Chelas, Ansars and Acolytes: Becoming a teacher in, and for, a remote and culturally diverse community

Anne Elizabeth Price

BA (UWA), Dip Ed (UWA), M Ed (Hons) Murdoch

This thesis is presented for the degree of Doctor of Education of Murdoch University

2005
Acknowledgements

Several people need to be acknowledged for the part they played in this study.

Firstly I need to acknowledge and thank the main participants Zaiton, Mei Zhu and Emma. This study is about them, their journey and their struggles. On top of the enormous effort they put in to their own studies, working lives and family and community responsibilities, they made time for my study and me. For many years they shared with me their very personal stories and allowed me to be a part of their rich lives.

I must also acknowledge the many people who supported the participants in their goal. Teachers, academics, other school staff, members of the community, the UCIW and in particular those who became their mentors Greta, Jen and Eileen who gave so much of themselves to help make it all possible.
I declare that this thesis is my own account of my research and contains as its main content work which has not previously been submitted for a degree in any tertiary education institution.

Anne Elizabeth Price
Abstract

This study examines the way in which three Education Assistants (EAs) engaged with an Initial Teacher Education (ITE) program at an Australian Higher Education Institution (HEI). In order to assist the EAs to engage with the ITE program the school in which they worked developed a series of intervention strategies. These strategies combined to form what became known as the Christmas Island District High School (CIDHS) Trainee Teacher Program. Through this program the EAs were provided support in the various critical aspects of the ITE program.

Within an Australian context the EAs were from non-mainstream backgrounds. They were mature age women who had disrupted educational backgrounds, spoke English as a second language, and were living in a geographically remote location. Their journey from ‘Education Assistant’ to ‘Teacher’, via an ITE program and with the support of the school, is the subject of this inquiry.

A grounded qualitative research methodology is used to investigate and analyse the participation of the EAs from their points of view. The personal and grounded experiences of the participants in this study are then supplemented by a review of the international literature pertaining to non-mainstream participation in Higher Education.

Specifically, the study examines significant aspects of an ITE program including:

• Entrance via alternative access programs
• Engagement with course theory and school practicums
• Recognition for Prior Learning (RPL)
• The implications of studying via distance mode
• The role of mentors
• The impact of funding structures and fees on non-mainstream students
As well as the pragmatic aspects of the program, this study also examines the critical impact that various Discourses (Gee, 1999), and the ideologies that underpin them, had on the ability of the participants to successfully make the transition from Education Assistant to Teacher.

The dissertation ends with a series of recommendations for action for the HEI sector, schools sectors and regulatory authorities. The aims are to add to the international literature on non-mainstream participation in ITE and to aid in the development of ITE programs that better address the needs of non-mainstream students.
# Table of Contents

**Table of Contents**

**Chapter 1  Introduction to the Study**

1. Introduction ........................................................................................................ 6
2. The Aims of the Study ....................................................................................... 7
3. The Approaches Used in the Study .................................................................. 8
4. How the Study Emerged .................................................................................. 9
5. The Participants ............................................................................................... 10
6. The Layout of the Study .................................................................................. 11
7. Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 12

**Chapter 2  Research Methodology**

1. Introduction ........................................................................................................ 13
2. Theoretical Orientations ................................................................................... 16
3. Qualitative Research Methods ........................................................................ 19
   3.1 Grounded Theory ......................................................................................... 19
   3.2 A Case Study Approach ............................................................................... 20
   3.3 Field Theory ............................................................................................... 23
   3.4 Discourse Theory With a Capital ‘D’ ............................................................ 27
   3.5 Heuristic Inquiry ......................................................................................... 35
4. Data Collection and Analysis Methods ............................................................ 37
   4.1 Data Collection Strategies ........................................................................ 37
   4.1.1 Selection of Subjects ............................................................................ 38
   4.1.2 Field Procedures .................................................................................. 38
   4.2 Data Collection Tools ................................................................................ 40
   4.2.1 Open Ended Interviews ....................................................................... 40
   4.2.2 Narrative Journal Writing ..................................................................... 42
   4.2.3 Direct Participant Observation .............................................................. 43
   4.3 Data Analysis Strategies ............................................................................. 44
   4.3.1 Field Theory Analysis .......................................................................... 45
   4.3.2 Discourse Analysis ................................................................................ 46
5. Data Reliability and Trustworthiness ............................................................... 49
6. Conclusion ......................................................................................................... 49

