).

8 McClary argues that the history of tonality was gendered—the sonata form in particular—and theorised as “masculine and feminine themes” (up until the 1960s) (1991, 13).
The narration of these subjects’ monologues and dialogues in different tones and tenses modulates Georgie’s and Fox’s voices and represents rising tensions between past and present. In an interview with Magdalena Ball, Winton explained that the use of the two tenses in *Dirt Music* “helps to distinguish the worlds that [Georgie and Fox] are in ... to make them seem to be inhabiting worlds of their own ... to express their own personalities and experiences” (Ball 2003). Representing different characters’ voices in different tenses is also evident in the sonata form in music. For example, McClary acknowledges a dissociation between two voices in most opening movements of the nineteenth-century symphony (1991, 68). The different tonalities in *Dirt Music*’s sonata form consolidate the key characters’ identities by accentuating the harmonic disparity in Georgie’s and Fox’s stories. This strategy of dissonance, which draws the attention of the listener, has been identified as significant to the sonata form in music. For example, Gottfried Leibnitz (1697/1969) defers to great composers mixing dissonant with consonant chords to incite or “sting” the listener into appreciating the outcome of their work (Leibnitz in Attali 1985, 27). In *Dirt Music*, the dissonance works to create contrast, and develop tension and release as shifts in tempo and mood.9

Section one (the exposition) is composed of forty-one snippet-like modules where the primary theme of dysfunction (Georgie’s story) dominates the first half, and the secondary theme of dislocation (Fox’s story) dictates the second half.10 The primary theme initiates the linear trajectory of the novel: “One night in November ... Georgie ... had to wonder what was happening to her” (3-10). The primary theme, an important element of the sonata form, denotes the “personality and drama of each individual

---

9 Tempo as the pace of a piece is often modulated by the length of the sentences whereas mood is developed by word choice.
10 Hepokoski and Darcy argue that a musical sonata’s exposition is split in two halves by the medial caesura (MC) which is a pause-like break in the middle of the exposition (2006, 23).
work” (Hepokoski and Darcy 2006, 69). Hepokoski and Darcy argue that the primary theme of the sonata form might display a number of characteristics and emotional states (2006, 65). This is true in *Dirt Music*, as dysfunction is styled in the novel as a multidimensional succession of emotions, including, depression, loss of self esteem, and rage. It includes the voices of a number of characters, such as Beaver (the local White Point garage proprietor), Buckridge and his sons, Brad and Josh, and other disaffected individuals within the community. In *Dirt Music* the quieter beginning befits Georgie’s mundane existence as the reader learns that her social life is reduced to connecting with the outside world via internet chat rooms and a variety of websites: “nice to be without a body for a while; there was an addictive thrill in being of no age, no gender with no past” (4).

After consolidating dysfunction as the primary theme early in the exposition, the narrator creates the first of a series of intermittent transitions that introduce the secondary theme of dislocation. In the music form of sonata, such transitions are bridge-like phrases that occur when the primary theme modulates toward the secondary theme before the secondary theme is fully acknowledged around the middle of the exposition (Hepokoski and Darcy 2006, 117). For example, after Georgie gets up from her swivel chair (4), the reader learns that she goes through the sliding doors to the terrace where the breeze is fresh and thick with the scents of the sea: “On the beach something flashed ... probably just a gull ... And now the sound of a petrol engine, eight cylinders ... A moment of unscripted action in White Point” (5-7). This excerpt develops the idea of the primary theme of dysfunction (represented by Georgie) modulating toward the secondary theme when she stumbles across a boat trailer and a dog tied to the roo-bar of a truck, she hears a boat splutter off into the
distance. At this point, the relationship between the theme of dysfunction and dislocation is withheld. As in a musical sonata, after arousing the curiosity of the listener/reader as to the identity of the person on the boat (representing dislocation), the primary theme of dysfunction returns when the reader learns Georgie’s thoughts about her partner Buckridge. Buckridge, the only child of the founding father of White Point, has a complex reputation within the White Point community (37). To Georgie, he had seemed respectable, but after three years with him, Georgie is apprehensive: “recently something in her had leaked away” (9).

A subtle progression of emotions associated with the primary theme of dysfunction continues to dominate the expositional writing in the first sixty pages. In Georgie’s narrative, regret is linked to her theory of love, a sudden end to her nursing career, and the loss of her independence (11-12). Another level of dysfunction is represented as the harsh reality of life during the early days of White Point’s first settlement. White Point is represented as a wild and racist coastal town, with a history of lawlessness, intimidation and treachery (17). Arsonists, acting on behalf of Bill Buckridge destroy fishing boats and family businesses, and gun shots are fired at poachers who contravene local protocol (37, 87). The male residents of the town have brutal relationships with women, and the women are represented as rough and tough in a place where silence protects criminals, deviants and racist “red necks” (17-18).

The primary theme of dysfunction links to the secondary theme of dislocation in a number of ways. For example, while music had given Fox some credibility in the town, he abandons the idea of playing music after the car accident. Fox’s more recent and clandestine work of fish mongering refers to another connection in relation to the character of Go, a Vietnamese restaurateur to whom Fox sells his catch. Go lives in the
city and works within the Vietnamese community, but is isolated from the wider community. Fox himself links Go’s ethnicity to the Vietnam gangs, the Triads:

You got abalone, Lu?
...
No abs, says Fox.
Ah, that’s bad.
You could buy it legit, you know.
Two hunnerd dollar a kilo? You fuckin crazy?
...
Fox doesn’t mind not bringing abalone. He knows most of it will go to the Triads. It’s a shitload of trouble (27-8).

Fox’s assumptions and preconceptions link Go’s ethnicity to the Triad gangs, albeit without evidence.

With an increase in Asian immigration into Australia during the 1990s, new cultures, traditions, and stories challenged dominant ideas about what it meant to be an Australian. At the time, a growing concern about immigration, and particularly Asian immigration, created anxiety amongst some sections of the community. As a result the political party One Nation emerged under the leadership of Pauline Hanson. The One Nation party sought to abolish multiculturalism, restrict immigration and foreign ownership to protect and preserve Australia’s history and sovereignty. The theme of dislocation in Fox’s narrative shows his attempt to identify himself with Go:

We’re both in the same position, you know.
Bullshit! I been through a war. And then South China fuckin Sea and Malaysia camps and Darwin. And fifteen people looking up to me, Lu. Not the same!
Go, there weren’t any abalone, ooright? It was too rough to dive.
...
Next time abalone.
We’ll see.
...
Shake hand now (29).

