SATISFACTORY, GOOD AND OUTSTANDING NURSES: PERCEPTIONS OF NURSES, THEIR COLLEAGUES AND PATIENTS

by

Kristina Medigovich

RN, BN (Hons), GradDipEd

This thesis is presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at Murdoch University

February, 2012.
DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis is my own account of my research and contains as its main content work which has not previously been submitted for a degree at any tertiary education institution.

Kristina Medigovich

Signature .............................

Date .................................
ABSTRACT

All nurses must accept responsibility for their own professional competence and performance but it is often the case that there is a large disparity between those nurses who perform very well and those who perform less well. The study was undertaken in response to the paucity of research findings to define what is an outstanding, good and satisfactory nurse, and how these differences in level of performance are enacted in clinical practice. The overall purpose of this study was to explore perceptions of the key attributes and characteristics of outstanding, good and satisfactory nurses practising in acute care clinical settings from the perspective of a number of stakeholders. The study was devised on the premise that this information would provide a significant basis for change in the way nurses are educated and assessed. A qualitative interpretive approach guided the study. Forty-six people were interviewed on their perceptions of the distinction between satisfactory, good, and outstanding nurses. The sample included patients, doctors, nurses, physiotherapists, social workers and occupational therapists, all of whom had recent or current professional contact with registered nurses. Subsequently, participants were again contacted to verify the findings of the first phase of the study.

There were discernable differences in participants’ descriptions of satisfactory, good and outstanding nurses. Five distinct themes emerged in the data analysis regarding outstanding nurses. The major themes were: Sustaining a High Level of Performance, Modelling Exemplary Professional Behaviours, Balancing the Personal and the Professional, Managing Self and Others and Forming Personal and Therapeutic Relationships. ‘Good’ nurses were seen to perform well in the clinical setting with some
reservations. The five themes identified were Reservations about Clinical Competence, Limitations in Communicating, Inconsistencies in Working Collaboratively, Caring Style and Coping. ‘Satisfactory’ nurses were perceived to perform at a basic minimum standard which met patient safety standards. The major themes identified were Primarily Attending to Physical Care, Providing a Minimum Standard of Care, Selective Caring, Lack of Demonstrated Problem Solving Skills and Limited Personal and Interpersonal Capabilities.

This research study provides unique insights into how nurses are perceived by those who interact with them in the acute care clinical setting. The findings present unmistakable evidence that some nurses in clinical practice are outstanding, in particular at the ward/unit level within acute care general and mental health facilities. The outstanding nurses were not only considered high performing nurses, but they were able to facilitate and ensure a high level of performance from other staff members. Their professional behaviours were exemplary. They were also seen as having the ability to balance their personal and professional life so that problems or stressors in their personal life did not ‘leak’ across into their professional life. The outstanding nurses were not only good leaders, they were good managers, managing themselves and others. Prolific comments were forthcoming about how they were able to maintain relationships with others well, and they did so with effective communication strategies.

There was clear evidence that nurses who were perceived to be ‘good’ nurses performed well. At times there were limitations with this group of nurses, with some lacking the detailed specific knowledge and assessment skills of the outstanding nurse
and creating the impression that they were ineffective in some of their actions. However there didn’t seem to be a compromise to patient safety.

Participants believed that when the nursing care provided was mainly physical in nature the nursing care was considered adequate. Satisfactory nurses were considered safe but not holistic in the nursing care they provided. They tended to focus on physical care, with limited attention to the psychosocial aspects of nursing. This left the impression that the satisfactory nurse was task orientated, principally able to follow a plan of care, much like a job list of tasks, which represented a narrow focus of practice. The findings of this study suggest a number of recommendations to enhance nursing education, improve clinical performance in the practice setting and extend nursing knowledge through further research. There is an immediate imperative to address the problem of underperforming nurses in the profession which may include ongoing national dialogue about how to identify students who may underperform in the fully fledged role of a registered nurse.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am sincerely grateful for the support I have received and would like to start by thanking my supervisors Professor Anne McMurray and Professor Bronwyn Jones. Thank you for your unwavering support and guidance and your encouragement. I’d like also to give special thanks to my supervisors for their steadfast patience over this long journey.