**Chapter 3  The Christmas Island Context**

1. Introduction ........................................................................................................ 53
2. Geographical Context ....................................................................................... 53
3. The Diverse Socio-cultural Context ................................................................ 55
4. Historical Context ............................................................................................. 57
   4.1 Early Colonisation ...................................................................................... 59
   4.2 Post War Colonialism – Out of sight and Out of Mind ............................... 61
   4.3 Educational Context .................................................................................. 64
      4.3.1 Segregated Schooling from the 1928 to 1976 ...................................... 65
      4.3.2 The Amalgamation of the Schools in 1976 .......................................... 69
   4.4 The New Millennium - Neo-colonialism Continues .................................... 73
   4.5 Towards Inclusivity – Pedagogical Changes at CIDHS ......................... 81
Chapter 4 Chelas, Ansars and Acolytes ................................................................. 85

1 Introduction ........................................................................................................... 85
2 Zaiton ...................................................................................................................... 86
   2.1 Early Childhood .................................................................................................. 86
   2.2 School Years ..................................................................................................... 88
   2.3 Life After School ............................................................................................. 90
   2.4 Family and Community Roles and Responsibilities ...................................... 91
      2.4.1 Translating ............................................................................................... 92
      2.4.2 Teaching Malay Dance ........................................................................... 92
      2.4.3 Religious duties ....................................................................................... 93
      2.4.4 Others Activities ................................................................................... 93
      2.4.5 A Day in Zaiton’s Life ............................................................................ 93
   2.5 The Impact of Study on Zaiton’s Life .............................................................. 94
   2.6 Future Goals and Aspirations ......................................................................... 96
3 Ching Mei Zhu ....................................................................................................... 97
   3.1 Early Childhood Years .................................................................................... 97
   3.2 School Years .................................................................................................... 99
   3.3 Life After School ............................................................................................ 103
   3.4 Family and Community Responsibilities ..................................................... 103
   3.5 Impact of Study on Mei Zhu’s Life .................................................................. 104
   3.6 Future Goals and Aspirations ........................................................................ 105
4 Emma .................................................................................................................... 105
   4.1 Early Childhood ............................................................................................... 106
   4.2 Life After School ............................................................................................ 106
   4.3 Emma’s Goals and Aspirations ...................................................................... 108
5 Conclusion ............................................................................................................ 108

Chapter 5 Academe ................................................................................................ 112

1 Introduction ........................................................................................................... 112
2 Financial Restraints and Regulatory Controls ................................................... 113
3 Questions of Educational Philosophy ................................................................. 116
   3.1 Conversations Informed by Human Capital Theory ...................................... 116
   3.2 Conversations Informed by Human Rights Theory ....................................... 117
4 An Overview of the ITE Program ...................................................................... 118
5 Access and Entry: A Foot in the Door ................................................................. 119
   5.1 Finding Out About Alternative Pathways ..................................................... 120
   5.2 ‘I’m too old, I don’t belong here’ ................................................................. 121
   5.3 Learning Some Tricks of the Trade ............................................................... 124
   5.4 Future Directions ......................................................................................... 129
6 Distance Education – Learning from Afar ........................................................ 130
   6.1 Distance Education for the Masses ............................................................... 130
   6.2 The only viable option for the EAs ............................................................... 131
   6.3 ‘Snail Mail’ and other Tribulations ............................................................... 131
   6.4 Communicating with On-campus Tutors ...................................................... 133
   6.5 Outmoded Written Texts ............................................................................. 134
7 Studying on Campus ............................................................................................ 138
   7.1 “We are only EAs” ....................................................................................... 139
   7.2 A Taste of Summer School .......................................................................... 141
8 Assessment Practices ........................................................................................... 145
9 Gaining Credit for Prior Learning: The RPL Process .................................... 149
   9.1 Big ‘C’ Conversations Driving RPL ............................................................... 149
   9.2 Issues in its Implementation – Learning the Discourse of RPL ................... 150
Chapter 6  Coaches, Gurus, Sages and Mentors ........................................ 167

1  Introduction .............................................................................................. 167

2  Coaches and Gurus ................................................................................ 170
   2.1 The First Gurus .................................................................................. 170
   2.2 Coaches ............................................................................................ 172
      2.2.1 Simon ......................................................................................... 172
      2.2.2 Jesse ......................................................................................... 174
      2.2.3 Bob ........................................................................................... 177