---

11 By the end of the 1990s internal disputes led to the party’s demise (Koleth 2010).
In keeping with the rotation inherent to the sonata form, the primary theme of dysfunction returns when Georgie’s relationship with Buckridge disintegrates, and she spies on Fox (43). Of significance is Georgie’s sudden decision to leave Buckridge (58). At this juncture in the novel, the sequential and rhetorical narratives of Georgie and Fox alternate more quickly, creating rapid shifts in tempo and mood. Georgie’s story jumps forwards to a meeting with Fox as he is on his way home from an early morning dive. Fox is late out of the water because he has attempted to fulfil Go’s order for abalone. Coincidentally, Georgie is there next to her broken-down car. Fox stops to assist and when he discovers Georgie is going into the city (to seek refuge from Buckridge) he offers her a ride. After a period of silence, discussion between them develops around the topics of literature (72-4). Through the omniscient narrator’s voice, the reader learns of Georgie’s irrational theory on love (75) and Fox’s love of books (73, 75) and his distaste for music (77).

A clash voiced in the past tense (Georgie) and present tense (Fox) is heard as events unfold and conspire against Fox on their arrival at the hotel. First his dress is inappropriate for bar service and he is refused entry. Then when Georgie suggests a drink in her room: “She grabs a fistful of his shirt and drags him inside … She kisses him; he stands there and lets it happen” (78-9). After sex, “Fox lies back a mess. He tries to swim up through pangs of guilt, his unfocussed sense of betrayal. But betrayal of whom?” (81). The goal of the primary theme in a two-part exposition (of a sonata form) is to fully disclose the secondary theme. As such Georgie is represented as insensitive to Fox as she presses him for answers to her questions: “So how does it feel

12 An acceleration of tempo in the final transition is the most common convention of the two-part exposition that forecasts a medial caesura and the complete identity of the secondary theme (Hepokoski and Darcy 2006, 23).
to be a poacher?” (81). Without waiting for Fox’s answer, Georgie launches from another angle:

You got away without telling me your name, she says. He likes the straight line of hair across her eyes.

Lu.

I’m Georgie.

Pleased to meet you (81).

In accord with the sonata form, the primary theme of dysfunction sounds out the secondary theme of dislocation in that Fox is represented as a poacher both in relation to the fish, and in relation to Georgie. During the discussion that ensues their conversation focuses on fishery laws and conservation:

Don’t you feel you’re ripping off the sea?

No.

But you’re breaking the law, you admit that.

Why would I admit anything to a stranger?

Well, ouch for that. It’s just that … there are rules. You know, to protect the environment.

You honestly believe that?

Well, yes.

...  

I only take what I need, he says. I’m one pair of hands.

Without a licence (82).

Such challenging questions and answers which relate to Australian environmental laws and conservation create tension between the two themes of dysfunction and dislocation. These are also raised in the narrative when Fox travels through the town of Wittenoom and recalls his father’s slow death from mesothelioma and the “monumental bastardry of the cover-up” (229).

In the sonata form, the secondary theme is not less important than the primary theme, and the idea of the “other” theme attracts “considerable allure and even with a measure of ... power and truth” (Kramer 1996, 37). In Dirt Music, once fully identified in the writing, the secondary theme of dislocation drives the narrative’s trajectory
forward to the exposition’s closure, and on to the development section. Hepokoski and Darcy argue that the secondary theme is essential in that “what happens in the [secondary theme] makes a sonata a sonata” (2006, 117). In these terms, within the wider sonata form structure, the secondary theme has sole responsibility for drawing the exposition to a close, as well as finally, the sonata. But that is to jump ahead. In the second half of the exposition the secondary theme of dislocation enhances events when new material defines a number of “tonal moments” (Hepokoski and Darcy 2006, 117). Examples of tonal moments include instances of confrontation such as the moment when Fox learns that Jim Buckridge is Georgie’s partner:

Who is he?
Jim Buckridge.
Fuck
...
The shamateur sat up so fast it reeved the sheet off her (85).

Paying attention to what the narrative reveals at the surface level of the novel shapes the way the reader responds to the binary form of the sonata. In these terms, a discussion between the binary themes, Georgie and Fox, on the style of music the Fox band played, affects the cultural force and definition of its title: *Dirt Music*.

So what did you play?
Guitar.
I mean, what kind of music.
...
*Dirt Music.*
As in ... soil?
You *can’t* mean country and western?
Nah ... But mostly it was blues. Country blues, I spose.
...
Um, she says blankly.

---

13 Genette suggests that there are three levels to narrative design: a surface level that includes word choices and length of sentences; a second level contends with the organisation of the story as the events and characters’ stories unfold in the narrative, and finally, the critical third level that details the structure or design of the narrative (Genette 1980, 25-6).
Rootsy stuff. Old timey things.  
Folk music.  
I spose. No, not really. Well, I dunno (95; italics in original).

Georgie has limited music knowledge and although Fox is represented as a brilliant musician (202), he is unable to clearly categorise the styles he used to play. In this sense, the two protagonists complement each other as each adds a social and personal dimension to the understanding of what “dirt music” refers to. The dysfunction and dislocation themes continue to alternate in the exposition, while the secondary theme of dislocation dictates the writing by introducing new material. In Fox’s story the narrator reconstructs a particularly troubled era of Australia’s historical past by highlighting the “Stolen Generations” of Aboriginal children from the late 1800s to the 1970s.14 The reader “hears” this history during a conversation in the novel between Fox and his niece, Bird:

Kids used to run away from the camp, Bird. Lookin for their families. Your grandad used to let em stay down the creek where no one would find em. Then what happened?  

In the above excerpt, the reader can draw analogies between Fox’s story and the Aboriginal story of cultural and geographical dislocation, as echoes of dislocation and dispossession are heard in the text when an explosion destroys Fox’s truck and dog and sets up a sequence of events that force Fox to flee White Point by boat, leaving him at the mercy of the environment:

Fox goes and goes across the flat sea. The wind in his teeth ... He stares at the fuel gauge ... He considers the radio ... But he knows who will come

---

14 The Stolen Generation is the title of the government report on the children of Aboriginal descent, and some Torres Strait Islanders, who were forcibly removed from their families by past Australian federal, state and territory governments and church missions.
looking ... He goes over the side ... The sea is caramelising in the heat of the afternoon ... Like a landslip; the more you dig the more there is to be dug (135-138).

The excerpt suggests that Fox is both physically and psychologically ill-prepared for the battle still to come as he explores the relationship between his individual freedom and the White Point community. He questions both his feelings for Georgie and his poaching. He decides to abandon his farm on the margin of White Point and journey to the north of Western Australia in search of his own identity. This decision leads to the exposition’s closure and, in this sense, it can be described as the most important “tonal goal of the exposition” (Hepokoski and Darcy 2006, 117).

