Port Regulation in Australia

By Joel Meehan

This thesis is presented for the Honours degree of Economics of Murdoch University, 2011.
Abstract

As an island nation, Australia is heavily dependent on its ports. Ports are essential infrastructure, acting as a gateway connecting domestic and international markets. However, the resources boom has highlighted significant bottlenecks in the supply chain. Port regulation has at times been criticised for impeding port development and investment. There are concerns that the level of investment in port infrastructure in Australia is insufficient to sustain the increase in trade we will see in the future. It therefore seems an appropriate time to review port regulation in Australia. This paper seeks to analyse the existing port regulatory framework against a theoretical backdrop. By considering the theories of competition, equilibrium, market failure and regulation, it is hoped an assessment of the current regime can be made.

Front Cover: North Quay at night, Fremantle Port. Source: Fremantle Ports.
Declaration

This thesis contains no material that has been accepted for the award of any other degree at any other University. This thesis is the result of my own research. It contains no material written or published by another person, accept where due reference is given in the text.

Joel Meehan
Acknowledgements

I would firstly like to thank my supervisor, Malcolm Tull for agreeing to supervise my research. Malcolm has always made time for me, despite his busy schedule. I am very grateful to have had a supervisor who shares a similar interest in maritime economics. I have benefitted greatly from Malcolm’s comprehensive knowledge of ports, port regulation and Australian maritime history.

Secondly I would like to thank my family. I truly appreciate the interest they have taken in my Honours studies, and the encouragement they have given me along the way. I am particularly grateful to my Mum, whose dining room table often disappeared under mountains of my books and notes.

Finally I would to thank my girlfriend for her encouragement and understanding over the last year, and also for her help with editing my final draft.
# Table of Contents

1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 1
  1.1 The Role of Ports ........................................................................................................ 1
  1.2 Overview of Australia’s Maritime Industry ............................................................... 3
  1.3 Justification for Research .......................................................................................... 4
  1.4 Outline of Thesis ........................................................................................................ 5

2 Literature Review ........................................................................................................... 8
  2.1 The Competitive Market ............................................................................................ 8
    2.1.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................... 8
    2.1.2 Desirability of the Competitive Outcome ............................................................ 10
    2.1.3 The ‘Classical’ View ............................................................................................. 11
    2.1.4 Partial Equilibrium Analysis ................................................................................. 11
    2.1.5 General Equilibrium Analysis .............................................................................. 13
    2.1.6 Pareto Optimality ................................................................................................ 16
  2.2 Market Failure ............................................................................................................ 21
    2.2.1 The Concept of Market Failure ............................................................................ 21
    2.2.2 Public Goods ......................................................................................................... 23
    2.2.3 Imperfect Competition ......................................................................................... 28
    2.2.4 Natural Monopoly ................................................................................................ 31
    2.2.5 Government Failure .............................................................................................. 34
  2.3 The Potential Role for Government .......................................................................... 35
    2.3.1 Competition Policy ............................................................................................... 36
    2.3.2 Characteristics of Good Regulation ..................................................................... 37
    2.3.3 Price Regulation ................................................................................................... 39
    2.3.4 Criticisms of Regulation Generally ..................................................................... 43
  2.4 Conclusion ................................................................................................................ 44

3 Port Regulation in Australia .......................................................................................... 47
  3.1 Background ............................................................................................................... 47
  3.2 Western Australia ..................................................................................................... 50
  3.3 Northern Territory ................................................................................................... 52
    3.3.1 Price and Access Regulation .............................................................................. 53
  3.4 South Australia ......................................................................................................... 53
    3.4.1 Price Regulation .................................................................................................. 55
    3.4.2 Access Regime ..................................................................................................... 56
  3.5 Victoria ..................................................................................................................... 57
    3.5.1 Price Regulation .................................................................................................. 58
    3.5.2 Access Regime ..................................................................................................... 60
  3.6 Queensland ............................................................................................................... 61
    3.6.1 Price Regulation .................................................................................................. 61
    3.6.2 Access Regime ..................................................................................................... 61
  3.7 New South Wales ...................................................................................................... 63
    3.7.1 Price and Access Regulation .............................................................................. 63
  3.8 Tasmania ................................................................................................................... 64
    3.8.1 Price and Access Regulation .............................................................................. 64
  3.9 Commonwealth ........................................................................................................ 65
    3.9.1 National Access Regime ..................................................................................... 65
    3.9.2 Price Surveillance ............................................................................................... 67
    3.9.3 Anti-Competitive Conduct ................................................................................ 67
  3.10 Summary ................................................................................................................ 67
Table of Diagrams and Tables

Diagram 1: Partial Equilibrium .......................................................... 12
Diagram 2: Production Possibilities Frontier ........................................ 14
Diagram 3: Utility Maximisation .......................................................... 15
Diagram 4: Efficiency in a Single Market ............................................. 16
Diagram 5: Edgeworth Box Diagram - Efficient Consumption ............... 17
Diagram 6: Product Mix Efficiency ....................................................... 19
Diagram 7: Private Provision of Public Goods ...................................... 26
Diagram 8: Efficient Supply of a Public Good ..................................... 27
Diagram 9: Imperfect Competition ...................................................... 29
Diagram 10: Monopoly ...................................................................... 30
Diagram 11: Cost Subadditivity ........................................................... 33
Diagram 12: Natural Monopoly ........................................................... 40
Diagram 13: Flinders Ports Pty Ltd Shareholdings .............................. 73
Diagram 14: Flinders Ports - Throughput (million tonnes) .................. 74
Diagram 15: Movement of Cumulative Average EMS Charges Relative to 2004-05 .. 81
Diagram 16: Crane Rate for Five Ports - Containers per hour ............... 84

Table 1: Summary of Regulatory Frameworks by Jurisdiction ............... 68
Table 2: Flinders Ports Profit ............................................................... 76
Table 3: Flinders Ports Profit per Tonne .............................................. 77
Table 4: Flinders Ports Return on Assets ............................................. 78
Table 5: Flinders Ports Dividend Payout Ratio ..................................... 79
Table 7: Ship Turnaround Times (hours) - Adelaide, Melbourne Fremantle .. 86
Table 8: Quarterly Crane Rates (lifts per hour) - Adelaide, Melbourne, Fremantle .... 86