THERAVADA TREATMENT AND PSYCHOTHERAPY: An Ecological Integration of Buddhist Tripartite Practice and Western Rational Analysis

Aung Myint
B. A. (Psych), M. A. (Psych), M. Psych. (Clinical), FWASMH, MBPsS

This thesis is presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy of Murdoch University

2007
Declaration

I declare that this thesis is my own account of my research and contains as its main content work that has not previously been submitted for a degree at any tertiary education institution.

.............
Aung Myint
I would like to thank:

Professor Peter Newman, Director, Institute for Sustainability and Technology Policy (ISTP), Murdoch University for trusting and encouraging “a bunch of misfits”, as he likes to call us, from diverse disciplines to learn, share and grow under a united ecological collegium. It is an honour and a privilege to study with and to have a continued support of the staff and students alike. Special thanks go to Associate Professor Dr Dora Marinova and Dr Julia Hobson for their final perusals of my thesis.

My late supervisor, Dr Michael Booth for his Oxonian mentoring, tutoring, dialoguing, and the rest, until his premature death in September 2006.

Emeritus Professor Laksiri Jayasuria, University of Western Australia, for giving me instigative encouragement and initial support to take on this project over a decade ago.

My late friend Ric and his surviving wife Georgie Hammersley for re-connecting me with my spiritual journey in Australia.

Many meditation and dhamma teachers including S. N. Goenka (formerly of Burma) of Vipassana Research Institute, Igapuri, India and Ajahn Bramavamso, Abbot and Spiritual Director of Buddhist Society of Western Australia for enriching my experiential learning and understanding.

Academics, scholarly and meditating monks from Thailand, Sri Lanka, India and Nepal including Ajahn Dr Uthai Dulyakasem, Dean, Institute of Liberal Arts, Walailak University, Thailand for granting me a six-month Visiting Researcher Fellowship.

Ajahn Dr. Patrick Jory, Nick Cheesman, Julie Rankin, and Sirirat Katanchaleekul for perusing, critiquing, correcting and completing the graphics of my thesis respectively. Dennis Thomas for technical support and provision of printing facilities. John Davis for help with formatting the document.

Therese van der Zanden for motivating and encouraging me with an enduring support.

Theda Myint and Khin Myint for inspiring me to develop applications of the dhamma to everyday life issues.
Peng Siah, dhamma friends and students of ‘Introduction to Meditation’ classes at the Buddhist Society of Western Australia where I teach meditation, who have been very generous in sharing with me their meditative experiences, dhamma books, tapes and CDs.

My old University friend, Gabrielle Lawlor for sponsoring me to attend Restorative Justice Workshop and lending me videos and books related to justice psychology.

Finally, numerous clients who have taught me how to integrate Western psychology and Buddhist theory and practice into my clinical work.
Abstract

An assertion that psychotherapy is an independent science and a self-authority on human mind and behaviour has uprooted its connection with philosophy and religion. In practice, the scientist-practitioner model of psychotherapy, a seemingly dualistic model, prefers determinism of science to free will of choice in humans.

In particular, the model does not see reason and emotion as co-conditioning causes of human behaviour and suffering within the interdependent aggregates of self, other, and environment. Instead, it argues for wrong reasoning as the cause of emotional suffering.

In Western thought, such narrative began at the arrival of scripted language and abstract thought in Greek antiquity that has led psychotherapy to think ignorantly that emotions are un-reasonable therefore they are irrational. Only rational thinking can effectively remove un-reasonable emotions.

This belief creates confusion between rational theory and rational method of studying change in emotion because of the belief that science cannot objectively measure emotions. As a result, rational epistemologies that are ignorant of moral and metaphysical issues in human experience have multiplied. These epistemologies not only construct an unchanging rational identity, but also uphold the status of permanent self-authority.

Fortunately, recent developmental psychology and cognitive neuroscience research have quashed such ideas of permanent self-identity and authority.

Buddhist theory of Interdependent Arising and Conditional Relations sees such identity and authority as arisen together with deluded emotional desires of greed and hatred.

These desires co-condition interdependent states of personal feeling and perception (metaphysics), conceptual thinking and consciousness (epistemology) and formation of (moral) emotion and action within the context of self-other-environment matrix. Moral choices particularly highlight the intentional or the Aristotelian final cause of action derived from healthy desires by valued meaning makings and interpretations.
Theravada formulation aims to end unhealthy desires and develop the healthy ones within the matrix including the client-clinician-therapeutic environment contexts.