Fox follows the coast all the way. The far north looks fractured. So many bay and islands. And he gives a little snort of surprise to see it named. Yes, right at the top near the Timor Sea. Coronation Gulf. He turns the light out and goes back to bed but he doesn’t sleep (160).

This highlights a discussion which took place earlier in the text between Georgie and Fox about special places. Georgie indicates to Fox that her special place is Coronation Gulf. “There was somewhere once ... Coronation Gulf. And it’s way up north? In the tropics” (102; italics in original). Identifying Coronation Gulf on the atlas gives Fox hope for a new beginning and effectively draws the exposition to a close.

Dirt Music’s long development (B section), comprises sections two to seven in the novel. The development section follows the typical sonata form where the binary themes of the exposition are enhanced, with new themes inserted or contrasting material highlighted to reflect the deeper, interior integrity of the sonata (Hepokoski and Darcy 2006, 196). It is important to remember at this point that at the centre of the musical sonata form are issues of identity that create social tension within the tensive binary relationship. Manipulation and selection of motifs, and ordering of
thematic material in a musical sonata are indicative of choices, techniques and
treatment by the composer and each of these govern linear and tonal motion.\textsuperscript{15} In the
novel, as the themes of dysfunction and dislocation move forward towards
relationship and connection, they advance the linear trajectory of content and form. In
commonly accepted techniques of a sonata form’s development section, the
composer, as discussed, is free to engage numerous possibilities by “modifying,
fragmenting, complicating, and embellishing as much as his talent will permit”
(Chamberlin 2006, 14). In music, a development is not an indiscriminate sequence of
events but a carefully orchestrated selection of significant material. That is the sonata
composer must gradually weaken the secondary theme during the development phase
(compared to its strong position at the conclusion of the exposition) so that the
ultimate recapitulation and future demise will appear as reasonable and “acceptable
to the listener” (Chamberlin 2006, 14).

A music sonata development section has been described as having “a restless,
modulatory plan that stakes out one or more nontonic [secondary themes] local goals
... registering the expressive implications ... of earlier themes” (Hepokoski and Darcy
2006, 196-7). \textit{Dirt Music}’s interrelated yet fragmented development may be read as a
creative “sonata game” that alternates between the cross-referencing narratives of
Georgie and Fox “pulling irresistibly on each other’s sleeve for attention” (Hepokoski
and Darcy 2006, 252). Due to the limits of language—unlike polyphonic instrumental
music—the narratives cannot be heard within the same temporal period; Georgie’s
story unfolds in sections two, four and six and Fox’s narrative resonates in sections
three, five and seven.

\textsuperscript{15} So many composers have developed sonatas that an analysis of the development section requires a
creative, flexible approach as it is too difficult to “generalise”. (Hepokoski and Darcy 2006, 205)
The development sections of *Dirt Music* imitate a traditional sonata form rotation as the primary theme returns to dominate the writing. Georgie has little time to fantasise about Fox as she is faced with the sudden death (cerebral haemorrhage) of her mother and she returns briefly to her family home, in an affluent, riverside suburb near the city. Georgie with her sisters, Ann, Judith, and Margaret (from whom she is estranged), their partners, and her father Warwick Jutland QC, with his second wife Cynthia, gather at Georgie’s mother’s home before the funeral (166-73). Again, the development parallels a musical sonata form’s tonal expansion through introducing new characters’ voices. For example,

[Ann’s husband] greeted Georgie with an embrace of consolation from which he took more than he offered. They’re on the terrace, he said. ... It’s Margaret who’s a mess, [said Jude] ... Georgie watched as he [Judith’s husband] moved Jude with a firm hand between the shoulderblades ... Mum’s dead, Dad [said Georgie]. You don’t have to say anything ... Wasn’t last night enough for you [Georgie]? Ann cried. The kids are here. It’s Saturday, the day of your mother’s funeral, and you’re skinny dipping like a teenager in her pool? Georgie looked up at Ann in her Chanel suit (169-176).

These voices provide the reader with new insights into Georgie’s past and her difficult familial and domestic relationships. Georgie is the eldest of four daughters, and due to her individualistic, defiant and tomboyish adolescence she is the odd one out in her family. She was unable to conform or to please her fashion-conscious, shopaholic mother, and deliberately rebelled against her father (166-77). The narration picks up this theme of dysfunction as Buckridge and his sons, Brad and Josh, arrive at the crematorium to pay their respects and offer support to Georgie. After the wake, when Buckridge wants to talk about Fox, Georgie silences him, and he returns to White Point. On the morning following the funeral, the reader learns of Georgie’s premeditated scheme to go to the Fox farm. But Fox has disappeared, and his
departure unravels Georgie’s plan of moving out of her dysfunctional relationship with Buckridge and into a new arrangement with Fox with whom she associates peace: “The peaceful silence of the place. And music. A houseful of books” (184). In Fox’s absence she returns to Buckridge.

Fluctuating between living with Buckridge in White Point, grocery shopping in the city, and visiting her sister Judith, who has been diagnosed and hospitalised with mental health issues, Georgie maintains a low profile in the White Point community. But she is filled with an unidentified, simmering rage instigated by Fox’s disappearance: “She was gone on [Fox] the way she had never been before and he turned out to be just another self-absorbed prick” (191). Her rage enhances the plot as in a musical sonata: “for within this model of identity, construction and preservation, the self cannot truly be a self unless it acts; it must leave its cozy nest of its tonic [home], risk this confrontation and finally triumph over its Other” (McClary 1991, 69).

Georgie is represented as desperately seeking her independence from Buckridge, but with nowhere else to go. Like the primary theme in a musical sonata, Georgie’s story moves here and there at a local level where, in conversation with White Point residents, she discovers more about Fox. The story of Fox’s history anticipates and strengthens the larger purpose of the sonata structure.