3  Mentors ...................................................................................................... 180
   3.1 Early Mentors .................................................................................... 180
      3.1.1 Donna ....................................................................................... 181
      3.1.2 Karen ....................................................................................... 186
   3.2 The Official Mentors .......................................................................... 188
      3.2.1 Mei Zhu’s Mentor - Jen ................................................................ 189
      3.2.2 Zaiton’s Mentor - Greta .............................................................. 193
      3.2.3 Emma’s Mentor - Eileen ............................................................. 196
      3.2.4 The Researcher as Mentor ......................................................... 200

4  Conclusion .................................................................................................. 202

Chapter 7  Juggling, Jesting and Jousting ...................................................... 206

1  Introduction .............................................................................................. 206

2  The Jester Arrives ................................................................................... 208

3  Transforming Ideas into Action ............................................................... 211
   3.1 Embedding the Idea into a Strategic Plan ......................................... 211
   3.2 Jousting with the ‘Feds’ .................................................................... 212

4  Winning the Battle at the School Level ................................................... 216

5  Harnessing Union and Government Support ......................................... 218

6  Action through Research and Research through Action ....................... 218

7  Juggling Disparate Discourses ............................................................... 220

8  Conclusion ............................................................................................... 223

Chapter 8  Driving and Restraining Forces .................................................. 226

1  Introduction .............................................................................................. 226

2  “Driving” and “Restraining” Forces ....................................................... 228
   2.1 Researcher’s List of Major Forces ..................................................... 229
   2.2 The Field Force Task ....................................................................... 229
   2.3 The Major Forces Impacting on the Group ...................................... 232
      2.3.1 Forces Related to the HEI .......................................................... 233
      2.3.2 Forces Related to the School ...................................................... 237
      2.3.3 Forces related to Regulatory Authorities .................................... 244
      2.3.4 Forces Related to the Context and the Discourses in the Community......................... 246

3  The Relative Impact of Each Force ......................................................... 252
   3.1 Summary of the Relative Impact Tables .......................................... 252
   3.2 Relative Impact Matrix .................................................................... 253
   3.3 Table 1 Summary of the Three Relative Impact Tables ..................... 253
Chapter 9  

Chapter 10  

List of References  

Appendices  

Appendix 1  

Appendix 2  

Appendix 3  

Appendix 4  

Appendix 5  

List of Abbreviations  

Impact / Effort Matrix ................................................................. 254  
4.1 Table 2 Impact / Effort Chart - For Education Assistants ............... 255  
4.2 Table 3 Impact / Effort Chart - For Researcher / School ................ 255  

Conclusion .................................................................................. 256  

Chapter 9  

Chapter 10  

Recommendations for Educational Jurisdictions .................................. 308  

Recommendations for Higher Education Institutions .......................... 310  
2.1 Access and Entry Requirements .................................................. 310  
2.2 Theory and Practice ................................................................. 311  
2.3 Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL) ........................................... 312  
2.4 Distance Education ................................................................. 313  

Recommendations for Schools and the School Sector .......................... 316  
3.1 Providing Mentoring Support ..................................................... 317  
3.2 School Practicum ................................................................. 318  

Conclusion .................................................................................. 320  

Post Script .................................................................................. 322  

List of References .......................................................................... 325  

Appendices .................................................................................. 336  

Sample Interview Questions ................................................................ 337  

Soloing on Tape ........................................................................... 338  

Questions for Reflective Journal ....................................................... 340  

Guidelines for Mentoring ............................................................... 342  

Researcher’s Reflective Journal ......................................................... 345  

List of Abbreviations ....................................................................... 347  

List of References  

Appendices  

Appendix 1  

Appendix 2  

Appendix 3  

Appendix 4  

Appendix 5  

List of Abbreviations
Maps and Photographs

Figure 1  Map Showing CI Location……………………………………………..53
Figure 2  Map showing aerial view of settled areas and National Park……….54
Figure 3  Photo showing Year 3 students working on a Malay project……….56
Figure 4  Photo showing Christmas Island District Officer and companion….61
Figure 5  A typical ‘A Grade’ house for supervisors…………………………63
Figure 6  The newly built school for Asian children circa 1950……………….67

Tables

Table 1  Summary of the Three Relative Impact Tasks……………………..229
Table 2  Impact / Effort Chart for the Education Assistants………………….255
Table 3  Impact / Effort Chart for the Researcher and the School………….255