The completion of this thesis would not have been possible without the encouragement of a good friends and family who have supported me and my work over the past years.

I’d also like to make mention and offer thanks to the outstanding educators and researchers within Murdoch University’s School of Nursing and Midwifery who helped me with advice and words of encouragement.

Finally, to the participants who took the time to participate in this study and give me some insight into your experiences, thank-you.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TITLE PAGE</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DECLARATION</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF CONTENTS</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER ONE

1

SETTING THE SCENE: THE RESEARCH IN CONTEXT

- Introduction to the Study  
  1
- Background to the Study  
  5
- Significance of the Study  
  6
- Purpose of the Study  
  9
- Research Questions  
  9
- Clarification of Terms  
  10
  - Nurse  
    10
  - The Outstanding Nurse  
    11
  - The Good Nurse  
    11
  - The Satisfactory Nurse  
    11
  - Perceptions  
    12
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction 14
Search Strategy 15
Nursing and Caring 16
Satisfactory, Good and Outstanding Nurses 19
  Descriptions of Good Nurses 19
  Descriptions of Outstanding Nurses 27
  Descriptions of Excellent Nurses 28
Expertise in Nursing 29
Personal Qualities and Characteristics 33
Competence 35
  The Meaning of Competence of Nurses 36
    Behaviourist concept of competence 37
    Generic concept of competence 37
    Integrated or holistic concept of competence 38
  Competence in the Australian Context 39
  Continuing Competence in Nursing 41
  Clinical Competency Education for Nurses 43
Role Performance 45
Beyond Competence 46
### CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY  56

**SECTION ONE – THE RESEARCH PARADIGM**

**Introduction**  56

**Research Paradigm and Philosophical Underpinnings**  58
  **Interpretive Paradigm**  60
    **Interpretation**  60

**Critical Incident and the Everyday**  63

**The ‘Voice’ in This Thesis**  64

**The Interviews**  65

**Rigour in Qualitative Research**  67
  **Trustworthiness**  67
  **Credibility**  68
  **Transferability**  68
  **Dependability and Confirmability**  69
  **Auditability**  69

**Positioning the Researcher**  70

**The Researcher as Instrument of Inquiry**  70
## SECTION TWO – METHODS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Study Settings</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sample</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruiting Participants</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Gathering</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview Process</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Field Notes</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical issues</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Analysis</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant Verification</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demographic Data</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thematic Analysis: Outstanding, Good and Satisfactory</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outstanding Nurses</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme One: Sustaining a High Level of performance</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme Two: Modelling Exemplary Professional Behaviours</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme Three: Balancing the Personal and Professional</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme Four: Managing Self and Others</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme Five: Forming Personal and Therapeutic Relationships</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Outstanding Outlier</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## The Good Nurse

- **Theme One:** Reservations about Clinical Competence  
- **Theme Two:** Limitations in Communicating  
- **Theme Three:** Inconsistencies in Working Collaboratively  
- **Theme Four:** Caring Style  
- **Theme Five:** Coping  

**Exceptions to Descriptions of ‘The Good’ Nurse**  

**The Transitioning Nurse**

## The Satisfactory Nurse

- **Theme One:** Primarily Attending to Physical Care  
- **Theme Two:** Providing a Minimum Standard of Care  
- **Theme Three:** Selective Caring  
- **Theme Four:** Lack of Demonstrated Problem Solving Skills  
- **Theme Five:** Limited Interpersonal Relationship Skills  

**Summary**

## CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION

**THE SEARCH FOR EXCELLENCE**

**Introduction**

**Participants’ Perspectives: Satisfactory, Good and Outstanding Nurses**

- Sustaining a High Level of Performance  
- Modelling Exemplary Professional Behaviours  
- Balancing the Personal and Professional  

**Summary**
LIST OF TABLES

TABLES

Table 4.1 Overall Participant Demographic Information 91
Table 4.2 Practitioner Demographics 92
Table 4.3 Patient Demographics 93
Table 4.4 The Outstanding Nurse Themes 96
Table 4.5 The Good Nurse Themes 132
Table 4.6 The Satisfactory Nurse Themes 145
### LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2.1 Spiral of nursing capabilities development</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>