Fox’s narrative, involving his journey away from White Point begins its development rotation in Section three where his story embellishes expositional material, such as his refusal to play or listen to music, while inserting new ideas. Through seemingly random conversations, cultural exchange, and environmental landscapes, important voices and tones are introduced that enable the reader to understand the logic of the narrative.
As Fox is represented as never having ventured far from his hobby farm on the margin of White Point, a nameless narrator guides the commentary. Beginning close to home (the tonic key) in the familiar floodplain country, Fox hitches a ride in an old truck driven by a local who prefers listening to cricket than to music. A white cross and a pair of old boots on the roadside creates visual and aural memories for Fox of his father and a Burl Ives song. These memories give Fox direction as he heads for Wittenoom. At Paynes Fyne the commentary changes as music is heard and this weakens the secondary theme in readiness for total recapitulation. That is, as a passenger in a Bedford van, Fox hears what he describes as the American jazz rock band Steely Dan’s best album, 1977 *Aja* (pronounced Asia) repeated on the van’s tape deck: “The music hammers at him ... Full of angular licks and slick changes, lyrics that peck at you. Music unstitches him now; he can do without it” (225). The music heard by Fox allows both he and the reader to aurally imagine the sounds, techniques and lyrics and therefore the reader can empathise with Fox’s emotions. The music stimulates his memories and violates his self-imposed rule of not listening to music, “I don’t play anymore” (94).

Later, outside the mining town of Newman, the narrator weaves a socio-political and enviro-musico landscape through metaphorical language, mixing visual images with imaginary sound, for the reader to imagine the beautiful landscape, hear birds screeching, and the risk to nature of iron ore mining:

the Ophthalmia Ranges whose bluffs and peaks and mesas rise crimson, black, burgundy, terracotta, orange against a cloudless sky. Gully shadows are purple up there and the rugged layers of iron lie dotted with a greenish furze of spinifex. You sense hidden rivers ... the smooth white trunks of snappy gums suspend crowns of leaves so green it’s shocking. Mobs of white cockatoos explode from their boughs (228).
Of significance to Fox’s developing story is his meeting with Bess (a retired drama teacher dying of bowel cancer) and her husband Horrie. Bess shares with Fox her philosophy of harmony and unity in nature: “A school of fish turns as one. Yes, and a flock of sparrows. They resonate. And so do we” (248). She speaks to him over a Prokofiev tape playing in the background and this “sets [Fox’s] teeth on edge and blunts whatever it is Bess is saying” (248-9). Horrie’s choice of European classical music, disturbs Fox emotionally and affects his concentration. As such he fails to understand the enormity of Bess’s observations. The effect on Fox of Shostakovich’s Piano Quintet is represented as jarring:

The music is jagged and pushy … the outbursts of strings and piano are as austere and unconsoling as the pindan plain … This music feels like it’s peeling his skin … Since that terrible night in which everything seemed to unravel in a series of jumpy, uncertain moments, everyone dead so sudden like that, all he’s wanted is to be left alone, and music is a fucking bully—it’s the last thing he needs; it’ll rip him to pieces (249-50).

One of Shostakovich’s best known works is his Piano Quintet in G minor for piano and string quartet. Here, I suggest this is the composition heard by the reader and of significance to Fox’s emotional response, as the G minor key is associated with psychological influences on mood, such as, “frenzy, despair and agitation” (Steblin 1996, 111). The sound of music is represented as inescapable and as such it undermines Fox’s search for self-identity, as he continues his resolve not to play or listen to music.

---

16 Bess’s idea returns later in Fox’s narrative as an energetic flurry in the prolongation toward the development’s closure.
18 Beethoven insisted the first thing the general reader need know about tonality is that “the names of keys do not represent important aesthetic facts” (Tovey 1944, 8). Other composers disagreed. I use Steblin’s references to key characteristics and temperament devised by the Italian violinist Francesco Galeazzi (1796).
In Section four, the primary theme of dysfunction moves the plot forward as Georgie persists in a cycle of frenetic activities, including swimming and sailing with the Buckridge boys, where she accidentally injures her back. A White Point massage therapist, Rachel Nilsam, manages to alleviate Georgie’s back condition and provide her with new information on Fox’s music background and on Buckridge’s violent history (265). As with a musical sonata, the cross-referencing builds over the ternary structure and strengthens the novel’s thematic coherence. That is, together with the threads of love, mothering and music in Georgie’s story, a composite picture is built of the novel’s principal characters. Through Rachel, Georgie discovers that Darkie, Fox’s only sibling, was “sly” with a “junkie look” and he and his dim-witted wife Sal were an odd couple, though they were natural musicians (267).

In Section five, after studying survey maps, Fox travels on to Derby, where he finds a pilot willing to take the risk with the weather and fly him to an airstrip near to Coronation Gulf (297). Alone in the wilderness area, a shift in tone occurs when Fox meets an Indigenous man named Menzies. When Menzies interrogates Fox as to his mission—“Science fulla … Guvmint … Adviser … Lawyer … Mine boy … station boy …” (301)—the reader hears that the north of Western Australia has been exploited by various vested interests. When Menzies invites Fox to stay the night at his campsite, Fox meets a younger Aboriginal man named Axle, who becomes an influential voice in reuniting Fox with his music. Axle is described as “not a proper Aborigine man” (304), because he has never been initiated. Land in Aboriginal culture is a sacred place: “your umbilical place. To be separated from the land is to be put into limbo, to be stuck between life and death” (Philips in Ben-Messahel 2006, 104). The figure of Menzies is represented as coming from a mix of races, including Chinese and Bardi people. He is
shown not to have a naval but he remains connected to the land although his life is shaped by institutions. Axle and Menzies are represented as part of the Stolen Generations’ story of dislocation, a reference to the Indigenous activities of the narrative’s exposition. That is, the development section embellishes the sub-themes of Fox’s narrative heard in the exposition through a dialogue with Bird about Aboriginal children running away from the Mogumber camp (114). Through Menzies’ character the narrator elaborates on the conflict that exists in the north of Western Australia between various groups over entitlement to land in the National park: “Everybody fightin now. Blackfullas too. This mob, that mob. Lawyers. Awful” (308). The reference is likely to be to 1992 when the High Court of Australia delivered the Mabo Decision, ruling in favour of Indigenous native title. The subsequent Wik Decision, relating to Indigenous native title and pastoralists leases was handed down in 1996.19

Still shrinking from the popular and classical music he heard on his travels, Fox is ordered by Axle to play his (Axle’s) out-of-tune guitar: “What music d’you like? [Fox] asks. Slim Dusty, the boy announces and Fox plays ‘Pub with No Beer’” (306).20 The song reference here has an irony to it as alcohol abuse is a significant problem in remote Aboriginal communities (Hudson 2011). The men sing the lyrics to the song but when the song ends Fox continues playing, breaking into the silence with a melancholic Irish air that morphs into an elaborative improvisation. Fox’s realisation that: “Music. And it’s not hurting anybody” is interrupted when Axle walks off humiliated because he can’t play the guitar (307). In correspondence with the logic of the sonata form and the denouement of the secondary theme of dislocation, Fox

---

19 In 1998 the John Howard-led Liberal government amended the Wik Decision.
20 “A Pub With No Beer”, a poem written by Irish-born Australian Dan Sheahan, and adapted by singer-songwriter, Gordon Parsons for Slim Dusty, became an international hit in 1957, reaching number five on the British charts.
offers to de-tune the guitar to an open D.\textsuperscript{21} Using an open D allows strings to be strummed together. Fox then instructs Axle that you can play many tunes using the intervals on one string. During the night Axle interrupts Fox’s sleep to offer him a \textit{wundala} (boat) as a gift for the music (308). This tonal interruption, represented by the encounter with the two Aboriginal men, transforms Fox’s attitude to music.

