Being active, but not an activist:

Managing problematic aspects of activist identity by
expressing individuality, or taking alternative forms of
collective action

Avelie Stuart

B.A. (Psychology), with Honours.

This thesis is presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy of Murdoch University, 2013.
I declare that this thesis is my own account of my research and contains as its main content work which has not previously been submitted for a degree at any tertiary education institution.

....................................

Avelie Stuart
Acknowledgements

First of all, of course, I must acknowledge my supervisors. I consider myself to have been doubly blessed to have two such great mentors. Ngaire – you have been there for me from the start of my research journey. You have an amazing ability to critique my work in a way that is inspiring but without ever making me feel bad about myself. I can only aspire to approach the people that I work with in the same way. Emma – your capacity to power on has made me realise I could achieve much more than I ever thought. I'll never forget the time you wrote an entire paper in a week. Thank you for always telling me I can do more, and for introducing me to whole new areas of research.

To my office mates – Lauren (office buddies from the start!), Ryan, Sam, Jacinta, and the “other office”, Gerald, Stu, Corey, and Rob. Thanks for all the fun in between the hard work and for helping me improve my vocabulary (or inventing new words where none existed). I would like to extend this gratitude to all the postgraduate students that I have met, particularly at SASP conferences – they were the highlight of my year and I will miss them very much. Much thanks to other Murdoch academics for your guidance, especially Craig, Anita, and Anne. To the members of SPR*G, Murdoch’s social psychology reading group – thank you for reading my draft papers and sharing your thoughts, I loved reading your papers too.

To my sisters and my parents – thank you for always thinking that whatever I am working on is amazing. To my nephew and niece – thank you for being completely unaware that I was working on a thesis.
Thesis Abstract

Drawing on social identity and self-categorization approaches to collective action from social psychology, and social movement theory from sociology, the empirical studies in this thesis investigate the identities and experiences of those engaged (and disengaged) in various social movements in Australia - including environmentalisms, international aid and development, human rights, and animal rights movements. The participants were at various points of commitment to these social movements - from being sympathetic, to actively engaged, and even in leadership positions. The two research aims were to: 1) expand current understandings of the ways that problematic aspects of social identity content and identity boundaries can prevent sympathizers from engaging in collective actions; and 2) examine strategies those committed to collective action use to manage problematic aspects of their social identities, and how they establish a unique contribution to social change in contrast to other social movement groups. Each of these questions speak to the other in that they centre on the ways that a narrowly defined but shared understanding of the “activist” or “protester” constrains and shapes alternative means of pursuing social change.

The empirical work consists of four studies. Study 1 is a qualitative analysis of materials and interviews with members of the Sea Shepherd Conservation Society. I examined how members rhetoricly construct their identities in order to frame their cause as legitimate, and how members come to personally identify themselves as members of the organization in a way that allows them to manage potential conflicts between multiple identities – as individuals, and as group members. Study 2 uses an inductive open-ended survey to understand how social barriers can shape people’s willingness to participate in collective actions during their early socialization into social
movement groups. Study 3 is a quantitative analysis of survey data, using themes from Study 2, which demonstrates how stereotypes of activists can influence individuals’ identification as activists. Study 4 is an interview study with experienced activists, coordinators, and advocates of various social movement organizations. In this study it was found that people experienced in collective action can distinguish themselves from a primarily protest-based activist identity in order to establish their unique contribution to the broader movement, and also maintain feelings of personal satisfaction.

The contributions of this thesis are that it establishes a more nuanced understanding of the types of identity routes available to people who want to engage in collective action – such as an advocacy route, contrasted to the activist route. The thesis also concludes with a discussion of the need to understand transitionary socialization processes when people attempt to join social movement organizations, and it makes suggestions for developing a model of conversionary collective action – which is what participants termed the “quiet” approach to social change.
Table of Contents

Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................................................... 3

Thesis Abstract .................................................................................................................................................. 4

CHAPTER 1. ....................................................................................................................................................... 11

Introduction and Literature Review ...................................................................................................................... 11

Thesis Overview .................................................................................................................................................. 11

The Meaningfulness of Social Movements ........................................................................................................ 15

The Social Psychology of Collective Action ...................................................................................................... 16

Discursive Approaches to Social Identity ........................................................................................................... 19

The Sociology of Social Movements .................................................................................................................. 21

Participation is Predicted by Social Ties and Networks ..................................................................................... 21

Framing and Identity Boundaries ....................................................................................................................... 25

Integrating Social Psychological and Sociological Perspectives ........................................................................ 28

What Type of Collective Action? ....................................................................................................................... 30

Summary of Thesis ............................................................................................................................................. 32

Description of Each Empirical Study ................................................................................................................ 35

CHAPTER 2. ....................................................................................................................................................... 38

Epistemology ....................................................................................................................................................... 38

Theory and Methodology ................................................................................................................................... 40

CHAPTER 3. ....................................................................................................................................................... 43

Context Statement .............................................................................................................................................. 43

Abstract ............................................................................................................................................................... 44
“We may be pirates, but we are not protesters” Identity in the Sea Shepherd Conservation Society

Social Movements and Collective Identities
Managing Multiple Identities
“Extreme” Social Movement Organizations
The Present Study
Method
Data Collection
Methodological Approach and Procedure
Analysis and Discussion
The Public Identity of SSCS
Personal Identification with SSCS
Adoption of the SSCS Member Identity
Conclusion
Group-level Symbolic Boundaries
Individual Level Management of Identity Content
Concluding Comments and Limitations
CHAPTER 4.
Context Statement
Abstract

“I don't really want to be associated with the self-righteous left extreme”: How Self-reflections on Collective Identity can Hinder Participation in Collective Action
Socialization, Social Identity Realization and Collective Action Participation
Hypotheses........................................................................................................119
Method .............................................................................................................120
Participants.....................................................................................................120
Design ............................................................................................................120
Measures .........................................................................................................121
Procedure ......................................................................................................123
Results ...........................................................................................................124
Discussion ......................................................................................................128
Activist Identity Endorsement ........................................................................128
Visibility of Actions .......................................................................................130
Limitations and Suggestions .........................................................................132
Appendix A ....................................................................................................134
CHAPTER 6. ....................................................................................................135
Context Statement .........................................................................................135
Abstract ..........................................................................................................136
Taking a Look Inside: Identity and Strategy Alignment within Social Movement Groups ........................................................................................................137
Social Identity and Social Movements ..........................................................138
Strategic Within-group and Inter-group Dynamics .........................................140
Method ...........................................................................................................143
Participants ....................................................................................................143
Data analysis ..................................................................................................144