Theravada treatment guides a tripartite approach of practicing empathic ethics, penetrating focus and reflective understanding, which integrates ecologically with Western rational analysis. It also allows scientific method of studying change in emotion by applying the theory of defective desires.

In addition, interdependent dimensions of thinking and feeling understood from Theravada perspective present a framework for developing theory and treatment of self disorders.

Thus, Theravada treatment not only allows scientific method of studying change in emotion and provides an interdependent theory and treatment but also ecologically integrates with Western rational analysis. Moreover, Theravada approach offers an open framework for further development of theoretical and treatment models of psychopathology classified under Western nomenclature.
The madman is not the man who has lost reason. The madman is the man who has lost everything except his reason.

Gilbert K Chesterton

The marvelous logic of the mad which seems to mock that of the logicians because it is exactly the same… The ultimate language of madness is that of reason.

Michel Foucault
Table of Contents

DECLARATION ........................................................................................................................ III
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ............................................................................................................. V
ABSTRACT ................................................................................................................................. VII

CHAPTER 1 ................................................................................................................................... 1
INTRODUCTION - THE QUEST ..................................................................................................... 1
  ORIGIN AND CURRENT STATUS OF THE SCIENTIST-PRACTITIONER MODEL .................. 3
  THE NEED FOR AN INTEGRATION OF PSYCHOTHERAPY AND RELIGIOUS PRACTICE .... 10
    The Psychology of Emotion ................................................................................................. 11
    Emotion and Religion ......................................................................................................... 12
    Emotion and Reason in Adaptation .................................................................................... 12

CHAPTER 2 .................................................................................................................................. 17
FROM BICAMERAL CONSCIOUSNESS AND LINGUISTIC RATIONALITY TO MADNESS 17
  BREAKDOWN OF THE BICAMERAL MIND ........................................................................... 18
  What Consciousness Is Not ................................................................................................. 20
  What Consciousness Is ......................................................................................................... 21
  THE SHIFT FROM ORALITY TO LITERACY ......................................................................... 23
    From Identification with Others to Self Identity ................................................................. 24
    Rational Individual versus Irrational Madness ................................................................. 26
    Individuality, Rationality and Madness in Greek Literature .............................................. 27
  TEXT, RATIONALITY AND MADNESS: MODERN INTERPRETATIONS ............................... 28
    Deconstruction of Text, Rationality and Madness ............................................................. 33
  CONCLUSION ......................................................................................................................... 44

CHAPTER 3 .................................................................................................................................. 47
PSYCHOTHERAPY AS A "SCHIZOID SELF" ............................................................................. 47
  PHILOSOPHICAL ISSUES OF CLINICAL REALITIES IN PSYCHOTHERAPY .................. 48
  METAPHYSICAL PROBLEMS OF PSYCHOTHERAPY ....................................................... 52
    Rationalist - Empiricist Dialectics: Plato to the Present .................................................... 53
  EPISTEMOLOGICAL PROBLEMS IN PSYCHOTHERAPY .................................................. 56
    Confusion between Theory and Method .......................................................................... 57
  MORAL PROBLEMS IN PSYCHOTHERAPY ....................................................................... 63
    Problems with Behavioural and Cognitive-Behavioural Approaches ............................... 70
    Problems with Humanistic-Existential Approaches ......................................................... 71
    Problems with Psychoanalytic Approaches ....................................................................... 73
    Problems with Systems Approaches ................................................................................ 75
    Problems with Biological Approaches ............................................................................. 76
  A BUDDHIST ALTERNATIVE – THERAVADA TREATMENT ................................................ 78

CONCLUSION .......................................................................................................................... 80

CHAPTER 4 .................................................................................................................................. 83
THE BUDDHIST THEORY OF INTERDEPENDENT .................................................................. 83
ARISING AND CONDITIONAL RELATIONS ............................................................................. 83
  THE THEORY OF INTERDEPENDENT ARISING (PATICCASAMUPPADA) ............................... 84
    Interpretations of Interdependent Arising ......................................................................... 85
    Interdependent Arising in Self and Society ..................................................................... 90
  THE THEORY OF CONDITIONAL RELATIONS (PATTIHANA) ............................................... 96
    Root Relations (hetupaccayo) ......................................................................................... 97
    Object Relation (arammanapaccayo) ................................................................................ 98
    Predominance (adhipatipaccayo) ..................................................................................... 99
    Proximity and Contiguity (anantarapaccayo; samanantarapaccayo) ................................. 100
    Co-arising and Co-existence (sahajatipaccayo; annyamannyapaccayo) ......................... 102
    Dependence (nissayapaccayo) ........................................................................................... 103