In Section six, the narration returns to Georgie’s story. In keeping with the development phase of the sonata form, new material is inserted and the reader learns that Georgie is energised by visits to the abandoned Fox farm. A complete change of pace allows her time to flick through Fox’s books and listen to his LPs (330-2). These recordings awaken in her an erotic, obsessive desire for Fox that parallels her new discovery of music as she teaches herself to play chords and tunes on Fox’s steel guitar. This is significant as prior to this the reader has been told Georgie is not musical and part of her experience is being forced to have piano lessons as a child (95). She is aroused by the feel of his instrument as it:

zinged and jangled on her legs ... She lay for hours in the bathtub ... did nothing more than try on [Fox’s] many fingerpicks. She lay on the sofa ... the sunlight flashed off the brass and plastic and tortoiseshell. They made her feel like a different creature, those glinting claws (333).

The scene draws the reader into a display of eroticism through music. As McClary argues, music, in particular tonality, is often dependent on metaphorical imitative sexual acts and stirs erotic energy that withholds or unleashes fulfilment (1991, 12-3).\textsuperscript{22} However, Buckridge is also undergoing change and late one night he resists the temptation to raze Fox’s homestead. His resistance is apparently rewarded when, soon

\textsuperscript{21} Open D is characterised as “easy” in the “open/stopped string” theory devised by Hector Berlioz (Steblin 1996, 142).

\textsuperscript{22} Heinrich Schenker (1973) was the first music theorist to identify and examine the “libidinal energy” of tonality (McClary 1991, 13).
after, he hauls in a huge, supernatural catch of fish (338-40). Fate is important to
Buckridge and he decides he wants to amend his past wrongs by flying to Broome with
Georgie, to reunite Georgie and Fox (341-2). This decision precipitates the closure of
the development section.

We have seen how the sonata form has, so far, involved alternating primary and
secondary themes in the narrative’s development. In Section seven, environmental-
music images and sounds are shown to stimulate a memory for Fox that relates back
to his mother’s death. The reader learns that Fox’s sitting still and watching the lapping
of the tides is rewarded as: “mantra rays begin to roll … baitfish form like storm clouds
… a pack of sharks glides in … Every day they come like a bouncing, bickering pack of
dogs” (354-7). When an incoming cyclone distorts these activities, he hears and sees a
“waterspout rises … the wind screams … the shriek of trees” (359). When the cyclonic
season abates, and the hot dry weather threatens, Fox relocates and finds alternative
fresh water and food supplies. Paddling north, he discovers a cave with Indigenous
paintings of minute, dancing stick figures on the outside ledges and a large mouthless
head on the ceiling inside the cave. The Indigenous rock art not only reminds Fox of
Axle, but creates a visual connection for Fox between the living and the dead (364-64),
between himself and his mother.

In this development section, when Fox oils his fishing rod, he accidentally plucks
the nylon leader and hears a B-flat. B flat “is a tender key, soft, sweet, effeminate, fit
to express transports of love, charm [and] grace” (Steblin 1996, 112). The sound
excites Fox and he runs a length of nylon line between two branches of a fig tree.
Tightening the line creates a pleasant-sounding tone and pitch. Fox hums the note
before plucking the string and the sound he hears creates a memory of Darkie.²³

Though Fox still considers music dangerous, he gives in to the sound and experiences a temporary liberation.

God knows, music will undo you, and yet your whacking this thing into a long, gorgeous, monotonous, hypnotic note and it’s not killing you, it’s not driving you into some burning screaming wreck of yourself (368).

Fox plays the liberating, foot-stamping, humming chant as a blues note. This life-saving, talking blues music is described as producing an out-of-body experience and sensory response in Fox: his body sizzles and his skin bubbles, his eyes see dancing strings and his ears chirp (368). Emotions run high for Fox and, before long, his imagination is running back to White Point. This scene is significant as he rebels against his self-imposed rule of not playing music, then as his will gives way to pleasure, he thinks of home. It is relevant here that music has been said to “encapsulate the process of desire, gratification and frustration - what we call ‘life’ - into which the subject is locked” (Schopenhauer in Smyth 2008, 74), and provide temporary relief.

The links between Fox’s development story and his expositional narrative allows for the revision of his memories. That is, through his imagination he visits the farm and every book on the shelves of his mother’s library, and chants lines of poetry as a “monofilament manifold monotone” (369). A chant then arises in the stream-of-consciousness writing of the novel to show Fox’s mind as he travels back in time, to a painful “exquisite intimacy” (370). He regrets not having anyone to share his life and he thinks of Georgie (369), who flutters in his thoughts “like something you can’t quite believe in” (222). Having just met Georgie, Fox is unsure that she exists and is not a

²³ Suzannah Clark argues that a sound (pitch) of the past, modified in the present, creates a reminiscence within the harmonic context, and is always aligned to our present experience (2011, 181-5).
This is a significant feeling for Fox and is finally resolved in the recapitulation section of the sonata, as I will show. In the days that follow, Fox plays music and sings, remembering the intimacy of his family life and relationships. He experiences relief from his pain, until he senses Bess’ passing, and the tolling of bells of the Arvo Part composition resonate in his mind. It is relevant here that during his time travelling north with Bess and Horrie, Bess informs Fox that Arvo Part’s music is death music (251-53). Fox remembers the dead, but also smells Georgie, and remembers the one night they spent together. Such are the emotions and thoughts rising in him, Fox decides that singing and playing music may send him insane:

No more singing. No more music … You had to put yourself out of reach. Of music first, and also of memory because one lived in the other, but people too, because they could say anything, do anything, bring anything out at any moment and do you in without even noticing (373-4).

Though he stops playing music again, past memories continue to monopolise Fox’s thoughts. However, music continues to be a balm, as when he accidentally shreds the soles of his feet while fishing, and sings a little ditty to pacify his mind, producing an improvisation on a “humming, groaning, wincing trance, never letting go of the riff” (378). The sound soon morphs into the Blind Willie Johnson country blues spiritual: “Nobody’s Fault But Mine” (378). This blues song allows Fox to express his ideas of love, sex and self-sacrifice.24 In his hallucinating, improvisatory, musical trance-like riff he remembers his brother Darkie and wife Sal:

Hard thoughts in the pain. Disloyal thoughts … Their need for one another was ravenous but it didn’t extend to anybody else … The music wasn’t in them. They barely felt it … He wanted something more intricate, more animated. He wanted some wit, some memory, some kindness, someone who saw him, saw through him, saw the music of him … he might have wanted something better than to be his brother and to have his wife … All

---

24 According to Prieto, song is like a “peace pledge” between the subject and the outside world, mediating between the inner emotions and the wider experiences of life. (2002a, 101-09)
he can do, while he lies there with his feet throbbing, is to wonder why he stayed, why he persisted. Why he’s lived this last year in homage to these people even after their death. Why? ... Because you loved them ... And owning up to what they were really like won’t change that (378-381; italics in original).

As the lines above show, Fox empties his past memories and clears his conscience in the present giving him hope for a better future. He thinks of Georgie, when he was “unafraid” and decides that at the centre of her wildness there was calm (383). But Fox is restricted by injured feet and, out of boredom, he returns to singing and bangs away on a nylon thread. He thinks he strikes the note E and gets into a groove that sounds like a one-chord boogie. He imagines the sounds of blues musicians’ playing, such as John Lee Hooker, Elmore James and Sleepy John Estes (388). Music makes him realise that he is not one of anything, but a multiplicity of possibilities. In this sense it is relevant the note E (as in major) is affected with “noisy shouts of joy, laughing pleasure” and in E minor as “naïve, innocent sounds of love” (Steblin 1996, 170-1).25 This revelation comes from his music-making “you go up and down your note ... until you’re not one moment empty, nor one bit lost ... you’re not one of anything. You’re a resonating multiplication” (388). Blues cultures tend to link the body and eroticism to experiences of human life (McClary 2000, 45). This dramatic turning-point introduces the onset of the final transition as the development section ends with the secondary theme of dislocation ready to recapitulate, as the narrative prepares for a return to the primary theme of dysfunction (Georgie’s story).

Historically—since the genesis of the sonata form in music—the recapitulation section has included a full revision of the exposition. As Hepokoski and Darcy argue, recapitulation conveys the goal of the sonata and implies “a post developmental

25 Here I refer to early nineteenth-century key characteristics referenced by Steblin.
recycling of all or most of the expositional materials, beginning again with the module that had launched the exposition” (2006, 231). However, according to Kramer: “Form cannot even be considered a stable or ‘objective’ category; it may change, erode, or emerge as expectation or desire shifts from one type of performative address to another” (2011, 48). Thus, while a recapitulation can establish the idea of a new start for the binary themes (after the secondary theme’s harmonic fracture at the end of the development), it will vary with each work. A music sonata might repeat, in the recapitulation, the themes, mood and sound heard at the beginning of an exposition bar by bar. An exact repetition in the novel would clearly not be in the interests of the reader. In Section eight of Dirt Music, the exposition is repeated, but with a difference in its recapitulation; it is a move which does not diminish the sense of a new beginning.

Section eight, the dramatic turning-point of the novel, is half the length of section one but, like that section, it is divided into two equal parts, with the theme of dislocation dominating the second half. Section eight is marked by a double return to the format of the exposition and the primary theme of dysfunction repeated with difference in Georgie’s narrative. The theme of dysfunction reoccurs when Georgie is lured away by Buckridge to Broome. The scenario parallels the fraught atmosphere of the exposition when Georgie sat at the computer for six hours aimlessly surfing web sites (3). Now she similarly “sat by the resort pool listless and heat-stunned” (391) noticing other guests lounging by the pool playing with their laptops and mobile phones. Georgie walks down to the beach where there is white sand, but no wind; the reader learns she is “expecting to see Luther Fox” (392). The scene recycles the earlier exposition with difference. That is, in the exposition, the reader had read that in the house Georgie shares with Buckridge, Georgie moved across the kitchen floor and
through the sliding doors to the terrace where the breeze was fresh (5). She then noticed a light flash and unveils the secret life of Fox, “a non-fleet boat going out under cover of darkness and slipping back at first light ... There was something shonky about it” (15).

Georgie likes Broome: it is multicultural, unlike White Point. But as she reacquaints herself with the town (she had visited Broome years earlier), she is represented as confused and bewildered by the crowds and the climate. She believes Buckridge’s sons blame her for their banishment to boarding school. The background to this is that Buckridge’s mother committed suicide and Buckridge experiences regret over his past, including a one-night stand with Sal Fox when his wife was giving birth to their elder son, and he believes his background is catching up with him (429). In addition, Bill Buckridge, Buckridge’s father, was a ‘monster’ who passed on his unenviable reputation to his son (37-8). Thus, the theme of dysfunction dominates the first half of the recapitulation, with intermittent transitional interruptions to the secondary theme of dislocation.

A recapitulation in the musical sonata form is usually uncomplicated, and resolved in the second half; however, new material is often inserted in the secondary theme. In the musical form, the secondary theme in the recapitulation parallels the expositional closure and contains the most significant event in the sonata: the structural closure where all issues are resolved in tonal agreement. The secondary theme, according to Hepokoski and Darcy, is the most “privileged” space in a musical sonata (2006, 117). In Dirt Music’s recapitulation, the secondary theme of dislocation represented in Fox’s story is shown experiencing a new beginning as he plays and listens to music. His story
develops along Orpheus-like proportions. “[Fox] greets every day with music and likewise bids it goodbye at sunset” (402). It is through this musical activity that Fox imagines his deepening relationship with Georgie. Though Fox is practical and active, a fever is beginning to make him inert, and his hallucination informs the final scene when “Georgie Jutland breathes into his mouth” (404). That is, during his bout of illness, after playing his music, Georgie returns to Fox’s imagination, as a life saver, anticipating the final scene in the novel.

In Broome, Buckridge had discovered that months earlier Fox flew to Coronation Gulf. He employs Red Hopper, a tourist guide, to track down Fox. Red has his own experiences of the violence of White Point: “White Point … They take no prisoners in that town” (408). When Georgie and Buckridge fly in to the archipelago they meet Red on a shelly cove. He indicates that someone has been stealing food from his wilderness campsite: “That’s our man, said Jim … I think I know where he is, said Georgie” (411). As in the exposition, the primary theme moves towards the secondary theme of dislocation, creating suspense as to Fox’s whereabouts. The primary theme returns when Georgie, Buckridge and Red, make their way across the sea to Coronation Gulf and Georgie’s thoughts focus on Red’s boating skills as Buckridge appears uncomfortable with someone else at the wheel (411).

In keeping with the theme of recapitulation, Georgie says that there is something unique about Fox, something to do with music: “Music wants to be heard … She found him once … She’d just have to find him a second time” (415-6). When Fox’s story begins again, Fox has decided he is not nomadic and wants to settle, connect and live in one place. He thinks he will die in the wilderness if he does not return to the

Orpheus, the famous poet and musician of Greek mythology, greets the dawn every morning chanting verses to Apollo, his father, the god of the sun and music (Graves 2003, 112-13).
mainland (419). As Buckridge, Red and Georgie search for Fox, he knowingly eludes them. Buckridge is mute with rage (420). Fox’s health is weakening, as he steals food and medicine from Red’s campsite. At the camp, he spies himself in a mirror; a bearded “thing” with matted hair. Confronted by his self-image, Fox delays his return to the mainland (425). In these scenes, the recapitulation is suspended. That is, the secondary theme does not behave as expected, and paves the way for a double recapitulation.27

As the primary theme of dysfunction reappears in the writing (referred to earlier as primary1), Buckridge suggests that Georgie call Fox’s name (427). Dominated by Fox, or the other characters’ thoughts of Fox, the narration proceeds, with Georgie reasoning that Fox has had years of living with his memories of the dead and is not about to commit suicide; he wants to live. Moreover, she believes in part that he desires her (429-30). Psychologically weakened by his frail appearance, Fox is paralysed by indecision and an inability to return home. He reasons with himself, and when he decides he has nothing to fear, he makes a move to come in. He is momentarily stalled when he imagines he sees Georgie fishing, and Buckridge standing on a ridge at Coronation Gulf (433). Buckridge is telling Georgie that Fox’s hasty retreat from White Point was precipitated by fear that Buckridge was pursuing him (435). This answers the novel’s primary question as to why Fox abandoned his hobby farm. This explains the ternary form’s clearly sustained discussion which begins with the expositional and contrasting themes of dysfunction and dislocation. It leaves important

27 In music sonatas, double recapitulations are unusual, and manifest when a recapitulation commences but fails to resolve its “tonal issues”. The second recapitulation rebegins in the primary theme and then moves onto the secondary theme and structural closure. Hepokoski and Darcy suggest that a failed normative recapitulation is significant and facilitates issues of musical and cultural importance (2006, 232, 279, 603).
questions raised in the exposition of Fox’s identity, to be resolved by the secondary theme of dislocation in the recapitulation section.

When Georgie decides to call off the search for Fox, “Red ... I want you to call the plane in. Today” (441). The act is a point of destabilisation. Georgie’s decision to recapitulate and return home increases the emotional tension between her and Buckridge and jeopardises the final resolution of the entire sonata. Simultaneously, Fox announces his desire to leave the island and return to the mainland: “There’ll be no more treks now and the knowledge of it lifts him a little” (455). In music, when such forms are destabilised, McClary argues, the music produces powerful effects that shape the listener’s experience of emotions, desire, cultural contexts and practices (2000, 7-8).

These powerful effects are heard in Georgie’s and Fox’s dissonant stories as the seaplane airlifting Georgie and Buckridge back to the mainland flies over Fox as he paddles his kayak in the same direction as the plane. When Fox realises that Georgie is on the plane he reacts with shouts of emotion, but his voice is inaudible over the roar of the engine. Airborne, Georgie cannot see him. To her the Coronation Gulf below appeared “like some bearded, featureless head rising, perennially and pointlessly from the water” (456). This image has its roots in the Orpheus myth, where Orpheus met his end at the hands of the Maenads who tore him to shreds and threw his head into the river where it floated, “still singing, down to the sea” (Graves 2003, 113). Buckridge notices something in the water and argues with the pilot. Fox sees the plane wobble, then crash into the sea (458).

---

28 McClary defends composers who break well-defined music codes within “socially grounded” contexts affirming that “everything ... is actually ordered, rational, under control” (1991, 102).
As in the story of Orpheus and Eurydice, Fox dives into the plane’s body to free Georgie. When Georgie feels his lips pressed on hers, she recognises him: “Luther Fox” (459). Sonata form in music depends on the primary theme’s necessary “grounding of whatever ‘large-scale dissonance’ occupies the second narrative position” (McClary 1991, 16). Issues of dislocation, including self-identity, are at the root of Fox’s narrative. When the novel turns the Orphic myth upside down, Fox is portrayed lying on the deck: “blue”, breathless and wondering whether or not Georgie is real. Georgie freezes when Fox begins to retch; however, she comes to life when Red reminds her of her role: “You’re the nurse. Yes, she thought. This is what I do. She fell on Luther Fox, pressed her mouth to his and blew. She’s real” (461). These last words of the novel are articulated as a dramatic revelation for Fox. The suggestion that Georgie is real also suggests an end to Georgie’s association with the primary theme of dysfunction. The secondary theme, in keeping with sonata form, draws the narrative to a close, and the reader to an abrupt, and incongruously happy ending. That the lovers are not only reunited but recognise each other is relevant as the “recognition of self against other is positioned at and as the end of discourse, both as aesthetic pleasure (in finality, totality, unity) and of critical recognition (the binary as truth, structure, insight)” (Kramer 1996, 37). The underlying form in Dirt Music, therefore, affirms a double recapitulation as Georgie’s and Fox’s stories fold into each other’s narratives invoking writing as a quest for identity, triumph over adversity, and redemptive love.

Conclusion

I have read Dirt Music a quintessential Australian novel steeped in references to Indigenous landscape and culture, through the sonata form. Overall, in my analysis of
Dirt Music I have taken up Ben-Messahel’s suggestion that Dirt Music’s story “arises from the music of the land and is a symphony on the theme of Western Australia” (2006, 12), and I have shown that Dirt Music can productively be read through the sonata form, playing with a number of key terms, particularly dysfunction and dislocation, without eroding the legitimacy or flexibility of either term.

During the last decade of the twentieth century in Australia, contentious issues, such as immigration, mining, economic and Indigenous land right reforms enacted critical moments in the political history of Australia. The individual and community stories in Dirt Music, through the sonata form, encourage the reader to forge new connections and understandings in relation to Australia’s broader ongoing concerns and conflicts. By drawing on the sonata form in making sense of the novel’s composition, the reader may engage in the deeper responses to Georgie’s and Fox’s individual journeys, in a way that mitigates doubts and fears about Australia’s future and that may lead to affirmation, forgiveness and love, for example, in relation to Australia’s past and present treatment of Aboriginal people. Dirt Music, therefore, provides an alternative model for understanding that at this moment in history there are possibilities for but no easy solutions to the challenges besetting Australia’s socio-political, environmental and cultural life.
Conclusion

This thesis has focused on reading and writing music in contemporary fiction. Music, I have shown is incorporated into these novels and is utilised in various ways by writers and theorists seeking to forge new compositional and analytical methods with inventive modes of listening, creating and understanding the worlds in which they inhabit. Both Impromptu I—X and this dissertation engage with questions that concern the relationship between music and literature, the role music can play in writing narrative fiction and how reading a work of fiction through a music lens enhances an understanding and interpretation of a text.

Reading music in fiction according to da Sousa Correa highlights the "extraordinary" literary outcomes of a novelist’s work (2003, 192). But Benson suggests that:

> the deormalization of the object of music and the recognition of a set of shared methodologies for dealing with music and language - has had far more impact in writing on music, and on a conception of music as text, than it has in the intermingling of these texts with literature and literary studies (2002, 86).

Benson elaborates on literature’s engagement with music as a literary text that “resonates with the silent sounds” (2002, 87). Prieto similarly describes the interdisciplinary engagement of the “musicality and literariness that could be directly applied to works from the other art” as a metaphorical exercise (2002b, 52). According to Prieto, the fact that literature uses words and not tones, means there is no literal transfer between the two arts, except in song and opera (2002b, 52). Considered on these terms, the metaphorical music of the novel per se, penetrates the inner and

---

29 The literary text referenced in this instance by Benson is T.S. Eliot’s 1922 poem, The Waste Land.
outer lives of characters, and engenders narrative techniques, such as rhythm and repetition, to provide the reader with musical references which allow for the interpretation of contemporary issues embedded in time and place, echoing trends in readers’ communities.

Methodological inferences and formal models represented in analysis can be subjective, and each reading may differ as unexpected literary effects of representing aspects of music in language are observed: “To interpret language means to understand language; to interpret music means to make music” (Adorno 2002, 115). My thesis adds to interdisciplinary work where music is harnessed in the writing of critical and literary texts.

Music represented in my creative piece includes: references to musical theatre and the operatic overtones of Gladys Moncrieff and Dame Nellie Melba; and tonality including key changes represented as first, second and third person narration. I also refer to music as an organising tool; and to vocal and instrumental music performances, music lessons, and popular, old and classical music works, songs, songwriters and composers. Above all, my hope is that the reader of Impromptu I—X will hear music in the sounds, cadences and rhythms of the narration, speech, dialogue of the characters, and in the impulse and turn of the stories that are interwoven in the text. Using music to express the inner thoughts and the expressive power of characters in fiction, in addition to traditional literary techniques provides the writer with different sounds to differentiate characters’ stories and ideas through inflections in voices, narrative and themes. In Impromptu I—X, music governs story, form, character and idea. The stories are grounded in two different communities, in present day Park and in the early days of Mena. In this sense, the text’s music comments on and depicts
society, offering the reader a visceral and emotional experience of a specific time and place. I developed the impromptu music form to organise the novel as a free-flowing fantasia suggesting the re-presentation and continuation of the past in the present, and providing glimpses of a possible future.

In reviewing work by critics of both literature and music, Benson asserts that music is largely absent in analytical accounts, such as *The Cambridge Companion to Modernism* (1999), apart from intermittent references to interdisciplinary projects (2002, 87). Building on Benson’s idea that the narrative text be engaged with in association with music, I have analysed three contemporary novels, *Beloved*, “The Pacific Journal of Adam Ewing” (*Cloud Atlas*) and *Dirt Music* as performative acts of listening. Hearing remix in *Beloved* emphasised sound technology and repetition to record the nineteenth-century slave mother, Margaret Garner in time and place to reimagine a forgotten practice (slavery) that must not be repeated. My use of music as an interpretive means to loop the fragmentary samples in the practice of remix locates *Beloved* within the culture and history of black experience. Thus, the music metaphor enables the DJ-like narrator and the reader to reconfigure and empathise with the experiences, thoughts and feelings of the slave characters, experiences, thoughts and feelings absent in the original slave narratives.

The sounding of music as a supplement to the narrative of Adam Ewing’s journey through the islands of the Pacific Ocean in *Cloud Atlas*, signifies and highlights the voices, both black and white, of individuals and marginalised communities, and draws attention to the radically unequal relations of power of the characters in this story. As such, the idea of music in this reading is not a response to new musics but an
engagement with and re-reading of a conservative melodic form influenced by nineteenth-century ideologies.

A metaphorical conception of music-as-structure is pivotal to my reading of *Dirt Music* as a sonata. The formal innovation establishes a dynamic binary tension between the themes of dysfunction and dislocation, shaped by a ternary form to illuminate the cultural, socio-political, Indigenous and environmental issues confronting Australian society during the last decade of the twentieth century.

These readings are not intended as a conclusion to the discussion of music and literature in fiction but as a starting point for analysis. An absence of music in current critical response to the three novels is noteworthy and intimates music is not a privileged tool to unpack and investigate the role of music in fiction. The ability of critics and novelists to read and write music embedded in socio-political, environmental, psychological and cultural contexts as those are evoked in narrative fiction might help focus their attention on the broader meaning and significance of human concerns in nature and society.

Music, according to Benson, has the capacity to “transform reading into a form of listening” (2002, 38). If this is true, given that we live in a highly visual culture, sharpening our auditory senses may help readers to be more attentive (to the other) in order to make different sounds, to communicate differently in a way that moves us beyond dominant and problematic values (beyond the already heard). This music-literature project has afforded me the opportunity to write experimentally; to read closely and to offer an alternative analysis of musical fiction, to variously work with the metaphorical connection between the two fields, and to highlight the cultural role each plays, when in dialogue, to communicate problematic issues of individual human
experience and collective memory and address problems of communication and understanding in the contemporary world.
References


Http://www.compulsivereader.com/tag/australian-authors/.


http://theparisreview.org/interviews/6034/the-art-of-fiction-no204-david-mitchell.


http://www.bbc.co.uk/podcasts/series/wbc/all.


netLibrary e-book.


http://www.digitalcommons.unf.edu/ojii_volumes/12/.


http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b007mdcg.


Rice, Alan J. 2000. "It Don’t Mean a Thing If It Ain’t Got That Swing: Jazz’s Many Uses for Toni Morrison." In *Black Orpheus: Music in African American Fiction from the..."


Tovey, Donald Francis. 1944. *Beethoven*. London: Oxford University Press.


